ISLAMOPHOBIA IN DUBLIN:

EXPERIENCES AND HOW TO RESPOND

Immigrant Council
of Ireland
Independant Law Centre

The Immigrant Council of Ireland was established by Sr. Stanislaus Kennedy in 2001. It is an independent human rights organisation that advocates for the rights of migrants and their families and acts as a catalyst for public debate and policy change. The Immigrant Council of Ireland is also an Independent Law Centre.

The work of the Immigrant Council of Ireland is underpinned by the belief that immigration is a permanent and positive reality in Ireland and that individuals' human rights must be respected, protected and upheld.

About the Author
Dr James Carr, Department of Sociology, University of Limerick
Dr James Carr teaches and researches at the Department of Sociology in the University of Limerick. In 2010 he was awarded a three year scholarship from the Irish Research Council to engage in research into racism directed towards Muslim communities in Ireland. He is a well-known speaker on the topics of Islamophobia and anti-Muslim racism in Ireland. In 2016, James published his book Experiences of Islamophobia: Living with racism in the neoliberal era, London and New York: Routledge which focused on anti-Muslim racism in Ireland set to the international context.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

IMMIGRANT COUNCIL OF IRELAND
Foreword

The Immigrant Council of Ireland is proud to support this research on Islamophobia in Dublin and believes it represents a strong foundation on which future policy and laws can be made.

I should at the outset warn that there are sections of this study which are uncomfortable to read in terms of the experiences of hatred, discrimination and racism. It also does not shy away from difficult and complex questions which must be addressed if we want to be a society based on equality, fairness and justice.

The urgency of the work involved has been further highlighted by the fact that two mosques as well as private properties were subjected to graffiti and bricks through their windows while the research was underway.

The recommendations are wide-ranging and will require change in almost every area of official policy not just for lawmakers, but for schools, employers, An Garda Síochána and many others including civil society organisations such as the Immigrant Council.

Combatting hate crimes and discrimination in terms of access to employment, schools and services is highlighted across the findings and addressing these must be the priority. However change must go beyond legislation and include awareness programmes, training and greater understanding.

Many participants cited a lack of trust in the media and believe coverage of events arising from conflicts like that in Syria is over simplistic creating a perception that being Irish and Muslim are mutually exclusive categories.

Interactions with An Garda Siochana are in need of further focused attention and development, with the need for gaps between the force and Muslim communities to be bridged through community forums and Garda training.

As well as highlighting areas which must be addressed, this report offers hope. It is notable that many different participants referred to Ireland as home – and it is home to 65,000 Muslim men, women and children.

We owe it to them, and to all who believe in the foundation of equality which formed our country to ensure the recommendations are acted upon.

The Immigrant Council of Ireland acknowledges and offers its sincere thanks to Author Dr James Carr, Department of Sociology, University of Limerick, for a report which must form the basis of future policy. We would also like to offer sincere thanks to the Open Society Foundations which provided funding towards this important work.

I also want to acknowledge the work of our Integration Coordinator Teresa Buczkowska in supporting the work, as well as our Integration Outreach Officer Joe O'Brien for his contribution to its completion and launch – but most of all our profound thanks to those members of the Muslim communities who have shared their experiences – it is their voices throughout this document which are the most powerful in calling for change.

Muslim communities are a part of Irish society and make an enormous positive contribution. We all must work together to ensure that Ireland remains a place of welcome and a home for all members of our society.

Brian Killoran
CEO
Immigrant Council of Ireland

Executive Summary

Islamophobia and anti-Muslim racism are established realities in Ireland.[1] Academic research and data provided by non-governmental organisations, continue to evidence the manner in which Muslim men and women experience hostility and discrimination in Ireland.[2] This new research builds on previous work but also asks Muslim communities in Dublin for their perspectives on what activities they perceive are required to challenge anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination. Thus in addition to drawing on personal experiences of anti-Muslim racism, discussions with participants also focussed on: what supports/campaigns people felt were required; how these supports/campaigns should manifest; and importantly, how the Immigrant Council of Ireland and other civil society organisations and partners, can work with Muslim communities to make these supports/campaigns a reality.

The recommendations proffered below are wide ranging and are informed by positive as well as negative experiences. They require concerted efforts if they are to become a reality; civil society organisations, State bodies, academics and individuals from across all Muslim communities must work together to make these happen.

This research is based on extensive fieldwork with Muslim communities in Dublin. Participants gave generously of their time and hospitality. As such, this report deserves to be read in its entirety.

Background to the report

As a pilot project with Muslim communities in Dublin, the first part of this research set out to:

1. Develop our understanding of experiences of anti-Muslim hostility in Dublin.
2. Develop our understanding of experiences of anti-Muslim discrimination in Dublin.

In addition to cataloguing experiences, the core aim of this study was to:

1. Listen to the voices of Muslim individuals and community representatives to identify shared themes of preferred actions and supports in the face of anti-Muslim racism.
2. Identify how the Immigrant Council can work with Muslim communities to effect change at the social and political level.

The research methodology utilised in this report is qualitative. In all, sixty-six Muslim men and women from across Dublin took part in focus group or interview discussions.

Experiences of Hostility

Participants in this study shared some of their experiences of *specifically* anti-Muslim verbal abuse, physical assault, graffiti and damage to property. In terms of abuse, the form of various racist slurs and epithets

directed toward and recalled by participants draws on stereotypes of Muslims that associate Muslim people and Islam with terrorism and the so-called 'war on terror'. Men and women participating in this research recalled experiences of anti-Muslim hostility in the form of physical assault which manifested primarily in public settings - on the street or while the participant was using public transport. Notable again and elaborated below in the report proper, are the references to identifiers of Muslimness as being central to these experiences.

Previous research in the Irish context demonstrates that Muslim women are more than twice as likely to experience anti-Muslim hostility when compared to Muslim men.[3] This study again demonstrates the manner in which the hijab, niqab and other items of female clothing are frequently targeted in experiences of anti-Muslim hostility in Ireland.[4] Contributions from participants in this report further underscore that markers of Muslimness, such as the hijab are deemed incongruent with being Irish, raising important questions in terms of what it means to belong in Ireland in 2016.

During this study, two mosques/prayer rooms were reported as being targeted with graffiti and also with missiles in the form of bricks and stones. Damage to property is by no means limited to those sites that may be associated with Islam such as mosques. Maryam, a participant in this study recalled how she and her family returned to their home to find the door open and substantial damage visited on their property. The motivation, evident in the graffiti, was not theft but an intent to send a message that this Muslim family were not welcome in the locality.

Experiences of Discrimination

Participants in this study reported experiencing discrimination across a range of sectors, including: in and accessing education, using public transport, in and accessing employment, using shops and restaurants.

Education

In regards to education, participants reported experiences of discrimination manifesting in both accessing education and also for pupils already in school at both the primary and secondary level.[5] The current state of Irish Equality legislation allows for educational institutions, primarily those affiliated with a particular faith to refuse entry to those students, who in essence, do not belong to the faith ethos of the institution.[6] The importance of this issue to participants cannot be underestimated. The exclusion of pupils because of their faith or non-faith identity has real implications not only in terms of academic performance and ability to access schools of choice but also, and arguably more importantly, on the social development of young Irish Muslim boys and girls and notions of inclusivity in Irish society.

The same can be said in relation to the leaders in Irish education: teachers. The predominance of the Catholic Church in terms patronage in the Irish education sector makes it difficult for teachers of other faiths or no religion from working in this sector. Section 37(1) of the Irish Employment Equality Acts 1998-2008, amended in 2015 under the Equality (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2015 provides exemptions from legislative protections against discrimination specifically for religious, educational, or medical institutions who aim to provide services in an environment which promotes certain particular religious values.[7] These institutions are provided with exemptions to look more/less favourably on an employee or potential employee on the basis of their (non)religious identity on the basis that it may be reasonable to do so in order to maintain the religious ethos of the institution. Furthermore, such an employer can also take action, deemed reasonably necessary, to prevent an employee or a potential employee, from undermining the religious ethos of the institution in

question.[8] The Equality (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2015 delivers positive change by protecting people against employment discrimination based on their sexual orientation and family status. Potential problems remain though for people of different faiths and none who wish to enter the teaching profession given the Catholic patronage of the majority of primary schools in Ireland.

In the Classroom

Young Muslims participating in this research recalled their experiences of being excluded and indeed abused through discriminatory practices visited upon them by teachers, lecturers and classmates.[9] These manifested as experiences of verbal abuse from classmates and staff; exclusionary practices in relation to the ability of female students to wear the hijab if they so choose; and a failure on the part of staff to address anti-Muslim racism in the classroom context. The policy to not have a policy vis-à-vis the ability for young Muslim women to manifest their faith in the school context allows for exclusionary practices to manifest, leaving young Irish Muslim women feeling stunned, disappointed and frustrated.

Accessing and In Employment

Participants were asked to share their experiences of discrimination in and while accessing employment. A number of issues emerged that centre on religious identity, either in the form of religious dress or through the identification of a person as Muslim on the basis of their name. Research undertaken as part of the Open Society Institute (OSI) series *At Home in Europe* focusing on European Muslim communities makes clear the intersectionality between the religious identity of Muslim women, their gender and the manner in which these interact in experiences of exclusionary practices.[10] As with the OSI study, the hijab appears repeatedly throughout this study as again the focus of employers' discriminatory practices. So too does the issue of having a 'non-Irish' name with participants noting how some change their names to sound more Irish so that they can find employment.

In addition to accessing employment, participants also reported their experiences of discrimination in the workplace. These manifest through comments, sometimes framed as 'innocent questions', as well as discriminatory practices, from managers, colleagues and customers/clients. Faced with such experiences a person can come to expect to receive such abuse on a repeated and regular basis at work. The work space is a site wherein diversity should not only be recognised, but experiences of discrimination, formal or informal, should also be actively challenged and employees afforded safe routes to redress.

Public Transport, Shops and Restaurants

Participants in this research recalled instances of what they felt were discriminatory practices by public transport staff. These took the form of poor or indeed no service provision at all. In addition, participants also recalled their experiences of racial or religious profiling by transport related security staff. The comments in the report proper evidence the frequency of this problem for Muslim communities and highlight the profiling of Irish Muslim men and women here in Ireland and also abroad whilst travelling.

Remaining with the issue of profiling but expanding beyond the domain of public transport; a striking finding in the area of discrimination in this report relates to the treatment of Muslim women and men in the context of shopping. There's a distinct security theme emerging in this study in the manner in which Muslim women, predominantly, are pursued in shops and shopping malls, mainly by security guards but also by shop staff. A similar finding arose in earlier research with Muslim communities in the Irish context.[11] There was a perception among some participants that Muslim and Roma women are singled out because of their 'non-Irish' identity. Profiling a person because they are Muslim, Roma, or on any other basis is unacceptable; such practices are discriminatory.

In terms of restaurants, the experience described by participants below clearly evidences the manner in which Muslim communities, and indeed other minority communities in Ireland are discriminated against when accessing goods and services. A particular incident described in the main report is both shocking in terms of its character; and reassuring in terms of the positive response by the staff and management involved.

An Garda Síochána

There were two elements relating to discriminatory policing practices from the perspectives of participants in this research. The first of these refers to a specific experience of being singled out for attention by a member of An Garda Síochána while others were ignored; the second element relates to a perception among Muslim communities that Gardaí will treat 'their own' (read as White, Irish and Catholic) better than those perceived as 'Other'. Negative interactions with and perceptions of An Garda Síochána such as those reported below erode any trust that may be there among members of Muslim communities in the Irish context; the net effect being that if one experiences anti-Muslim racism they have nowhere to turn for assistance outside of civil society organisations such as the Immigrant Council of Ireland.[12]

Media Discourses and Muslim communities

The issue of the media coverage of, and interaction with, Muslim communities was discussed with participants in this study. While one participant noted that media coverage of issues such as the conflict in Syria and Iraq was problematic due to its simplicity; others identified the media as the main source of, and means, to propagate homogenising, racialised stereotypes of Muslimness which have real effects on the lives of Muslims in Ireland. Unsurprisingly then, feelings of distrust and strong, negative perceptions exist among Muslim communities in Ireland toward most media actors. Not all media actors were perceived in a negative light. Yet there was a shared perception among participants that various media actors have an agenda when it came to Muslim communities: namely to sell copy without due regard for the consequences of their stories.

Ambassadors, Belonging, Identity Crises

Muslim communities, as is outlined throughout this report are homogenised as one single group. Whether manifesting in media reportage or as 'innocent questions in the workplace', individual Muslims are deemed representative of the entire faith of Islam. Despite having no connection to groups such as Daesh,[13] Muslims in Ireland are asked to speak as representatives, ambassadors of the global Ummah.[14] There is a palpable sense of frustration among participants that is rooted in being erroneously held culpable for acts perpetrated by individuals and groups that claim to represent Islam. Being held representative of the Ummah also is matched by the perception that Irishness and Muslimness are mutually exclusive categories.

Participants were asked how they felt in the context of experiences of exclusion, both formal and informal. The findings reveal their feelings vis-à-vis belonging and their fears, especially for younger Irish Muslims in the context of globalised media accessibility. Younger generations of Irish Muslims, born and raised here reported experiences of identity crisis in a number of ways. Feelings of exclusion as iterated by some of these participants were compounded by feelings of confusion in terms of identity. Participants referred on more than one occasion to the term identity crisis. It is important then that various institutions in Irish society - social and political - come to reflect the realities of the diverse society twenty-first century Ireland. Young Irish Muslims need to feel part of Irish society and government must take action to ensure that this is recognised

in policy and practice. This is not about integration on the part of young Muslims. The young men and women in the research *are* integrated; they are born and raised in Ireland and are studying and working across a range of spheres in Irish society. The stigmatisation of young Muslims in Ireland feeds into the narrative propagated by groups such as Daesh who wish to attract people to their cause, any such exposure can be challenged by addressing experiences of anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination.

Dublin – Ireland

Despite the feelings of exclusion and confusion in terms of belonging, participants revealed a deep bond with Ireland and the city of Dublin revealing the complexity of social interaction in this research. All of those who took part in this research live in Dublin and come from across the city and surrounding suburbs. Each of the focus groups and interviews ended with the simple question: what does Dublin mean to you? The word home was repeated by different participants: Ireland *is* home to an estimated sixty-five thousand Muslim men, women and children; this refrain to the word home should not be surprising.

Good Practice

In addition to the negatives, participants also referred to their experiences of good practice in different spheres of social interaction, namely: when accessing employment; in employment; and in education. The examples discussed in this report are united in that there is a recognition of and positive engagement with diversity. This positive engagement manifested in this research through for example the ability to manifest and practice one's faith in a welcoming environment. In each instance, the insights shared by participants provide simple yet incredibly important examples of how employers and educational institutions can create an inclusive environment in the work/education context.

Recommendations – Challenging anti-Muslim racism

As noted above, this research study is premised on four sub-questions; two of which focus on participants' views on responding to anti-Muslim racism and the role that the Immigrant Council can fulfil in this regard. However, the findings revealed in this study demonstrate that the challenge to Islamophobia and anti-Muslim racism in Ireland is greater than any one organisation. While referred at times in this report as an exemplar civil society organisation, the recommendations presented here are not limited to initiatives that the Immigrant Council could take. For the challenge against Islamophobia and anti-Muslim racism to be successful there is a need for a broad range of organisations derived from civil society, the State, academia, Muslim representative groups and individuals to work, whether on their own initiative or as part of a coalition, to make sure that the recommendations presented here become a reality. Indeed, a first step could arguably be the formation of a coalition, derived from the aforementioned list of actors that would work together as a united front against Islamophobia and anti-Muslim racism in Ireland.

In terms of substantive recommendations, participants' suggestions centred on: awareness raising campaigns, advocacy, supports and training that civil society organisations, academic partners and State bodies and Muslim communities could work to develop in order to challenge anti-Muslim racism in Dublin and beyond. These suggestions form the basis for recommendations presented here.

Recommendation 1: Raising awareness

Awareness raising campaigns: Media

- Develop public media campaigns that increase the visibility of Muslim men and women in Ireland – such as those already undertaken with Dublin public transport providers by the Immigrant Council.
- When developing these campaigns the focus should be on the normalcy of being Muslim in Irish society; these campaigns do not have to discuss Islam or even refer explicitly to the religious aspect of those included – for example 'Mohammed, 43, firefighter' as proffered below.
- Relatedly, these campaigns should emphasise the diversity of Muslim identities in Irish society – thus challenging ideas of Muslim homogeneity.
- New campaigns should not necessarily focus on people's experiences of anti-Muslim racism as this sends a message of vulnerability and may increase fear.

Awareness raising campaigns: Events

- Organise social/sporting events – some participants held high praise for initiatives run by Sport Against Racism Ireland and in particular its award winning Hijabs and Hat-tricks campaign.15 Initiatives such as this were perceived as vital in creating a context for positive interaction and shared understanding and should be extended.
- Organise public lectures and seminars with Muslim partners, academics, and/or community based partners and civil society organisations on the topic of Muslim communities in Ireland.

Awareness raising campaigns: Muslim communities and their rights

- Raise awareness among Muslim communities as to where and how people can report experiences of anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination.
- Raise awareness among Muslim communities of their legal rights vis-à-vis anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination.
  - Raising awareness of one's rights may be best facilitated through the medium of coffee mornings and other informal gatherings that are already run regularly by Muslim community groups.

Recommendation 2: Media Training

- Training and support: Media engagement: civil society organisations and academic partners should work with Muslim communities specifically on the subject of media engagement; providing people with the tools and the knowhow of how to respond and engage with media outlets in relation to issues concerning the communities.
- Any training provided should not be restricted to people working in specific centres or mosques but made available to Muslim men and women interested in this area. This would encourage and open access for a wide range of voices to reach media outlets; not the same 'go to' people that are repeatedly contacted by the media for issues relating to Muslim communities.

Recommendation 3: Psycho-social support
- Civil society organisations and partners should engage directly with members of Muslim communities to help identify/provide platforms through which those who are the target of anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination can be supported in dealing with their experiences.
- This will require further research in terms of:
    - Charting in more definitive terms, what kinds of supports are already in operation among Muslim communities.
    - Mapping the possibilities of how this support may manifest, working with Muslim communities.

Recommendation 4: At/accessing employment
- Civil society organisations and partners should engage with an inclusive range of Muslim representative bodies to draft a good practice guide for employers. This should focus on the recognition and facilitation of the needs of Muslim employees set to a legal requirement context.
- An engagement with employers/employer representative bodies should be undertaken to raise awareness of, and, challenge discrimination in the workspace. This may take the form of publicity campaigns or the drafting of employer policy documents/pledges that:
    - Challenge discrimination by staff towards customers and colleagues.
    - Remind employers of their obligations vis-à-vis legislative obligations.
    - Disseminate examples of good practice undertaken by employers in relation to diversity recognition.

Recommendation 5: Media Inclusion
- Established civil society organisations should use their influence and engage with various media actors to encourage a greater recognition of Muslim diversity and lay a challenge down to the production of stereotypes of Muslimness in Irish media. The use of language by media producers must be addressed so that terms such as 'Muslim' and 'Islam' are not further stigmatised in contemporary discourse through their association with particular acts; where people do commit acts 'in the name of Islam,' which does happen, the diversity of Muslim communities and opinions therein must be underscored, not side-lined.
- The RTE documentary, Baz: The Lost Muslim is a good example of how inclusion, and recognition, of diversity can be made manifest in Irish media.[16] However, this is a 'one off'. Inclusion must be mainstreamed so that the diversity of Irish society is reflected as a matter of course in Irish media – reading the news, the weather forecast for example.
- Civil society organisations should advocate for the inclusion of a greater range of Muslim men and women's voices in mainstream domestically produced media content. Civil society organisations such as the Immigrant Council cannot and do not claim to speak for Muslim communities in Ireland but they could act as a conduit for greater inclusion.

Recommendation 6: Inclusive policing
- Trusting relationships need to be built between Muslim communities and An Garda Síochána. Civil society organisations could act as interlocutors, providing a neutral platform from which members

of Muslim communities, representatives and otherwise, can interact with An Garda Síochána and develop trust. Indeed, it cannot be just Muslim community representatives that are involved, they often have good relationships with local Gardaí;[17] the focus should be on engaging the 'average' Muslim man or woman.

- Civil society organisations should explore possibilities of delivering training to the staff of An Garda Síochána on the topics of racial/ethnic/religious profiling; and, in the area of challenging all racisms among Garda staff.

Recommendation 7: Education and the diversity of Muslims and Islam

- As a starting point, civil society organisations and academic partners should undertake a study which maps current interventions in pre/in-service teacher training, focusing particularly on those spaces wherein diversity and all issues relating to Muslim communities and Islam arise. This should engage scholars and service providers 'in the field' to gain an understanding of what is already being done.
- Identify the lacunae that may exist and work with partners to bring about change.
- Similarly, a scoping approach is required in terms of the curriculum and the manner in which Muslim communities and related issues are engaged with in the classroom; again, scholars and practitioners in this area should be recruited for participation.

Recommendation 8: Education and legislation

Three points arise on which the civil society organisations can work with partners to encourage the Government to enact policy and implement legislative change. Discrimination in all its forms must be challenged. The rights of Catholics, Muslims, Hindus, Sikhs, Bahá'is, Protestants, Buddhists, all faiths and none must be protected equally.

- Legislative permission to discriminate on the basis of faith/no-faith must be challenged in the context of school enrolment policies – unequivocally; no potential for exceptions.
- Legislative permission to discriminate in the selection of staff in the educational context must be challenged – as with family status and sexual orientation, people of different faiths and none should have equal opportunities in teacher recruitment.
- The rights of all children and staff to manifest their faith identity must be protected.

Recommendation 9: Hate crime legislation

- Civil society organisations must advocate and actively lobby government and all political parties for the implementation of hate crime legislation.

Recommendation 10: Moving forward together

- New projects, developing from this research or otherwise, that aim to work with Muslim communities need to be inclusive of the diversity of Muslims and Islam in Dublin and Ireland; those affiliated with representative groups and those who are unaffiliated.

Section 1: Introduction, Context, Methods

2015 was a year bookended by horrific terrorist attacks in Paris and punctuated by similar acts in Tunisia and beyond. These attacks were perpetrated by groups who claim to represent Islam and all Muslim communities.[18] 2015 also witnessed the greatest migration of human beings in Europe since the Second World War. This migration of people from Muslim majority societies, a migration that continues at the time of writing, was met in some quarters with a humanitarian outcry and support; in others, the response was a retreat to racist, xenophobic and Islamophobic discourses of an alleged threat to 'Christian Europe.'[19] Research demonstrates that the effect of such events and associated discourses on the average Muslim person is that they 'trigger' increases in Islamophobic discourses and the likelihood of individuals and communities being subjected to anti-Muslim racism.[20] It is poignant then that this report is based on fieldwork undertaken with Muslim communities in Dublin during the summer and early autumn of 2015.

Islamophobia and anti-Muslim racism are established realities in Ireland.[21] Academic research conducted in the Irish context, and data provided by non-governmental organisations, evidence the manner in which Muslim men and women experience hostility and discrimination in Ireland.[22] These include instances of verbal abuse; physical assault; on and offline harassment; damage to property and graffiti; discrimination in and accessing work, schools, public transport; profiling by the police and security officials when travelling to and from the State. In addition to these experiences, anti-Islamic groups have increased in terms of their visibility over the course of 2015. More recently, the European and overtly Islamophobic movement PEGIDA has established an affiliate organisation here in Ireland; making the focus of this research all the more urgent.[23]

Our knowledge of the realities of anti-Muslim racism in Ireland continues to grow; however, we are someway behind in identifying measures and means to effectively respond to this phenomenon. This report, again documents lived anti-Muslim racism, as well as perspectives on belonging, identity, the role of the media and perceived vulnerabilities through the eyes of Irish Muslims. Importantly, this report engages with the issue of how to respond to these issues through the voices of Muslim men and women in Dublin. In particular, this report identifies how the Immigrant Council of Ireland and partners can work with Muslim communities to challenge Islamophobia and anti-Muslim racism. The recommendations proffered later are wide ranging and are informed by positive as well as negative experiences. They require concerted efforts if they are to become a reality; civil society organisations, academics and individuals from across all Muslim communities must work together to make these recommendations reality.

This report is made up of seven substantive sections: sections two and three provide up-to-date insights on experiences of anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination; section four details the impact that these incidents have on the lives of those targeted; section five engages with perspectives on the role of the media, feelings of belonging and perceived vulnerabilities; section six documents instances of good practice by for example employers as recalled by Muslim participants; before concluding, section seven details how Islamophobia and anti-Muslim racism can be challenged through the perspectives of Irish Muslim men and women. The report commences by looking more closely at the context and rationale that underpin this study.

Context and Rationale

Islam and Muslim communities are not new to Ireland. Indeed, the Muslim population is today very well established deriving originally from a small population in the mid-twentieth century to the established communities in Ireland today.[24] Information from the most recent Census in Ireland held in 2011 demonstrates that there are almost fifty-thousand Muslim men and women living in Ireland, although this is perceived as an underestimate with figures believed to be closer to sixty-five thousand.[25] Muslim communities in Ireland are incredibly diverse; derive from over forty different nationalities and a huge range of ethnicities.[26] A range of various religious traditions or aspects of Islam are also represented. Muslim communities in Ireland are predominantly of a Sunni background but there is also a considerable Shi'a community that accounts approximately ten per cent of the total Muslim population and there is also a small Ahmadiyya community.[27]

Various researches have engaged in a range of issues related to Muslim communities, however, until recently, very little was known of Islamophobia or anti-Muslim racism in the Irish context.[28] At the level of the Irish State, those arms of officialdom tasked with capturing data on anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination provided little to no insight at all on this phenomenon in Ireland. In 2008, the National Consultative Committee on Racism and Interculturalism (NCCRI), then the only source of data on racism in Ireland was closed due to a reduction in state funding; an early victim of government imposed 'austerity measures'.[29] In the aftermath, non-governmental organisations such as the Immigrant Council of Ireland among others, recognising the need for data on all forms of racism responded by establishing their own racism reporting mechanisms.[30] These initiatives have allowed for insights on the experiences of anti-Muslim racism in Ireland to emerge that would otherwise be lost. In addition to the work of civil society organisations, extensive academic research undertaken on the topic of anti-Muslim racism in Ireland has also established that this phenomenon is alive and well in the Irish context.[31]

Recently published research that was conducted with almost three-hundred and fifty Muslim men and women from across fourteen towns and cities in Ireland provided heretofore absent insights and understandings of anti-Muslim racism in the Irish context.[32] One in three participants in that study stated that they had experienced hostility; a similar figure indicated that they were discriminated against when accessing goods and services. Participants were clear that they felt they were targeted on the basis of their Muslim identity, with the hijab or traditional 'Islamic' dress for men central to experiences. As with other international studies, differences emerged in the propensity of Muslim women to experience anti-Muslim racism when compared to their male co-religionists.[33] In both areas of hostility and discrimination, Muslim women reported experiencing anti-Muslim racism at a rate of over one and a half times that of Muslim men.[34] In terms of manifestation, anti-Muslim hostility predominantly took the form of verbal abuse; however, participants also reported disturbingly violent experiences of physical assault visited upon both Muslim men and women on the street and using public transport.[35] Participants reported discriminatory practices when: accessing/in employment with markers of Muslimness such as the hijab again identified as important in this regard; accessing education with participants reporting difficulties in enrolling their children in local schools; accessing goods and services including accommodation, shops, restaurants, and public transport.

The new research findings presented below, undertaken on behalf of the Immigrant Council of Ireland, and supported by the Open Society Foundations are a logical extension of previous research on anti-Muslim racism

in Ireland. A number of important civil society initiatives are already underway in Ireland, working with and offering supports to those communities targeted for racism.[36] This current research is particularly important in that it specifically asks Muslim communities in Dublin for their perspectives on what they perceive is required to challenge anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination; drawing on their experiences in terms of supports; how these supports should manifest; and importantly, how the Immigrant Council of Ireland can provide them with the support they need.

There have been a number of worrying developments in Ireland across 2015 in terms of anti-Muslim campaigns. Groups such as 'Anti-Islam' or 'PEGIDA Ireland', associates and affiliates have organised protests against the alleged 'Islamification' of Ireland. These protests have taken place in various locations in Ireland including Dublin, Killarney and Waterford – the latter being cancelled.[37] A campaign was also undertaken to protest against the construction of a purpose built mosque in Tralee, Co. Kerry.[38] In addition to these very public protests, an intimidating Britain First style 'mosque invasion' also took place in Kilkenny with a small number of individuals arriving unannounced and subsequently interrogating a local imam. The questions put to the imam matched those stereotypical anti-Muslim themed tropes of the alleged 'threat' posed by Islam to Ireland and the purported incompatibility of the faith to the country.[39]

Accounts of individual Muslim men and women experiencing anti-Muslim hostility have continued to emerge. In September 2015, a Saudi Arabian postgraduate student in Trinity College Dublin was assaulted when using public transport by a man who confronted her with the statement 'Allahu Akbar' and then proceeded to physically assault her.[40] In December 2015, an incident occurred in Dublin that again demonstrates the manner in which Muslim men and women in Ireland can and do experience discrimination in the workplace. In this incident, a patient in a Dublin hospital refused treatment from two consultants because they were Muslim. The consultant who initially arrived to assist the patient was a Muslim woman wearing the headscarf. The second consultant was a Muslim man. The incident came to light via a social media post by the patient's daughter which noted how her mother insisted on being treated by a non-Muslim physician.[41] The original social media post was made in the closed Facebook group of 'Anti-Islam Ireland'.[42]

As noted above, the European Network Against Racism (Ireland) operates an online reporting mechanism. This online reporting system collates data on reports submitted to it from a range of individuals and civil society organisations such as the Immigrant Council of Ireland.[43] In 2013 reports to ENAR Ireland documented the physical assault of a Muslim man in Limerick by a group of males who threw beer bottles at him while verbally abusing him with both racial and anti-Muslim epithets; that same report documented how some Muslim people in Cork were set upon by a group of males armed with sticks who travelled with the intention of assaulting them. In addition to these examples of physical assault, Muslim men and women also reported being spat at.[44] The identifiability of Muslim women again featured in Cork, Dublin and Limerick reporting instances of verbal abuse and physical assault while another reported a case of institutional racism at the hands of a public sector worker who would not engage with the Muslim woman unless she removed her 'veil'.[45] Subsequent iReport publications have continued to document instances of physical assaults and verbal abuse online and in person, at times from neighbours. A particularly disturbing report catalogued how a 10 year old Muslim girl was "pushed, shoved and hit" by a gang of youths at a playground.[46]

Before moving to briefly outline the methods utilised in this study, it is worth defining anti-Muslim racism in order for readers to understand the perspective that this research is based upon. Anti-Muslim racism is informed by Islamophobic "racialising 'truths'" that construct Muslim communities as a homogenous 'Other' to a similarly and mistakenly homogenised 'Western' us.[47] These constructions:

> ...operate on signifiers of Muslimness, at times intersecting with 'race' and gender inter alia, Muslim individuals and communities are subjected to exclusionary practices resultant of a specifically anti-Muslim racism, manifesting as discriminatory practices in accessing goods, employment and services; and or acts of hostility be they verbal physical and/or emotional.[48]

As will be demonstrated later, the experiences of participants clearly evidence the impact of these racialising 'truths' in their daily lives.

Methodology

As a pilot project with Muslim communities in Dublin, the first part of this research set out to:

1. Develop our understanding of experiences of anti-Muslim hostility in Dublin.
2. Develop our understanding of experiences of anti-Muslim discrimination in Dublin.

In addition to cataloguing experiences, the core aim of this study was to:

1. Listen to the voices of Muslim individuals and community representatives to identify shared themes of preferred actions and supports in the face of anti-Muslim racism.
2. Identify how the Immigrant Council can work with Muslim communities to effect change at the social and political level.

A qualitative research methodology was employed in this study in order to gain an understanding of the experiences and perspectives of the Muslim men and women who took part;[49] in this study through the use of focus groups and one-to-one semi-structured interviews. Semi-structured interviews have been described as "a conversation with a purpose" to gain an understanding of the topic at hand.[50] Four one-to-one interviews were undertaken in this pilot study with both Muslim men (2) and women (2); these lasted from forty-five minutes to just over an hour. Focus groups formed the main research tool, allowing the study to engage with a diverse range of voices and perspectives. In all fifteen focus groups were undertaken. The group format is particularly helpful in that the input of one participant can stimulate discussion among the group.[51] The numbers participating in focus group discussions ranged from three to ten; some were comprised of men and women, some of either men or women alone. Discussions lasted between one to two hours and were moderated by the researcher.[52]

Sampling

The sampling strategy used here ensured that the participants who took part in this study reflected this diversity of Muslim communities in Dublin while also aligning with the qualitative research methods discussed above. A purposive sampling strategy was utilised to ensure that participants from different ethno-national groups, genders, ages, aspects of Islam, locations across Dublin, among others took part in this research.[53] Commencing in June of 2015, participants were sought from among key individuals known to the researcher; Islamic women's groups, Islamic student societies, and various mosques and cultural centres, as well as people unaffiliated with any Muslim community organisation. The fieldwork finished in early September. In all sixty-six Muslim men and women took part in the study, split evenly on the basis of gender. Participants derived from a range of ethno-nationalities including: Irish-American, Iranian-Irish, Malaysian, British, Pakistani, Dutch, Albanian, Nigerian, Nigerian-Irish, Mauritian, Somali, Danish, Congolese to name but a small selection. In terms of age, participants were all aged over eighteen years. While the vast majority of participants were aged in the 18-24, 25-34 and 35-44 age groups; the oldest participant was in the 76+ age category.[54]

Section 2: Experiences of anti-Muslim Hostility

In the course of interviews and discussions participants were asked to share their experiences of anti-Muslim hostility in the Irish, and in particular in the Dublin context.[55] Hostility was defined for participants as including any incidents such as physical assault, verbal abuse, damage to property, graffiti, threats or harassment or theft. At all times it was stressed to participants to focus on those incidents where their Muslim identity was being targeted as opposed to skin colour for example. This is not to deny the intersectionality of identities, wherein one's skin colour and religious identification intersect in their experiences of exclusionary practices.[56] Indeed, the voices of the participants often raised the spectre of different forms of racism manifesting together in anti-Muslim hostility as will be demonstrated. It is worth noting that, as it currently stands there is no specific legislation for hate crime in the Irish context.[57] The names used throughout this report are pseudonyms and therefore not the real names of those who took part.

Verbal abuse

Extant research demonstrates that verbal abuse is often the most prominent form of hostility meted out to racialised communities.[58] Muslim participants in this study also shared some of their experiences of *specifically* anti-Muslim verbal abuse. The form of various racist slurs and epithets directed toward and recalled by participants draw on stereotypes of Muslims, that associate Muslim people and Islam with terrorism and the so-called 'war on terror'. The pervasiveness of these stereotypical tropes of Muslimness is made clear when we consider the wide range of different national contexts in which these abusive terms manifest.[59]

> *Yes... of course, for the vast majority the experience has been very positive in Ireland but some of things I've experienced is name-calling... ah Osama bin Laden, or somebody says go back to your country...* [Salah]

> *'Jihad, jihad'... or 'bomb', I'd say that's the main thing...* [Mohammed]

Nahla, referring to her daughter's experience:

> *...am she was playing with her friends outside football and the boy came, and he told them: 'oh look ugly girls, why didn't go back to their f-word countries, you're very, very terrorism; you are very ugly, you are blah blah blah;' and he's twelve he's only twelve years of age! Where he get that thnking about terrorism or ugly or bad words you know????*

> *'Who are you? Are you bin Laden's wife?'* [Mary]

> *I've been cursed at by elderly women in a shopping centre I was walking and she said 'how the xxxx do you see?' I'm not gonna repeat what she said...* [Amanda, wears the niqab]

> *...'go back to your country, you're not allowed to be here, you're not allowed to wear [hijab], go to your country and wear it' ... Then two days later, I went to Lidl with my sister... [a woman] was in the car and she let her children open the window and they keep shouting 'terrorists' she let them call us terrorists to my sister. Imagine if you have a child would you let your child do that?* [Amaal]

It is interesting to note the role of gender in these comments with Muslim women being referred to as 'bin Laden's wife', resonating again with previous national and international research.[60] As discussed further below Islamophobic discourses construct all Muslim women as lacking in intellect and agency, oppressed passive victims of misogynistic practices that are deemed inherent to Islam.[61] Evidence demonstrates that Muslim women also experience higher rates of anti-Muslim hostility than men, one reason for this being that they are often more readily identifiable as Muslim than men as one participant noted:[62]

> Because of the hijab, they see it straight away. The men, they don't know whether [he's] Muslim or not. For the woman because of the hijab [Madiha]

Some participants recalled experiences wherein they felt singled out in shopping malls and car parks on the basis of their Muslim identity. This manifested in one instant wherein a shopper intentionally and repeatedly obstructed a white Arabic female Muslim participant when she was in a clothes store – when they met later in the lift, the shopper snapped at the Muslim woman "you never give way to others". Three participants noted hostile experiences in carparks. In two different incidents, although about to pull out and drive off, shoppers were reluctant to leave their parking space free for female Muslim participants; as soon as the Muslim women moved to find an alternative space the shoppers drove out. Given the silence in these incidents it has to be acknowledged that there may not be an anti-Muslim element involved, although participants felt that there may be, hence their inclusion. However, these incidents do alert us to the possibility that apart from verbal abuse and physical assaults discussed here, Muslim men and women may be subject to a silent intimidation on the basis of being identified as Muslim. If these incidents are more 'innocent' than they may seem, the perceptions of the Muslim women involved arguably reflect the fact that, given past experiences as one participant put it: "sometimes, you can almost be ready for battle" when leaving home. When probed further as to why one would be 'ready for battle':

> I don't know it's just, I, when you go out on the street, especially when I was younger wearing the hijab and you've got kind of groups of boys; it's like you were saying you don't look at them you kind of just look away and they'd say something to you so when you go out and you see kind of like people ok, yeah they're going to say something to me right get ready for it...[Aisha]

At times experiences of verbal abuse can occur in a highly offensive and intimidating context, blurring the lines between 'simple' verbal abuse and physical assault.

> ...the roundabout over X Shopping centre, I was walking over there with my friends... a girl and boy, around their 20s you know they are not like teenage, I was... walking with my friend and they come down and... they do something disgusting: he took something from his nose and threw [it] on me, my friend yeah, and he [said]... 'oh look Muslim people are you hungry... you can eat that?'... [Nahla]

One female participant, Maryam, video recorded her experience while in the company of a friend, Mona, which commenced as verbal abuse but soon escalated into a physical assault outside a fast-food restaurant in South Dublin. It is clear to see the effect of international discourses that associate Muslimness with

terrorism and groups such as Daesh. The young woman who shared this video with the researcher was very shaken in the aftermath. The following text is taken from a transcription of the video footage; the assailants are identified here on the basis of the colour of their clothes:

> *Blue: Blowing away innocent people the other day yeah, you bin Laden bastards...*
> *Grey: Laughs...*
> *Blue (giving finger, now closer to the car): Fuck you...*
> *Mona: Laughs...*
> *Blue: Yeah, bin Laden cunts, blow up into your suicide (gestures vest) Allah Allah Allah Allah Allah... (Looking directly at the car and the person recording; giving the finger again) yeah fuck you, yeah...*
> *Grey: Laughs...*
> *Baby Blue (won't look at camera): I'm a Muslim...*
> *Blue: (holding can of beer in his hand) Allah!!*
> *Baby Blue (won't look at camera): Fuck Allah... all that bollocks is a load of shite...*
> *Blue: Allah's god? fuck the god...*
> *Baby Blue: ...ISIS is shite...*
> *Blue: Fuck off... You don't go nowhere no and ye blow each other up*
> *Baby Blue: Fuck ISIS, ISIS come to me, yeah come to me I'll blow your family up mister...*
> *Blue: Yeah, fuck the ISIS too, stop the... and tell her stop recording; stop recording (pointing directly at the sister recording)... I'm telling you now, tell her stop recording (walks towards the car with can of beer visible in hand) tell her stop recording me...*
> *[sound of window being pulled up electronically]*
> *Blue: (now right beside the car and Maryam, bangs on the car and his tone increase in levels of aggression) tell her stop recording me... [video ends]*

Before moving to discuss physical assaults it is important to recognise the threat of online abuse. Various reports emanating from the iReport mechanism discussed above have noted the realities of online abuse and harassment. The participants in this research did not raise this as a particularly troublesome area. However, there is need for deeper research on this issue if an understanding reflective of this phenomenon in the Irish context is to be gained. Aleena's experience provides a brief glimpse into the area of online harassment, targeted because of her name:

> *...assuming that I'm Muslim, assuming that I agree with Shari'ah and assuming that I wanted to bring Shari'ah to Ireland. Which is just kind of hilarious (laughter)... and then... lots of posts of me saying I support non—western cultures and ideologies and you know... and... other blogs that people were calling me all kinds of names... Like all these things that they decided I believed in and was based on my name.*

Physical Assault
Men and women participating in this research recalled their experiences of anti-Muslim hostility in the form

of physical assault. These happened primarily in public settings, on the street or while the participant was using public transport. Notable again are the references to identifiers of Muslimness as being central to these experiences. In what follows, both Muslim men and Muslim women recall physical assaults visited upon them in Dublin.

> *...the worst experience I ever had... I was walking down Abbey Street to get the Luas... I had ear phones in at the time so I couldn't hear anything like... and then next of all, for some reason, I stopped on my way. Do you know when you just feel... like a sixth sense you feel like something is wrong?? I stopped, and I pulled my earphones out 'cos I thought someone was talking to me and I turned around and there's a guy across the road, and he's obviously drunk, but he was like "go back to your own country!! You Muzzie!!" He flung his bottle at me, the glass bottle, and it just smashed next to me like... Thank God I wasn't ahead 'cos it would have hit me like but it smashed in front of me and I just kind of looked at him... I was so confused...* [Rabia]

> *...the first time was... immediately after the September 11 attack... I was in a car with other brothers, friends, so one of them, the one who was driving, [has] long beard, he was originally from Algeria, and there were a group of youngsters aged between 18 and 20s and once they saw him on the front seat they shout 'terrorist!!' and they come bang the car, smash the front screen and they run away* [Hakim]

> *There was an incident where I was clearly attacked. I was with friend of mine on public transport. Basically, at the time when Bin Laden was killed they just basically attacked us for being Muslim and for wearing scarf... We were in hospital, myself and my friend that day [as a result of the assault]. I was there till about 4 am and my friend was there overnight because she had to be monitored, because she was really hurt, her head and stuff so they were kind of worried that there is some leakage or whatever on her brain or liquid... [the perpetrators] did say like, 'are you upset because Bin Laden died? Was he your dad? Stuff like that. So it was, you know, clearly because who we were you know, and when they were actually giving abuse they were saying 'I'll rip this thing off your head' and stuff like that.* [Fatima]

> *...I've have friends... who have actually been physically attacked during Ramadan... they've been singled out and it's during Ramadan when people go to the early prayers in the morning. So when they start fasting in the morning and they pray their dawn prayers and they're on the way home. I know it happened to four or five different people and it was all in the South Circular Road region. So people were saying it's a certain group of people targeting Muslims... All their shouting... obscene things, was all anti-Islam and it was physical as well...* [Marouane]

The experiences shared by these three participants resonate with examples from international research and evidence the manner in which anti-Muslim hostility can manifest in terms of physical assault.[63] Rabia demonstrates the manner in which xenophobic discourses of 'go back to your own country' meld with those

of 'Muzzie' which clearly targets her Muslimness. At this point it is useful to note that Rabia is an Irish citizen, born and raised. It is also interesting to see the impact of international incidents such as the death of bin Laden or 9/11 and the effect these events have on ordinary Muslim men and women. In the examples provided above, the recourse to such events is used almost as a basis for justifying the hostility; that all Muslims are somehow responsible for the acts of the vanishingly small few and are thus legitimate targets. Other international events that participants discussed as having direct impact on their lives in Dublin included the attacks on the offices of Charlie Hebdo and the hypermarket; the attack at a beach resort in Tunisia wherein three Irish nationals were among those murdered; and the atrocities carried out by Daesh aka ISIS in Syria, Iraq and beyond.[64] Research in the UK context has noted the relationship between what are referred to as 'trigger' events, such as the aforementioned attacks in Paris and Tunisia and experiences of anti-Muslim hostility. Indeed, such 'trigger' events may lead to amplification in anti-Muslim hostility as has been noted in the aftermath of the murder of Drummer Lee Rigby in Woolwich in 2013.[65] Similar patterns may also hold in Ireland.

Previous research in the Irish context demonstrates that Muslim women are more than twice as likely to experience anti-Muslim hostility when compared to Muslim men. This is based on the greater levels of visibility and recognition of Muslim women as *Muslim*, when compared to their male co-religionists.[66] The hijab, niqab and other items of female clothing are loaded with racialised meaning as signifiers of the assumed position of Muslim women in society as passive and oppressed, as well as markers of non-Irishness.[67] These items of clothing are frequently targeted in experiences as was the case for Fatima above and as is made further clear by Rabia, Sadia and Ameena in the park, on the bus, or in a shopping centre.

> *Myself and [my sister] were sitting in the St Stephen's Green Park one day... we were sitting on a bench... this group of kids were looking at us from afar and they kept pointing at us and laughing... and they came over... they started like coming over to us, to our faces... and then [one of them] starts pulling at her scarf...* [Rabia]

> *My friend...her daughter [teenager], they tear her hijab on the bus... some boys, the girls crying and she phoned, she said I don't want to wear hijab again...* [Sadia]

> *In Tallaght Square, some teenager pull my scarf... they are some teenager...* [Ameena]

It was evident then that over the course of the discussion groups and interviews undertaken with the participants, Muslim women were particularly targeted for anti-Muslim hostility. This is corroborated not only by previous research, as noted, but also by the contributions of male participants in this study such as Karim who noted: "Muslim women are more likely to be attacked because they are recognised as Muslims because… they wear the hijab"; and Faisal who stated that: "it's very easy for women to be attacked as Muslims". Interestingly, a number of female participants were also referred to as 'Paki' in this instance, as in others as a marker of Muslim 'Otherness'. This was the case regardless of one's ethno-national background or skin colour.[68] For the Muslim women participating in this study, their being associated with this term was down to the fact that they wore the hijab; an item of clothing, along with the niqab for example, which is considered as not really Irish and not really white.

Maria: On the bus they [a group of males] started making funny noises that I was from Pakistan...
JC: What sort of stuff did they say?
Maria: Really horrible things... the actual words I can't remember but the word that they were going was terrorists at the same time they were kind of slagging me in a funny way... they thought it was hilarious... like they made references that I was from Pakistan and I just thought, I'm the whitest person on the bus you know so... I'm clearly Irish it's this (hijab), it's the religion.

Markers of Muslimness, as this example makes evident are deemed incongruent with being Irish, with belonging in Ireland. This raises an important point for discussion later: how do we challenge those perceptions of Irishness that operate along predefined and static ideas of what it means to belong in twenty-first century Ireland? The levels of violence, aggression and intimidation demonstrated in the examples thus far also underscore the need for the creation and implementation of resources that can provide support to Muslim men and women, Irish or otherwise, who experience anti-Muslim hostility. At time of writing, the Irish State does not provide specific supports to cater for the emotional and psychological well-being of people who have been the target of racism or hate crime in all its forms. As the section further below demonstrates, the effects of such experiences can have a profound impact on those involved.

Graffiti and Damage to Property

During this study, two mosques/prayer rooms were reported as being targeted with graffiti and also with missiles in the form of bricks and stones.[69] The intent with the graffiti is clear, sending the 'message': that Muslims are not welcome in the area.[70] In relation to the use of missiles, the fact that the imam lived on the property in the first instance raises the possibility of attacks such as this leading to serious injury as being a real concern. The second incident below, recalled by Talhan happened in a town outside of Dublin, but also demonstrates the damage that can manifest in such attacks. It is worth pointing out that this was not the only incident visited on this particular mosque.

Somebody wrote outside when we started the mosque in 2004 in X SUBURB... somebody wrote outside 'no Muslims' this is in 2004; the other experience we had also was somebody threw a brick at the mosque, at the place where I used to live at that time... so the window got smashed as well... [Salah]

It was local prayer area and I think they were the kids like teenagers and they were like breaking the door... of the masjid... at night time they're passing and throwing stones and breaking the doors and that was the only incident... it was just at night time... they pick up the bricks and all the front of it was damaged and we have to replace. [Talhan]

Damage to property is by no means limited to those sites that may be associated with Islam such as mosques or smaller prayer rooms. Maryam and her family returned to their home to find the door open and substantial damage visited on their property. The motivation was not theft but to again send the message that this Muslim family were not welcome in the locality.

> *The graffiti thing… we were out, we came home and our door was broken. Did something get robbed? No. The house was thrashed with graffiti 'go out'… 'get out, and terrorist'… [scrawled along the walls of] the hall…* [Maryam]

The intent in these attacks on individuals, whether in cases of verbal abuse or physical assault; be it damage to property, graffiti or otherwise is evident. The physical damage is obvious; below, the emotional impact of events such as these will be looked at through the words of participants.

Insights on Perpetrators

One of the core aims of this research is to add to the evidence base of anti-Muslim hostility in the Irish context. Discussions with participants of their experiences of hostility demonstrated that anti-Muslim hostility is not the domain of any one group in Irish society. Building on previous research, findings presented here reveal a diverse range of perpetrators visiting hostility on Muslim communities in Ireland – because they are Muslim. The following selection of quotes focuses on references to perpetrators of anti-Muslim hostility to provide a window on who is doing the hate. Perpetrators derive from a diverse range of age, gender and perceived of socio-economic class backgrounds.

> *…These were teenagers they were the same teenagers that actually did that graffiti, they are the same teenagers that used to call names as well.* [Salah]

> *…Some teenager pull my scarf…* [Ameena]

> *…A girl and boy around their 20s you know, they are not like teenage. I was walk[ing] back home, walking with my friend and they come down and… they do something disgusting…* [Nahla]

> *…he told them 'oh look ugly girls, why didn't go back to their f-word countries, you're very very terrorism, you are very ugly, you are blah blah blah' and he's twelve, he's only twelve years of age…* [Nahla]

> *…they were the kids like teenagers and they were like breaking the door… of the masjid…* [Talhan]

> *…you don't just get it from the lower socio-economic groups…* [Mary]

> *…yeah, really shocked, she was about 80 and she was quite refined… she turned around and she figured out where I was from and she was 'oh… you're from Ireland'* [Mary]

> *You do get older individuals as well as younger making racist comments…* [Rabia]

The above selection of quotes demonstrates that anti-Muslim hostility and indeed racism in a broader sense is not a problem of any single social group but an issue for all in society. Anti-Muslim sentiment, spans across all groups in society, as with other forms of racism, and needs to be confronted head on. A first step could lie in education and the challenging of the propagation of anti-Muslim stereotypes so pervasive in contemporary media discourses.

Section 3: Experiences of anti-Muslim Discrimination

Research on experiences of anti-Muslim discrimination, as with anti-Muslim hostility in Ireland is in its early stages. Previous studies provide rich insights into the experiences of discrimination as lived by Muslim men and women in the Irish context.[71] As with experiences of hostility, anti-Muslim discrimination is nuanced by gender, especially in contexts wherein the physical, visible manifestations of Muslimness inform discriminatory practices. These differences in gender do tend to dissipate where one's identifiability as Muslim is evidenced through for example their name on a job application or curriculum vitae.[72] Participants in this study reported experiencing discrimination across a range of sectors, including: in and accessing education, using public transport, in and accessing employment, using shops and restaurants.

Education
Admission policies and enrolment
Participants reported experiences of discrimination in the education context, manifesting in both accessing education and also for pupils already in school at both the primary and secondary level.[73] The current state of Irish equality legislation allows for educational institutions, primarily those affiliated with a particular faith to refuse entry to those students, who in essence, do not belong to the faith ethos of the institution.[74] The legislative position in terms of admission policies in educational establishments as stated in the Equal Status Acts is:

Section 7(2) "An educational establishment shall not discriminate in relation to—

(a) the admission or the terms or conditions of admission of a person as a student to the establishment,

However, Section 7(3) stipulates that:

"An educational establishment does not discriminate under subsection (2) by reason only that—

Of particular interest for current purposes, subsection (c)

(c) where the establishment is a school providing primary or post-primary education to students and the objective of the school is to provide education in an environment which promotes certain religious values, it admits persons of a particular religious denomination in preference to others or it refuses to admit as a student a person who is not of that denomination and, in the case of a refusal, it is proved that the refusal is essential to maintain the ethos of the school..."[75]

Debates about this issue are not new.[76] Indeed, legislative change seemed to be forthcoming in this area in the form of the Education (Admission to Schools) 2015.[77] However, this legislation has yet to be enacted and in itself it remains problematic.

Section 61.1(e) of the proposed new legislation states that school admission policies will not discriminate against potential students including on "the religion ground of the student or the applicant in respect of the student concerned." However, a clause remains wherein the issue of ethos *could* be used to discriminate in terms of student admissions.

61.2(b) a school to which section 7(3)(c) of the Act of 2000 applies, whose objective is to provide education

in an environment which promotes certain religious values, the admission statement of the school shall include a statement that the school does not discriminate in relation to the admission of students where it admits persons of a particular religious denomination in preference to others or it refuses to admit as a student a person who is not of that denomination and, in the case of a refusal, it is proved that the refusal is essential to maintain the ethos of the school.

Thus this legislative change may mean little in terms of changes in practice provided schools 'prove' that the refusal is essential to maintain its ethos as has been the position up to now.[78] For current purposes, it is worth recalling that the over ninety per cent of primary schools in Ireland remain under the patronage of the Catholic Church, as well as over fifty per cent of second level institutions.[79]

The following quotes from participants' contributions demonstrate their experiences of trying to enrol their children in schools. For the participants, the main site of discrimination vis-à-vis access is that of secondary education. The interaction between Zara and Nahla is telling:

> *Zara: …at this time the biggest problem is secondary schools, the good secondary schools don't accept Muslim kids. When you negotiate about that they say it's our policy… I was shocked… I mean, if you are a feeder school for my [son's] primary school and all his friends are going to this school… you cannot exclude one kid out of all of them because he's Muslim. It's awful…*
> *JC: Did you find any issues with your daughter now, in secondary school?*
> *Nahla: In X SCHOOL they told me just that they accept five [Muslim] girls, that was three or two years ago, but now, I don't know…*
> *Zara: Five girls out of the big community, and usually in X SCHOOL for years the [governors] were Muslims. If the kids [have] the good record for school they should [be] accepted…*

Zara continues, underlining the point of the need for inclusion which will be discussed further below.

> *…Some schools… I mean it could be that some schools that maybe the priority is for Catholic, and maybe they are the majority, ok, whatever. But they don't accept any Muslim kid in South Dublin, that is a racism you cannot describe it other how. Like, if I know some of my [Muslim] friends in the school and my son wasn't accepted I will then say, ok, but no one Muslim that's what they said. C'mon like! It means excluding, they are excluding…and then all the teenagers here know that they are not accepted because they are Muslims…*

The importance of this issue to participants, particularly those parents cannot be underestimated; the issue of exclusionary school enrolment policies arose time and again. For Mary, a white Irish convert/revert to Islam, with a neutral Irish accent, the issue of exclusion from secondary schools for her children was not immediately apparent:

Mary: We moved to Dublin, straight away they couldn't get into the secondary school and I had to put them in private school...

JC: And why could they not get into the secondary school?

Mary: Because they weren't Catholic...

JC: Was that communicated to you?

Mary: We have to take our own first, and am that was actually from a person who is the sister of a vice president of a secondary school... initially she said 'oh you can put the boys down for that school' and said 'I'd have a word with my brother, he's the vice-president or the vice-principal there' and it was a good school and whatever. [Later] I rang up, [they said] 'yeah that's great, no problem'...

JC: Would you have been within the catchment?

Mary: Yes... Oh yeah, yeah, yeah and kids from the primary [school] were going into... it was like a feeder... And so then they said... 'we'll send you out a form and fill it out'. So verbally I was accepted on the phone by the secretary and the principal and when I filled out the form and sent it back in I got a letter within a week, 'sorry we don't have any places and we will not have any places until 2015'...

JC: So they were aware of your Muslim identity from the start?

Mary: No, [only] from the form.

This has real implications not only in terms of academic performance and ability to access schools of choice but also, and arguably more importantly, on the social development of young Irish Muslim boys and girls. Zara's experience above, wherein her son had to go to an alternative school to that of his immediate friends will not only result in unnecessary stress on him as an individual but also raises questions for him in terms of his sense of belonging in Irish society. Moreover, if non-Muslim students are in an environment where young Irish Muslims are de facto not allowed to participate then opportunities for social interaction, inclusion and integration are lost.

The same can be said in relation to the leaders in Irish education: teachers. Although only raised once in the context of this research, the predominance of the Catholic Church in terms of patronage in the Irish education sector, as noted above, makes it difficult for teachers of other faiths or no religion from working in this sector at primary and secondary levels. Section 37(1) of the Irish Employment Equality Acts 1998-2008, amended in 2015 under the Equality (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2015,[80] provides exemptions from legislative protections against discrimination specifically for religious, educational, or medical institutions which aim to provide services in an environment which promotes certain particular religious values. On this basis these institutions are provided with exemptions to look more favourably on an employee or potential employee on the basis of their (non)religious identity; again, on the basis that it may be reasonable to do so in order to maintain the religious ethos of the institution. Furthermore, such an employer can also take action, deemed reasonably necessary, to prevent an employee or a potential employee, from undermining the religious ethos of the institution in question.[81] The Equality (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2015 delivers positive change by protecting people against employment discrimination based on their sexual orientation and family status. Potential problems remain though for people of different faiths and none who wish to

enter the teaching profession given the Catholic patronage of the majority of primary schools in Ireland. The issue of religious instruction in the primary context is also problematic given the aforementioned patronage status.[82]

The experiences of young Muslims in the education system

Young Muslims participating in this research recalled their experiences of being excluded and indeed abused through discriminatory practices visited upon them by teachers, lecturers and classmates.[83] This section is broken out into three subsections, the first of these looks specifically at experiences of young students with their classmates; the second focuses on experiences with teachers; and finally the third section engages with the topic of wearing the hijab in the Irish school context. There is not always a neat distinction between the three subsections which at times do overlap.

From fellow pupils

Participants in this study were all aged over eighteen. In terms of youth, almost a third of participants were in the 18-24 age category while fifty per cent of participants were under the age of thirty-five. For those younger Muslim men and women in this research such as Zaynab below, who only finished second level education last year, the memories of exclusion have had a lasting impact. Parents were also keen to report the experiences that their children had in school and the emotional impact this had for them was palpable. In terms of experiences, arguably the most worrying, and most in need of attention, are those that happen at the level of social interaction between young Muslims and non-Muslims in the school context. The impact of racialising discourses that construct Muslims as 'terrorist' and a threat to 'our' culture is again evident in the comments below.

> *I was in French class [teacher's desk was close by]... so the girl [at my desk] goes to me: 'is it true your Dad is a terrorist?' I go no he's not, what do you think? And the girl beside me starts to talk as well … 'yeah Muslim Arabs are terrorists' and all that... so after this… my French teacher is my year head teacher... so I go to her, this happened, this happened, this happened. [She replied] 'sorry can't do anything [??]' … What??!! So from that I left the school and I went to a private school… and I was treated so much better...* [Maryam]

> *A kid in my son's class had a sound of an explosion [on phone/device]… and as [my son] came in to the class room [this other boy] he'd set this off the bomb [sound] and when [my son] went to his year head and reported it as racist the [year head] said, 'that's not racist'... [parent]* [Susan]

Maryam also demonstrates that, despite her efforts at being included among her peers in the University context in a culturally sensitive manner, she ended up on the receiving end of accusations of not wanting to be part of 'our' culture; Maryam acting as a proxy target for Muslim communities in a broader sense in Ireland.

> *In college I was like 'hey guys, I really do want to go out with you but when you go out, you go straight for alcohol. Can we do something that doesn't involve alcohol?'... I even*

said shisha, maybe that'll crack it! (laughs) No, the reply that I got was, 'you don't accept us, you don't accept our culture, you don't accept us drinking, then there's no point in you coming out', that was the reply I got from the head girl of our course... [Maryam]

For both Maryam and Susan, there is an absence of support at the level of the staff in the educational institutions involved. Both experiences were reported, yet, both were told that nothing can be done, or "that's not racist". Racism needs to be challenged in the school context. These issues urgently require action in the Irish educational context that challenges the pervasive misinformation and stereotyping of Muslim communities.[84] In terms of inclusion, the latter comment by Maryam also raises the need for the authorities that govern student societies to encourage their members to recognise diversity within their ranks and the need to provide inclusive fora for participation.

From teachers

Experiences of anti-Muslim racism in the school context are not restricted to peers. Nor is the failure to address this pernicious phenomenon the only means through which young Muslims are let down by authoritative figures in the school context. Islam is the third largest religion in Ireland. Moreover, almost twenty per cent of Muslims in Ireland, based on Census 2011 data, are of primary and secondary school going age.[85] The quotes provided by participants below indicate that the experiences of young Muslims in the education system are not what they should be in a professional teaching environment that promotes not only academic attainment, but social inclusion and recognition of Irish society as increasingly diverse. Amr's experience resonates with findings by research undertaken by Bryan and Bracken, albeit in a more aggressive form.[86]

I remember in school, this was in 6th class, 5th class. I was in class and it was religion class and my teacher she did not know anything about Islam, she's like one of the worst teachers you could ever have... useless; and ah, [we were] just kind of like having an argument, it wasn't argument it was more like a debate between just me and her. She was just saying stuff about Islam and I was saying no, am like, [what] you're saying is wrong and I was just trying to teach her about Islam inside the class. Like, everyone was listening nobody was really saying anything bad. Then at one point she said to me 'shut up Allah'... After the class I was really angry, everyone was laughing in the class and one guy actually stuck up for me... [Amr]

Rabia recalls some of her experiences in the third level context, the first of which relates to brief interactions she has had with some academic staff while also evidencing some of the shared discourses about individual academics among Muslim student communities:

Now we have in Universities, I know we have discover Islam week and stuff where we open stalls for others to come and ask about Islam and you'll get the odd lecturer, they'll come up to you and just be passing offensive comments towards us, nothing good to say... I know in [a Dublin University] there's a few racist lecturers that have been blatantly racist... Muslims actually go into lectures and record them. [Rabia]

These interactions can be perceived as fleeting, and of no 'real' consequence. However, when these are framed in the context of differing levels of power, that between a lecturer and a student, greater implications become apparent; Rabia again demonstrates.

> ...last year I had a new lecturer introduced to my course in college and I had an issue with repeating an essay for him... he kept telling me that he wanted me to repeat this essay in a different kind of format 'cos he didn't like the way I was referencing'... So I did, and then when he saw it again he failed me again and I asked him why? He was like 'oh I don't like your referencing style.' So I took it to a different lecturer that was [senior to] him... and he said that the [new] lecturer would like to have a meeting with me... So I came in, the two of them were sitting there, [the senior lecturer] basically was speaking to me and telling me how the [new] lecturer doesn't like my referencing style etc. etc... At that point the [new] lecturer, I felt like he was holding his tongue throughout the whole meeting, and then when he got his chance to speak he was like projecting his own problems on me and basically saying how he was forced into doing the secondary school education, and he knows that people of my culture and beliefs are often subjected to being forced into education and forced to do stuff that they didn't want to. So I just kind of sat there in the room; like, ok this makes sense now, my essay was fine [really]. So I sat there and I was like oh ok; I was kind of shocked at the start, so was the [senior] lecturer, he was so blatantly shocked... anyway I repeated the essay for him and he just refused to correct it. He told me if I had any further queries or anything to go to a different lecturer; that he didn't want to talk to me about it. So I just walked out of his office and went to the next one [lecturer] and I just openly said he's being racist to me and if you don't correct this I am going to go to the Dean...
>
> Sadia interjects: She passed [her course] with an honours degree in the end...

The wearing of the hijab, a signifier of Muslimness and all that it allegedly represents has also been the target of abuse in the school context. The topic of covering in schools vis-à-vis policies and practices will be dealt with in the following section. The quotes below demonstrate another way in which, even when students are allowed to wear the hijab in schools they can attract negative, disrespectful and demeaning comments from teaching staff. The following comments both derive from the secondary school context.

> She was the French teacher and she said can you hear me with that thing [hijab] on your head? She just assumed we couldn't hear her with the scarf... She used to pass comments. [Maryam]
>
> Something happened in [2nd LEVEL SCHOOL], [my daughter] can't hear the teacher, what he talking on the board. [My daughter] told, 'sorry, I can't hear you what you said?' and he told her 'when you take off that stupid thing [hijab] on your head you can hear me now, ok'... [Parent] [Ameena]

Wearing the Hijab in schools

The debate on wearing the hijab in schools is not new.[87] Essentially, the positions of the Irish government towards religious head covering in the educational context is, to quote Mark Kelly, Director of the Irish Council for Civil Liberties in 2008: "a policy to not have a policy."[88] The non-policy policy statement relates to the following position taken by the Department of Education in 2008 on the topic of covering in schools:

- "The current system, whereby schools decide their uniform policy at a local level, is reasonable, works and should be maintained.
- "In this context, no school uniform policy should act in such a way that it, in effect, excludes students of a particular religious background from seeking enrolment or continuing their enrolment in a school. However, this statement does not recommend the wearing of clothing in the classroom which obscures a facial view and creates an artificial barrier between pupil and teacher. Such clothing hinders proper communication.
- "Schools, when drawing up uniform policy, should consult widely in the school community.
- "Schools should take note of the obligations placed on them by the Equal Status Acts before setting down a school uniform policy. They should also be mindful of the Education Act, 1998. As previously mentioned, this obliges boards of management to take account of 'the principles and requirements of a democratic society and have respect and promote respect for the diversity of values, beliefs, traditions, languages and ways of life in society."[89]

Although it is unclear as to what evidence the then Minister for Education had to support his following claim, he clearly did not see this non-policy as a problem:

"While 92pc of schools in the country are under the patronage of one religion, it is clear that this fact has not operated to exclude pupils of different religions from these schools or from schools operating under other patronage arrangements."[90]

This research demonstrates otherwise, bearing in mind that to be and /or feel excluded in the school context does not necessarily require one to be expelled or not permitted to enrol.[91] The following quotes provide insights on the lived exclusion of young Muslim women in the secondary school context. Two of these narratives are intentionally lengthy in order to provide readers a feeling for the impact that such policies and practices can have on young Irish Muslim women. For Zaynab, the repercussions of her experience reach beyond the immediate school context to impact her broader social interaction and her confidence to manifest her faith; she has internalised feelings of exclusion.

> *I used to [wear hijab]... it was something like actually in school that convinced me to not wear it like. It was when I was going into sixth year, I sort of made the decision, ok, I'm going to wear my scarf. On the first day before school started I went up to the school and I said to my principal... I just wanted to tell her that I was going in [the following day with hijab on], that it wasn't a shock, but I like just got in the door she was already at the door and I was just like 'oh can I talk to you' and I said 'I'm planning on wearing the headscarf tomorrow', which was the first day of school, and she was like 'no, absolutely*

not'… I was just shocked, 'cos I [was] just going in to give her a heads up about it, I didn't think that I wasn't going to be allowed… but 'we're allowed wear our scarves in school'… I said that to her and she was like 'no you're not allowed wear it around your head. The only place you're allowed wear it is around your neck.' I actually had my sister there with me, like I was really shocked because I didn't expect that at all… I just said why can't I wear it? And she was like 'no you'll be excluded [by others] from school;' 'absolutely not, no way'… I kept asking why, it didn't make sense. She said that… 'I'd be excluded from the people in school… they tried it a couple of years back and that the girl she didn't have any friends, that people didn't talk to her' that 'since that day when she left nobody was allowed wear a scarf in school'… 'She's like no, you're not wearing it.' She said… she didn't say like don't come to the school but she was like 'you're not allowed wear it at the school' and ah she said [and implied] like 'there's other schools here, and I might see you tomorrow' sort of thing; so if you're going to wear it, don't come in… I used to be close to my principal, I was shocked with her since then she doesn't even say hello she's like avoid eye contact…

JC: How does that make you feel then when she [principal] was like that?

Zaynab: I was like, why? Why was it a big change just 'cos I wanted to wear a scarf, even though I feel like she knew that I was Muslim and then just since then 'I'm not talking to you'… After that experience I was really low, so I started looking up stuff about wearing the headscarf in Ireland but when I was looking it up, other people had similar experiences and according to Rory Quinn [former Minister for Education] he said that the school can choose whether they can ban the headscarf or not, so like I didn't have a say in that, apart from my principal said I'm not allowed wear it, so I'm not allowed wear it…

JC: In terms of your freedom to choose did you think you're free to choose to wear it, outside of school?

Zaynab: I feel like from that, I think that people are thinking the same thing she was thinking, like that I'd be excluded from other stuff or people would be like, 'oh, ok I don't want a Muslim or someone wearing a headscarf doing stuff'…

Sadia and Rabia are sisters that attended the same suburban secondary school in Dublin. Being a little older, Sadia was the first of the sisters to attend the school in question. On the first day of school, she broached the issue of wearing the hijab in her new school when the time came. Again, in Sadia's own words, as with Zaynab above, this young Muslim woman was left to feel excluded in the Irish school context.

I went up myself, you know you get am what's it called? Am, an induction day or whatever… We all come in and sit down we get to meet the teachers in the classroom, the parents are with you and I wasn't wearing the hijab at the time, I was still quite young, but I was conscious of the fact you know that I might be wearing the hijab one day… So, as we were leaving, I did it myself, out of my own accord, I went up to the principal, who I thought was lovely, and I said to her I was just thinking 'what if I wear the hijab one day?' and I remember my Mum or Dad, Mum more so because Dad didn't really hear

me, being so proud 'cos I did it myself... and she [principal] was like 'oh no, we won't be having that here;' and automatically then from day one, I knew ok, I am not fully accepted here now. So it started off like that and then afterwards I approached it again, 'no, you're not wearing the scarf' 'But why?' 'Because you're not allowed, we have the ethos and the uniform.' [Sadia]

The hijab was eventually accepted as part of school uniform policy in this educational establishment. However, even when it is permitted for young Muslim women to cover, schools and individuals therein can still make the wearing of the hijab a problematic experience. As Rabia illustrates:

When I first went in I didn't wear it and then eventually I start wearing it, and am, then they just start having trouble with physical education and stuff, 'you can't wear it if you're playing basketball, you can't wear it if you're playing this you can't wear it if you are playing that'... you know they were saying it's a hazard like, we could choke each other; So we're like we'll wear a headpiece that will come over our necks so that way our hair won't show just in case any of the male teachers come in whatever and no... that wasn't accepted. That was because the physical teacher was changed, a new one came in and she had an issue with it... like the one before hand was absolutely fine...so we started saying fine no problem because we really didn't give a care about physical education anyway so we'd start sitting to the side like, whatever, and then eventually, I think one day when we had become sixth years... we thought we had to challenge this now for the younger kids in the school... because they were having trouble, they were coming up to us and saying 'oh we're getting given out to for wearing a navy scarf because it's too dark', it was kind of ridiculous... It's almost like they couldn't get it right, like there wasn't one person in the school wearing the correct navy, do you know that kind of way? It was all wrong. So they were getting a lot of trouble, and the secretary at the front desk had become increasingly racist over the years and she just did not want to deal with Muslims, she just, even when she saw us she'd be so happy and cheery speaking to other students when it came to us she just...

Maryam and Amanda demonstrate that while the hijab may also be formally accepted the actual wearing of it can be policed; Madiha also reveals the inconsistency of current school practices in regards to wearing the hijab. Prior to moving to Dublin, Madiha attended a school in Ireland where she could manifest her faith without issue, unlike Maryam:

In second year [secondary school], the vice principal stops me and she goes 'I want your headscarf shorter so I can see your neck, I want to see your ears and I want to see your head [forehead]; I'm so I'm not going to do that and she goes and called my Dad and my Dad goes it's my daughter's decision [Maryam]

Similarly, Amanda's:

> ...Daughter... kept telling [her] 'I'd swear this teacher has it out for me' and she says 'every time she sees me in the hall she starts checking up and down'... she's looking to find that she has a violation in her uniform. I was like ok, just make sure your uniform is fine and you won't have any problems. And then she said well you know she hates all the Muslim students."

> I was really surprised when I came to Dublin and I find a lot of my friends... you know, the sisters and they'd be telling me we're not allowed to pray in school, teachers would be giving out to us if we put our scarves on a bit low, they'd be giving out to us and you'd have to wear same length skirts as other students [i.e. not long]. [Madiha]

The policy to not have a policy vis-à-vis the ability for young Muslim women to manifest their faith in the school context allows for exclusionary practices to manifest. The impact this has on these young women is clear, leaving young Irish Muslim women feeling stunned, disappointed and frustrated as evidenced in their comments above. The following section engages with experiences of discrimination in/accessing employment on the basis of one's Muslim identity at the hands of potential employers, managers and colleagues.

Employment
Accessing employment
Participants were asked to share their experiences of discrimination in and while accessing employment. A number of issues emerged that centre on religious identity, either in the form of religious dress or through the identification of a person as Muslim on the basis of their name.[92] Of course, this raises issues in terms of gender with, as already noted, Muslim women being more readily identifiable as Muslim on the basis of their religious dress. For Muslim men, racialised gendered constructions and perceptions of Muslim men as misogynistic and, for example, unwilling to work with women are also problematic. The first quote from a conversation with Mohammed and Amr, evidences feelings of disbelief at the treatment of a well-respected individual; in the second quote below there is evidence that among some employees at least, a perception stands that Muslims are 'different' and will not participate in the organisational culture.

> Mohammed: There's a [sports] coach... this guy is one of the best coaches in Ireland... he has his [professional qualifications] you can't go higher than that... this guy, 'cos he's a Muslim, it's so hard for him to get a job with the [national sporting body]...

> Amr: There's only three of four of them in Ireland [with this professional qualification] he applied for a job there and they said to him 'oh we don't want to give you job because you're a Muslim and you won't coach the girls', [they did not] ask him would he coach... Like he is the best coach I've ever seen...

> I remember in one interview I had long time ago, maybe seven or eight years ago... the manager he told me 'the very important thing for me, while working every day I want to see a guy... [who is someone] who can have a chat with him... he said we don't know

Muslims so their kind of culture so we don't want to get in trouble... we want to... after the work to drink and to have socialise so that could be an issue... [Saad]

Not knowing Muslims in this sense presents an image of a homogenised community; despite the diversity that exists among Muslim communities nationally and internationally it is assumed that they are all the same, all not like 'us'.

Names

An original, experimental study in Ireland, conducted for the Economic and Social Research Institute by McGinnity et al provided evidence of discriminatory practices in the hiring/selection process.[93] McGinnity et al revealed that for those applicants with an Irish name, the likelihood of being called to interview was almost twice that of those with what could be regarded heretofore as non-Irish names. This finding stood across the various sectors of the labour market included in their study. The findings that emerged in this research resonate with those of McGinnity et al.

...I think this is my country... of course sometimes there's a problem in job when I apply for job, when they see my name, of course...they prefer for example somebody's name for example Sean O'Brien... [Saad]

It is important to emphasise at this point the experiences discussed in this section may, or may not relate to the fact that people are Muslim, simply because they are perceived to be foreign, or indeed both.[94] This raises the issue of intersectionality wherein, a Muslim person may experience specifically anti-Muslim discrimination, and/or xenophobia on the perception that they are foreign, that Muslimness and Irishness are mutually exclusive.[95] Nonetheless, these are the experiences of Muslims in Ireland. As is evidenced below, some Muslim men and women recognise this and take steps to appear 'less Muslim' in the application process by changing their marker of 'otherness'.

I think sometimes I don't get jobs, I drop CVs since I was sixteen I'm twenty now, and I haven't got one reply, I haven't even got like an interview... 'ok you're not good enough for this job', not even one of them you know... now I have to like... write my name... I have to [break it up to make it easier to be read] so you don't have to call me [full name], they look at [CV/application] 'oh jeez how do you spell that? Go away, it won't even fit on the badge' (laughter). So I make a little dash and you just don't have to call me the full name...I have to write that on all my CVs 'cos you look at my CV, 'look at that name how do I pronounce that? I'll have a look at Dylan or Sean'... [Samir]

Some children, they try to change their names to get the job, to change their names to Irish name... [Ameena]

I was thinking about that... for my kids, I was thinking for like names like Adam and things like that. Maybe at least in school they'll get accepted without problem because Mohammed is very, like my older son is Mohammed, straight away they see his name 'oh no, no, no', they don't want more Mohammeds (laughs)... [Zara]

[A friend's] son, he changed his name from Mohammed to X... All his friends never thinking his name is Mohammed, they all thinking his name is X; Facebook, job, everything he put it... because he can't find job when his name is Mohammed, he thinking and he was right. He said I'm right; when I write the CV or anything put it Mohammed: 'oh we'll call you later'; when he put it X, he got job... very quick... [Nahla]

Religious dress

The issue of names may be ambiguous, given that names may/may not elicit discrimination based more on a xenophobic or racist basis or a distinctly anti-Muslim response. There is no room for ambiguity when it comes to religious dress as being a basis upon which some Irish employers discriminate against Muslim women in the recruitment process. Research undertaken as part of the Open Society Institute (OSI) series *At Home in Europe* focusing on European Muslim communities also notes the hijab as a central factor in the experiences of discrimination in the sphere of employment as reported by Muslim women across participating States.[96] Indeed, for some of the OSI study, "the exclusion of women wearing the headscarf has now become normalised in the mainstream labour market."[97] [98] [99] As the OSI report notes, it is clear to see the intersectionality between the religious identity of Muslim women, their gender and the manner in which these intersect in experiences of exclusionary practices.[100] As with the OSI study, the hijab, that marker of Muslimness that appears repeatedly throughout this study is again the focus of employers' discriminatory practices. At times, this is even made to appear as if the discriminating employer is doing it for the 'benefit' of the Muslim woman looking for work.

Fatima: Years ago, when I was in college I went to, you know, those street advertisement marketing [jobs] when you're giving [out leaflets on the street]... [Potential employer] said to me, you may want to take that off... He said; if you want to be on the streets you may want to take that off because you don't want to get abuse from people. I said to him but it's ok.

JC: Did he let you work?

Fatima: Oh no, he didn't. No, no, no... apparently it was for my own security but I told him [it was ok]. He literally said. He literally says to me: by the way, the scarf needs to come off.

If one does not experience anti-Muslim discrimination themselves, news of such experiences can spread among the communities, sending a message that to be accepted for work one may have to look less Muslim.

...it's very hard to get jobs when you are wearing hijab... my cousin, when she take off her hijab she find job; she work... [Nahla]

I have a friend who... basically did a course in nursing or something and when she... she actually applied for a job in a nursing home; and I'm not saying this for the interview purposes, they said to her 'if you want to work here you might want to take the scarf off because you are going to be working with old people, that they may find you weird.' This was said. This is what they said to her, 'they might find you strange, you are very, you

are qualified, there is nothing, you know that will make us actually not take you here but the scarf you have on, because people the people you will be working with won't be very comfortable'… [Maryam]

…I used to study in X X Centre and I asked my tutor: is it ok to work with a scarf and she said 'I haven't seen anyone with a scarf it will be hard for you to find a job with a scarf' and many people they told me the same thing. I have a friend and she used to wear a hat to hide that she's not wearing a scarf. [Amaal]

White Irish convert/revert Maria recalls her experiences of the job seeking process. It's interesting to compare Maria's experiences in the context of her pre-hijab photo and the fact that she now covers and how this turns off potential employers from taking her on. Maria explains some of her experiences:

Oh, hmmm work… If I, ok if I apply for work. You know my picture used to be on [applications/CV but without the hijab]… I would get good responses… 'cos I have quite a lot of sales experience. When I go in [for interview] it's a no straight away because I have a hijab on; my picture [I] did not have my hijab. But I do remember one time… [my] picture [was] with the hijab on and I got no responses whatsoever. One time I did get a good response, [it was] a company that's in the [Dublin] city centre and they sell MONETARY PRODUCT… but I got a good response. The wife of the director that owns the company… we had two or three phone interviews and she was completely happy with me she wanted me and I had explained that I do wear hijab and she was like 'that's great that's no problem whatsoever', but once I met him the guy [director] himself, the interview was absolutely fine but once he started talking about the hijab he said 'Can you take that off?' At the time I was like hmmm, this is the only good response I have had so…'cos I had turned up with the hijab and he was ok that's fine then he said we'll get back to you… am he was like there's no problem with religion or anything like that because he said girls there had a different religion, but it was the whole look of it, you know, to see the religion is different to have the religion and I just went ok, and I didn't hear anything back, not a yes or a no… Everything was hush after that. When I spoke to the wife afterwards she said 'oh well if you haven't heard anything back maybe he's got someone else' and I just felt that I had firmly got the job on the phone but once I had gone in to meet himself everything changed….

Potential responses, both in terms of policies and practices will be discussed further below; it is clear that action is needed in this regard. In the next section the experiences of Muslim men and women in the workplace will be revealed.

Discrimination in the workplace
Employers/Managers
In addition to accessing employment, participants also reported their experiences of discrimination in the

workplace. In the second quote below, Sadia recalls the experiences of friends of hers who are doctors working in a medical facility; again, the wearing of the hijab plays a central role here. The following quote demonstrates an arguably more fluid form of discrimination that may be passed off as 'banter' by employers and fellow colleagues. Tal demonstrates how his employer engages in discriminatory comments in front of him, a Muslim employee, and also by extension his colleagues. It is worth noting that Tal is not 'obviously' Muslim, his name, by his own admission is not recognisably Muslim; nor would he be encouraged to share his Muslim identity given the context he works in.

> Tal: [At work] Nobody knows that I'm a Muslim... I just come to this area 8 weeks, 9 weeks; before nobody knows I'm a Muslim because before, I don't want to say her name, the employer, she always joking against Muslim only, lack of knowledge I feel because she only getting from the media...
> JC: Your employer, she doesn't know you're Muslim?
> Tal: Because I don't want to say... the day one, the day one, 'cos you know when I started work there I understand that they didn't like Muslims because she'd think that all Muslims are ISIS, all Muslims are terrorists... so I don't want to make her clear this thing ok; I am working there, ok, doing my job go home...

> A lot of my friends are doctors, females and there was an issue in X HOSPITAL a while back about wearing the headscarf during operations [staff were not allowed to wear the headscarf]; [the female Muslim staff]... said 'look fair enough, we won't do operations'; the hospital had an issue with it 'no no no, we need you to do them.' [The Muslim doctors] said '[we] don't know why you have an issue with the headscarf when you will allow surgeons, they wear the hats and some of them have their own... bandana... their own lucky bandanas and whatever else and they can bring them in, and get them sterilised and use them so why can't we do the same with headscarves?' And then X HOSPITAL went back on the ruling... [Sadia]

The following experience shared with this research by Farhad happened during the midst of the recession where companies were enforcing various cutbacks. In this context Farhad believes that longstanding staff on higher wages were being targeted and replaced with what he perceived as cheaper labour. Farhad felt that his religious identity and beliefs were targeted to essentially get him off the payroll.

> I used to work in a warehouse... as a forklift driver, as a picker right and when I first started there I said listen guys, I am a Muslim I don't pick alcohol and I don't pick any pig product [employers agreed]... and then a couple of years after when things started changing [downturn] and for some reason they start sacking [people]... and start reducing the wages and what have you... When they came to me... they said [to themselves] 'what can they do for him?', they start 'oh yeah you have to pick alcohol you have to pick pig [pork products]', listen I told you guys when I started here three years ago I don't pick alcohol I don't pick pig and we [were] happy; 'no, no, no,' they denied it completely, 'no we never said that.' I ended up losing the job, I used to earn almost a thousand euro a

week… I felt like it was a constructive dismissal, they were pushing me to leave the job, and I ended up leaving the job because of it, for me it's not about money it's about my belief, it's about… something of me, my identity… [Farhad]

Colleagues

The experiences of participants described below, in their own words, could well be construed as instances of anti-Muslim verbal abuse. However, a distinction is being made here on the basis of context. While for some participants, instances of anti-Muslim slurs or abuse may be perceived as 'banter', a "joke when I was working…Osama bin Laden or whatever…they slag each other this is joke" [Moosa]. Faced with such experiences a person can come to expect to receive such abuse on a repeated and regular basis at work. This expectancy may invoke obvious feelings of stress and upset for the person involved in anticipation of going to work. Secondly, in relation to employers, the work space is a site wherein diversity should not only be recognised, but experiences of discrimination, formal or informal, should be actively challenged and employees afforded safe routes to redress.

It was just after Twin Towers, let's say a year or something, it was a hot situation and they knew I'm Muslim so they drew something, a picture, and this guy [work colleague] was coming to me 'I'm going to report you to the Gards because you did it [9/11], you know my cousin was in there.' He was my work colleague [who was saying this] actually… [Mehmet]

Obeid: …[Informed by the media] it comes out every day at my workplace you know… every day; especially this ISIS thing you know…
JC: Tell me how does it come out?
Obeid: Every little thing, they're just subtle comments that come out, you know, somehow related to what we are doing at workplace… Like sometimes we get talking about oh, we going to holiday and they like 'oh is this going to Syria to join one of the guys there [al Nusra/ISIS/FSA]'… yeah so, it's anything that you on your daily basis life that you will come across whether by talking about it or by sharing your experience yeah, that somehow gets related they try to get it you know kind of related to what's going on in Syria and Iraq you know one of those guys there…

Sadia's experience below is also notable, not only in the presence of racialised stereotypes of Muslim identities but also in the use of what are ostensibly 'innocent questions' but over the course of the conversation reveal their true intent. Sadia's comments and the quote from Mary reveal some examples of such 'innocent questions'.

When I started working, I work [in a male dominated profession] there's very few women in it and I'm the one Muslim woman with the headscarf. So I found the perception, first of all they're very shocked at the fact that you're [professional] and you're a Muslim woman… [Sadia]

More recently Sadia has had to address questions that range from….

> *Everything from, the most recent is ISIS…all of a sudden I have to defend Islam against ISIS which I hate doing… ISIS, why are you questioning me about ISIS? There's an automatic relationship to the fact that you know, I must know something about ISIS and must support them in one way or the other… September 11th was a terrible one all of a sudden 'what do you think of September 11th?' 'I don't know, what do you think of September the 11th?' I mean it's the same perception that we both have… I ended up educating myself really well on Islam because they've [colleagues] asked me things on Islam… Eventually it will cross the line into just being offensive and 'sure Prophet Mohammed I mean he married a little girl, he was a paedophile.' Then you go 'woe now, hang on a second, let us discuss this in detail' but why jump to the paedophile statement straight off? Now you're being offensive. You want to know about it let's sit and talk about it…*

In relation to questions of the position of women in Islam Sadia continues…..

> *…I get not are you oppressed, 'why are you wearing the scarf?' 'cos I want to 'really 'cos you want to like?' I got told in work one day 'your dad's not here, your husband is not here,' and?? I don't wear it for my dad or my husband anyway… I'm wearing it 'cos I want to for God 'but we won't tell your dad,' what???*

These 'innocent questions' are by no way restricted to the 'formal' work sphere but can arise when one is working in the home and interacting with neighbours for example, among others.

> *I've had comment from an Irish woman, so shocked like, she was educated, 'I never see you out that much', and I'm there you know!! [exasperated]; 'are you allowed outside the gate?' (laughter) 'of your house?' I said am 'you kind of work all day you won't see me in and out of my house all day' and then that's what I was saying in my mind and then I said, 'no I said, you know the chain that MY HUSBAND has on my ankle? It only goes towards the gate (laughter)… and if I move any further I can't actually get farther than the gate.' But she actually thought I was serious, she didn't laugh or anything she just, 'ok, yep'. [Mary]*

Some participants noted that they did not mind the questions as they felt they provided them with an opportunity to address some of the stereotypes peddled in discourses about Muslims and Islam. The issue of discourses and the role of the media will be looked at in more detail below. For now it is important to underscore that the treatment of participants in the workplace as described above, by colleagues etc. raises questions in terms of their personal wellbeing and their feelings of inclusion/exclusion in the work context.[101] This behoves employers to create an inclusive workspace that recognises diversity.

Discrimination: Public Transport

As discussed, the Immigrant Council of Ireland offer a racism reporting service to people who are subjected to racist hostility and discrimination. The Immigrant Council are also a partner of the European Network Against Racism (Ireland) (ENAR Ireland). ENAR Ireland act as an umbrella organisation to collect and collate reports of racist incidents from across a network of Irish civil society organisations and concerned individuals.[102] This information is then published regularly. It is striking to note the recurrence of the area of public transport as a location for acts of racism in each of the reports published by ENAR Ireland; these include experiences of discrimination and hostility by both staff and fellow patrons.[103]

Participants in this research recalled instances of what they felt were discriminatory practices by public transport staff. Although the following examples do not include the use of specifically anti-Muslim terms by the staff involved in Dublin Bus, research participants indicated that they perceived these incidents as possibly discriminatory. Nahla uses public transport frequently. In her first quote below, she relied on public transport to bring her home from hospital, in the second to visit Clonskeagh mosque. The impact of experiences will be discussed later; again, it is worth noting that Nahla is an identifiably Muslim woman.

> *...two months ago I was very sick, I went to Saint Vincent's hospital, I have to back to HOME by number XX [bus]. I took number X [bus] to XXXX station, you know and the bus driver was very good for number X you know, he said I'll drop you exactly where the number XX [stops] because I was very sick in that time and he said 'ok one minute [before the arrival of] the number XX'. When he [driver of the number XX] saw me I was walking and I show him like that [flagging bus] and he turned on [sped up] and he go fly, he doesn't let me [get on]* [Nahla]

On another occasion, Nahla was

> *'On the number XX bus, I want to go to the Clonskeagh mosque. I ask the bus driver 'please can you show me where is the Bird Ave?'... My friend told me get off at Bird Ave... I was on the bus and he said 'ok' and he passed, passed, passed; went out Milltown and then he call me in Ranelagh. I said 'is this near Bird Ave.?' He said 'behind me', I said ok, I get off and then I ask everybody 'where the Clonskeagh?' They said 'oh it's too far'... I said oh my God, how can I get back... he passed [dropped] me maybe fifteen minutes after Bird Ave... I'm sure he didn't forgot me because I'm standing beside him and he always looked at me...*

Ameena recalls her experience:

> *I've had a bus driver make faces at me while driving by and I just looked and I just kind of shaked my head because are you an adult?!*
> *JC: What kind of faces?*
> *Ameena: You know that rugby dance they do... Sticks his tongue out... something similar to that. He literally stuck out his tongue at me and went 'laaaaaa.' Like he was a ghoul or something!*

A central area of public transport, wherein Muslim men and women experience instances of anti-Muslim discrimination, is that of the airport and so-called 'random checks'.[104] Various authors have proffered that Muslim communities in the contemporary context form a 'suspect community', subjected to extra security scrutiny on the assumption that there is an innate relationship between Muslimness and proclivities towards terrorism.[105] Interestingly, this concept of 'suspect community' was first coined in relation to Irish communities travelling to/from and/or living in the UK during the so-called 'Troubles'.[106] Irish Muslim men and women can be subjected to these 'random checks' both at home and abroad.

> JC: Have you ever experienced it [discrimination] at airports?
> Maria: they come inside to check your hijab they check inside… I had to take off my abayah
> Aisha: But if you tell them, you know I was asked before if I could take that off [abaya] and I said no sorry, I'm wearing kind of like trousers underneath I'm not taking this off…
> Mary: And then they say can you come into a room
> Aisha: No I just let them scan me, I just you know I have no time for all of that kind of rubbish, I'm like yeah you can whatever you know…
> JC: Have you all been stopped at the airport?
> Multiple voices: Yeah, yeah
> JC: So you've all been random checked?
> Mary: yeah but they say random checked
> Aisha: and my bag as well. Ok yeah here we go, suits me that they randomly check through my bag
> Tasmina: but not always, not always
> Aisha: yeah not everytime, it wouldn't be everytime…

These comments evidence the frequency of this problem for Muslim communities and highlight the profiling of Irish Muslim men and women here in Ireland and also abroad whilst travelling. In the Irish context is vital that this "religio-profiling" ends and Muslim men and women are treated equally with other Irish citizens.[107] The following comments also share the experiences of Irish Muslims whilst travelling, at home, but also abroad.

> [Returning from France] The only thing to happen to me was on the way back, we didn't come straight from Charles de Gaulle, we had to go to the other [airport] to get back here and there was me and a guy in a turban, so evidently the only two to be questioned… the only two, and like the girl in my year was so angry about it as well because she was like 'I never'; she herself noticed it, I didn't see anything, I was getting ready to be searched and she was like 'sorry, a random search?' like, but I was like yeah 'random' (laughter) and my friend was kind of packing her bags looking and she was kind of looking at me… maybe it was random, but then with the guy with the turban was stopped she just kind of got really angry 'cos they're letting so many people [go through] and there's the guy with the turban and the girl with the headscarf [stopped]… [Rabia]

I knew a [Muslim] brother going to the States... and he flew from Dublin to London, when he landed in London, two people called him out and they, it wasn't a strip search but they got him in a room and they asked him, they checked him over they checked through his bags, asked him a load of questions. He got outside the room, his coach was shouting at the people saying 'yis are racist, yis only took him because he has a Muslim name,' He stuck up for himself, he said to them you only took me in because I have a Muslim name and there's no problem with me, there was no problem; like they always suspect the innocent... [Amr]

I was randomly checked here. I was randomly checked in Spain. Even though there was a lot of people that were ahead of me, the [security] guy, I went through the thing nothing beeps. The guy said the bag is ok. He said to me: no. He opened. He took everything off it... And then I got checked even though nothing beeped, ok? I was happy. I knew, like this is not really random, I know it's not random. It's us, so. It's Muslims... I was like: is everything ok? He was like yeah and he just let me go, ok?... here [Dublin] I always get randomly checked, we [Muslims] know this. We're like 'oh yeah like a full body massage'... Like, it's becoming, it's like... we take it positively. Yeah we are getting a massage, fair enough, you know... [Sadia]

Discrimination: Shops

A striking finding in the area of discrimination relates to the treatment of Muslim women and men in the context of shopping. There's a distinct security theme emerging in this study in the manner in which Muslim women, predominantly, are pursued in shops and shopping malls, mainly by security guards but also by shop staff. A similar finding arose in earlier research with Muslim communities in the Irish context.[108] In that earlier study, there was a perception by one participant that sometimes people mistakenly confused Muslim women for members of the Roma communities on the basis of the headscarf. This perception of Muslim and Roma women arose again in this study. Profiling a person because they are Muslim, Roma, or on any other basis is unacceptable; such practices are discriminatory. Whether Muslim men and women are being discriminated against by being targeted by security because they are Muslim or otherwise, these practices are impacting upon them.

I was in CHAINSTORE, in Henry Street with my cousins and the security guard they, all the time follow us you know, I'm thinking why he follow us, I spoke with my cousin she said 'ignore him ok,' and after that he always look at us and I turned and said, look why you always follow us, he said oh 'it's my job', I said, your job on the door not follow the customers. Why? Because I'm wearing hijab or what?... [Nahla]

Muslim women are more likely to be attacked because they are recognised as Muslims because of the headgear that they wear, the hijab that they wear. That's not just in certain areas, they've been say in shopping centres, maybe services in certain areas some supermarkets or department stores you'd get the security guard be following a Muslim woman just because she wears the hijab...They'd be targeting them you know as potential kind of thieves or something like that... it's very common the security thing... [Karim]

...I remember once it happened to me, but I just like I remember I felt like he was trying to follow me more than, he wasn't literally going around but I felt like he was following me; so I just let him follow me more and more and more and then just paid at the till. Some people react, I know a lot of people who react; I know [one sister] that happened to her, and she reacted... I think he followed her a lot and she said to him you know, 'you're following me' and she asked for the managers to come and she told him. Usually I sometimes I say maybe I will, by me acting normally, I prove to him that he's wrong maybe he has some stereotype idea?? Maybe he's victim of media or a victim of stereotype?? ... But this security thing I have heard it from so many people... [Zara]

This suspicion by security staff predominantly focuses on Muslim women. However Muslim men can also be affected. Farhad recalled his experiences of security guards in shops. Farhad in particular notes the fact that he was dressed in traditional Arabic clothes; the perception that Muslim women are mistaken as Roma noted above is also evident in Farhad's comments. Talhan perceives the problem to be associated more generally with all those who are considered as 'foreign', highlighting the manner in which Muslim men and women may be the target of discriminatory practices on the basis of their religious identity and/or as a result of xenophobic/racist practices.

JC: Have you as men been followed by security in a shop?
Farhad: I personally yes experienced something like this. I turned around to the gentleman and said listen, you stop following me or otherwise I am going to go and report you... I was wearing my thobe... the women, probably, probably and this is my own take... they might get the mix with the gypsies community, what you call them?? Romanian gypsies?? They wear long, they wear similar, similar dresses...
Talhan: As a foreigner, I know like if I go to any superstore, to be honest and if I'm looking for something and most of the time personally I feel like security will be focussing on me...
JC: Why do you think that is?
Talhan: ...I don't know like [why] they're purposefully, you know be focussed on these people like you know... they will be focussing and they look at you. You don't know where is the stuff is you're looking [for]. Sometimes... you will be looking like which [product] is the cheapest one, which one looks better. But within a few minutes you will see like security person will be near to you, and then after a few minutes, if you are noticing, he will say 'ok? You are ok?'... They might have tar?? [target?] Like specially focussing on the foreigner, I don't know like what's their training; but I personally feel multiple times and then they say you should come in this shop again, I'm not...

Discrimination: Restaurants

The following example is the only incident of discrimination to emerge from the restaurant context in this study. The use of the word 'Paki' in the following example may indicate, at first reading, that this may not have been a specifically anti-Muslim incident. However, as has been argued elsewhere, and evidenced again in this study, the term 'Paki' is often directed towards Muslim women whether they are White or Black,

Irish, European, African or otherwise.[109] As Madiha states above 'it's because of the hijab'. There are two contrasting aspects to the following incident: the shocking character of the incident itself; and, the positive response by the staff and management involved. The young women in this incident were out celebrating an event in Dublin city centre and with friends...

> ...had taken up the complete top floor of RESTAURANT so...we were upstairs a full group of us and we're frequents there because they made the meat halal and stuff because [of] the students around. So we were all upstairs and we were having a party and two of the girls decided to leave first... they just had to go home... they went down and they were going for the receipt... [Earlier] When the waiter was taking our orders myself and the other[s]... we could see how frustrated he was getting 'cos it was so many of us... people were changing their orders constantly and stuff and it looked like he was having a bad day as well. So he was just taking everyone's, he was just like he was getting really angry basically and agitated and when we went downstairs one of the two girls went downstairs they came back up with their receipt, they were really angry and we were like 'what's wrong?? What's going on??' They were just getting really flustered... they had an argument downstairs and we were like why?? And they showed us the receipt it was like 'go home Pakis', and he [waiter] wrote it on the receipt... and we initially were like no way, no he did not just write it, like there's no way... no way he wrote that. So we went down... the waiter was saying it wasn't him... and the other waiters were actually going against him saying he's been causing trouble with our interracial customers having issues with him since he's been employed here; so we were all like well then what the hell?? And the manager wasn't there at the time and he knows us as well, he'd know our faces if he saw us so we left and we didn't know what to do at the time; do we leave? Do we stay? Do we wait to speak to someone higher?... what do we do? So we just took the receipt we paid obviously and we all left as we were leaving we ran into some of the guys from our community. [Rabia]

> Sadia: It went viral on social media though as well...

> The manager... after he took the details of two of the girls, called them back and they went in for a meeting with him and he actually removed the guy from RESTAURANT, he's not working there anymore... he was like, he's been on three warnings and that was it and apparently one of the chefs inside the kitchen saw him write it on the receipt as well so that's what... yeah so you're going to get the odd person... all of us hijabis are Pakis like... [Rabia]

Discrimination: An Garda Síochána

Research previously published by the Immigrant Council of Ireland revealed the lived realities of inconsistent and unprofessional policing practices in Ireland when it came to addressing racism.[110] Recent research has built on this previous work to further reveal experiences of religio-profiling as noted earlier, as well as experiences which can only be classed as racist by members of An Garda Síochána.[111] There are two elements

in what follows when it comes to discriminatory policing practices from the perspectives of participants in this research. The first experience, shared by Ameena, presents evidence of what can only be perceived as discrimination.

> *Once, I am waiting [for] my children in front of the school and I parking on the kerb and there's a lot of cars parking like me. The Garda came to me and told me 'why you are parking on the kerb?' I told him because the road is narrow, I have to park the kerb to keep the cars space... I told him 'but look, everyone is parking.' ...He asked me 'do you have licence?' I told him yes, 'is it full or provisional?' I told him Garda, I told him it's full and I ask him 'why you did not speak to other people? They all parking.' 'I will do it he said.' Then he didn't speak to anybody except me...*
> *JC: [Hearing that] Does that discourage you from going to the Gards later?*
> *Zara: It would because that you feel that the Gardaí himself have... I would say that [in Arabic] but usually they there is some saying like between the community like, they will say like 'but you should have complained to the store manager if one of the cashier treated you badly or something like that, you should have complained' 'oh do you think they'll stand in my side?' [The perception is] They will stand in their side, we say 'land son' like the person from their country, they will stand in their side, do you think they will stand with me especially I am wearing this [hijab] and they will leave him? Even if he's mistaken they will stand on his side, there is this negativity...*

Another participant also made reference to their perception that Gardaí discriminate in favour of those they perceive as 'real' Irish people over those who are not. Not unlike Ameena and Zara's discussion above.

> *[Friends] they don't get help from police... they come they say, this is you know, most of the people they complain...so they don't get help... if they know your tongue is foreigner... they [Gards] send no car...* [Osa]

Interactions with and perceptions of An Garda Síochána such as these erode any trust that may be there among members of Muslim communities in the Irish context; the net effect being that if one experiences anti-Muslim racism they have nowhere to turn for assistance outside of civil society organisations such as the Immigrant Council of Ireland.[112] People living in Ireland need to have their needs vis-à-vis policing requirements recognised; these needs will differ depending on context and identities involved. Members of An Garda Síochána cannot pick and choose who is to be protected if a professional service is being provided that recognises diversity.

This brings an end to the sections of this report that catalogue experiences of anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination. The following section will outline the impact that the experiences have on Muslim men and women in Ireland and underscore the need for responses that go beyond cataloguing reports of anti-Muslim racism and generating data to those that provide hands on guidance and support for those targeted.

Section 4: The Impact of Hostility and Exclusion

The impact that anti-Muslim hostility can have on individuals and communities goes beyond the physical. Various researches in the area of hate crime have documented the specific impacts that incidents of hostility can have on the wellbeing of those targeted. For the Muslim women that participated in Allen et al's research "it was the impact of their experience of anti-Muslim hate that was most significant"; this included feelings of fear, anger, embarrassment, anxiety, feelings of vulnerability, humiliation and shock.[113] Zempi and Chakraborti also note the psychological impact of anti-Muslim hostility; again they referred to their participants' feelings of fear and distress; vulnerability; anxiety; depression; personal guilt; humiliation; reduced confidence and a reduction in feelings of self-worth; flashbacks, insomnia; frustration, anger.[114] These responses are not isolated to experiences of hostility per se but can also manifest as a result of experiences of discrimination, inducing anxiety and depression while also impacting negatively upon personal self-esteem.[115] As with international research findings, the responses of those who participated in this research who had been targeted for anti-Muslim hostility fall under the categories of: fear – immediate and long term, anger, depression, shock and frustration. It is vital that, when considering the proposals to challenge anti-Muslim racism in Ireland proffered later, these lived, long term impacts are kept in mind.

Fear

Maryam's response to her attack at the fast food restaurant in Dublin, noted earlier, needs no further elaboration, her feelings are palpable.

> ...it's my first time in my whole life, not feeling safe. I literally came home and, [turns to friend] have you ever seen me shiver or afraid?

The fear in the aftermath of anti-Muslim hostility is not only felt by individuals that have been targeted but also by members of the broader Muslim communities.[116] Men and women know of the possibility of being attacked for 'looking Muslim' and this invokes feelings of fear in family members for the safety of their loved ones. Tasmina shared how her husband is more afraid for her safety than she is and advises her to take precautions, this even though she has never personally been the subject of anti-Muslim hostility.

> JC: have you encountered abuse on the street?
> Tasmina: No, I have never and am the other things is like, my husband is more, am, I think he is more scared of these things so he's always very concerned...
> JC: So he's scared for you?
> Tasmina: For me, yes because I have started... wearing this hijab...

Amaal, as noted above, experienced five incidents of anti-Muslim verbal abuse in the space of one week:

> ...Yeah in one week. And that was shock because it just happened for the first time. And I don't know why this happened... And then I couldn't be fine after that. I went to Blanchardstown and I went: oh no, they look at me because I'm wearing a scarf. Before I didn't care but now I worry about this. I used to wear a skirt now I'm not gonna wear a skirt, I'm gonna wear jeans. And when I walk in the night now I'm wearing this [coat hood pulled up] and now I can't see my scarf...

Participants also demonstrated their fears in relation to discrimination and taking ameliorative action. This is the case for people who are pending naturalisation here in Ireland; but the predicament of those classed as 'undocumented' in Irish society is even more precarious as is explained by Salah. Participants do not even feel safe enough to report to non-state actors such as the Immigrant Council of Ireland because:

> 'oh my God we don't have papers, they may first of all ask us you know, what's your PPS number?' and the person doesn't have a PPS number. You know he'll be worried, so they would not go there… Another thing, some people they are they don't go to the Gards even if something happens to them, you know why? They say 'oh… you know we applied for naturalisation and we didn't go [report hostility] because we thought it would affect our application;' you know, and I'm like Subhan Allah! But that's the mentality you know… then you know if some employer for example is unfair in any way, as a Muslim employee sometimes they won't even report it, even though in this country you have… you know you can go to certain organisations… but they wouldn't because they would say no because, we're immigrants here and you know we don't want to get in trouble, you know we don't want our names in the police files or in the court mention so they wouldn't do that so this is another thing… [Salah]

Shock

As detailed above, Rabia was targeted in Dublin city centre by a male assailant that threw a glass bottle from across the street but missed his target. The impact this incident evoked involved some fear but primarily feelings of being shocked at what just took place.

> I was just in so much shock… Initially it's not really fear it's just kind of what the hell because especially if someone's drunk, personally anyway you know they're not going to do much harm, they're going to fall over or something eventually, especially if they are that drunk. So I wasn't really scared of him, I was just what the hell, do you know, that could have really hurt me…

Anger

While it is unclear whether or not the young man discussed in the below incident was targeted on the basis of being identified as Muslim or otherwise, it is worth noting the consensus of his mother Susan, and co-discussant Mary on the emotions that incidents such as this can evoke, not only in the person targeted but among family.

> Susan: My son, he and a friend were collecting for a school charity on my estate… and they knocked on this guy's door and he came out and he said 'and which container did you come out of?' that is just sickening, I went around to the house afterwards…
> Mary: No, but you see it does make you angry….
> Susan: So angry, particularly when it's your child.

Frustration

Experiences of 'innocent questions' in the workplace can also take their toll. For Obeid, having to repeatedly deal with questions of his faith and associations with groups such as Daesh or ISIS invokes feelings of annoyance and frustration; these questions do not just stop when one leaves work but are internalised, carried outside of the workspace to the broader personal life of the individual on the receiving end.

> *Sometimes I bring this with me at home you know, it keeps me awake overnight to be honest because, as I said, it's so annoying yeah, that your faith is being misinterpreted by sections of the way the tiny sample of people through their own actions [ISIS eg.] you know, so you get you kind of get the same label, it's very annoying it keeps me awake [for] sometime…* [Obeid]

Depression

The various discussions with participants in the course of this study evidenced an array of emotional responses. These in isolation can be difficult to deal with, however such experiences of discrimination or hostility can compound issues in one's life and invoke feelings of depression. Nahla, a white Muslim woman clearly identifiable by her hijab and abaya, demonstrates her experience of discrimination while using public transport.

> *I was oh my God, I was really crying at that time, I was really depressed, I came back home in taxi…*

Section 5: Media, Belonging and Perceived Vulnerabilities

Media discourses and Muslim communities

Various research studies have illustrated the manner in which media discourses racialise Muslim communities as holding innate proclivities towards terrorism, 'extremism' and fundamentalism. Muslim men are constructed as hyper-patriarchal while Muslim women are presented as passive, oppressed and lacking in intellect.[117] The issue of the media coverage of, and interaction with, Muslim communities was discussed with participants in this study. While one participant noted that media coverage of issues such as the conflict in Syria and Iraq was problematic in that "it's simplistic" Martin; others identified the media as, to quote one participant "the main problem" Tal; the main source of, and means, to propagate homogenising, racialised stereotypes of Muslimness which have real effects on the lives of Muslims in Ireland.

> To be honest with you, the media, I find it they make all the Muslim all the same... [Moosa]

> It's what the media says... like the fact that they were shouting 'IS' 'IS' other day and Osama bin Laden and all that, it's because they being brainwashed by the media; there's no good thing coming out of the media nowadays. [Maryam]

> ...there seems to be more Islamophobia, there seems to be a rise in Islamophobia among the people... because of the media, because of the media reports. Media highlights always the sensational, that what is, you know, very negative and unfortunately people then, what they do is, they assume that you know all Muslims are like that; so there is a rise of Islamophobia, anti-Muslim sentiment. [Salah]

Feelings of distrust and strong, negative perceptions exist among Muslim communities in Ireland toward most media actors. It must be noted that not all media actors were perceived in a negative light in this research. Yet there was a shared perception among some participants that various media actors had an agenda when it came to Muslim communities: namely to sell copy without due regard for the consequences of their stories. Indeed, as Tariq details in his quotes below, when Muslim representative bodies publish statements of condemnation towards terrorist attacks they are rarely reported in the national press. Furthermore, if they do not give the sensational report that the media *want* their input is not reported either.

> Most of them is interested in selling to an audience, whether it's TV or selling newspapers but they're not going to be telling that this guy is a nice guy, that doesn't sell; they have to show the crime and even of the crimes they are going to show... the worst one so that's what sells... [Karim]

> the media, we all know they want to sell something really flashy... really flashy and eye catching... [Farhad]

> ...We issued many statements and nobody heard about it; we rang the newspaper, we put it in the website, we put it in... but you don't hear about them because the media they are not interested and they will not be interested to put it in the radio or on the television or anywhere... [Tariq]

In relation to not providing the report the media *want*:

> *...As recently, the last about two weeks ago, the Irish NEWS PAPER came to us and they said put [it to] one of the imams; she asked them that the ISLAMIC ORGANISATION didn't involve protest against ISIS and she came and she put all this list of questions...'why you didn't state that you are not against ISIS? What's your position as the ISLAMIC ORGANISATION?' All these questions and I refer her to our website, 'go to our website there is about five statement for each killing each event happen we issue statement and we send it to the press and this is the statement of the ISLAMIC ORGANISATION and this the Muslim community; [we] feel this not Islam and this [IS] is a terrorist organisation and we are not involved with these issues. So anything that's happened we have to put our self in front to say we are not, we are not a criminal...* [Tariq]

The perception that the media are just out to sell sensationalist copy is accompanied by another perceived agenda relating to reportage about Muslim communities in Ireland and abroad. Whether this is emblematic of intentional media practice, or solely in the domain of perception, it is clear that some among Muslim communities feel that they are being targeted by media actors given the reporting practices discussed above and below that focus on Muslims and Islam in a negative, racialising manner.

> *...Once on the radio they had a talk show about man abusing, domestic abuse within the Muslim community right and then all of a sudden I was listening to the radio, me and my wife while we were having our breakfast said ok, they are talking about this, lets ring them. I consider myself quite a decent [level of] English my wife... her English is perfect. We rang them... we were trying to come across like: listen, this is a couple, a Muslim couple, ringing you guys live to tell you that whatever you're hearing here don't mix religion with culture. Religion is the teaching of Islam and how a Muslim man should treat his wife and the cultural is something completely different. What I sensed is, that a kind of, first of all they kept interrupting us, they gave us less time than the other party; it's like they have a hidden agenda whereby they only want to promote for a certain thought, a certain kind of ideas...* [Farhad]

> *I think there's a level of ignorance... say for example you were Sikh... they wouldn't know anything about you or your tradition or your religion, but they wouldn't have been conditioned to hate you in the same way as the media is conditioning people... To hate Muslims... or feeding people certain specific pieces of information about Islam you know, or saying for example that FGM is preached in Islam which it's not so. There are definite, active campaigns to discredit Muslims going on and you know and they were very obvious in the UK but they're becoming obvious here as well...* [Susan]

Rabia, in her discussion with Sadia, briefly proffers that such discourses of Muslimness serve to misinform the general public, which for her in some way lessens the blame of those who engage in anti-Muslim hostility; again though the perspective that there is a specific anti-Muslim agenda at play in the media is evident in the following interaction.

Rabia: I think when people are so misinformed you can kind of use it as an excuse sometimes for the way they act...
Sadia: But it's not misinformed sometimes, sometimes it's purposely...
Rabia: I know yeah, but if I was constantly exposed to something being portrayed as so negative, do you know, even if I tried to be open minded about it there's going to be something at the back of it that, yeah, that this [Muslimness] is iffy you know...

really it has big impact... lots of people think... so the media is just here as if targeting, just want to spread this idea of Muslims [as] worse people... so just you know generalising Muslim... I think that some people they don't have time to search about this, they just take [information from the media], so the media has something to achieve... have something they want to bring to the people's idea... [Osa]

...it's just easier to not think about it and just go well I've seen the news a hundred times: Muslims equal terrorist – everyone's a terrorist. Do you get me? There's no point thinking about it. It's just the way it's been flashed in front of their faces for so long. So they're gonna be like... These guys are terrorists... That's the truth to be honest. That's who people generally think. And the media has a huge part to play in it as well... [Marouane]

The impact that negative, perceived as biased reporting about Muslim communities was iterated to this research by Fatima. For her, and as evidenced in other research studies media are key location of information about Muslims and Islam.[118] People are internalising racialising images about Muslim communities that homogenise Muslims as one group. The diversity among Muslim people, approximately one and a half billion worldwide, is eschewed.

...what's happening around the world right now, the media has its lights on Muslims but in a really, really bad way and that's what makes people think we're bad. So nowadays, if I receive abuse of physical or verbal I don't really take offence anymore because it's become the norm. You know, because I know people, if they haven't got proper education about Muslims, they haven't got friends, they are not actually aware who you are, they are obviously going to assume we're those people that they see on the media, you know. So, this is why. When I say normal, it's become normal now because of what's happening, because how we are portrayed on the media. [Fatima]

Ambassadors of Islam

Muslim communities, as has been outlined throughout this report are homogenised as one single group. Whether manifesting in media reportage or as 'innocent questions in the workplace', individual Muslims are deemed representative of the entire faith of Islam.[119] Negative, racialised constructions of Islam and Muslim communities worldwide inform an erroneous perception that all Muslims in Ireland hold some relationship to, and thus responsibility for, terrorist acts perpetrated by groups such as Daesh. Despite having no connection to these groups, Muslims in Ireland are asked to speak as representatives, ambassadors of the entire Ummah.

...today a lady call from the paper... she start saying 'shame on you, shame on you, you should start you should go out demonstrating', I was like sorry what are you talking about? And she said like there was a demonstration organised by XXXX sheikh or whatever, I don't know his name...and she said 'you should demonstrate against ISIS, we Irish need to know your point of view'... I said to her listen, 99.9% of the Muslims... most of them are caring about taking kids to school, and going to work, and come back from work, and... what to cook for dinner and they don't even bother about what's going on... sometimes don't know that there's demonstration... I told her if you are upset we are more upset, and we seriously are... Like if you see an Irish person [in] the [United] States, Britain or whatever and this Irish person started doing weird things... and he says that I represent all Irish [people], what would you feel? You would feel worse than any other... why for goodness sake this person should representing me when he is not acting like all other Irish... [Zara]

The manner in which Muslim communities are constructed as a 'suspect community', as noted above, resonates strongly with the experiences of Irish men and women in the very recent past, particularly in the United Kingdom.[120] The frustration is clear and is rooted in being held culpable for acts perpetrated by individuals and groups that claim to represent Islam and the Ummah but clearly, in the words of participants themselves, do not.

Everything... the most recent is ISIS... all of a sudden I have to defend Islam against ISIS which I hate doing... ISIS, why are you questioning me about ISIS?? There's an automatic relationship to the fact that, you know, I must know something about ISIS and must support them in one way or the other. [Sadia]

You feel all the time you have to find excuses and tell them why, and tell them your feelings, and what you are against... You are responsible for things you didn't do, you know, you always feel like you cannot act normal; you have to be acting certain way because you are representing a full Ummah... [Zara]

I'm a Muslim but I shouldn't have to, you know, apologise for something that mad people did... but we have to always seem to justify, we always have to sell ourselves as being patient and nice and everything like that. We're not supposed to lose our temper and show anger and show anything in front of people... but why are Muslims only told to behave on your best or be on your best behaviour??... Like my attitude now, the minute I step outside the door is I am selling the product, and I have to sell it in the best possible form because I do know that people look at me differently and that's sad but it's true... [Mary]

As a Muslim, as a Muslim woman, as a Muslim in general you constantly have to explain yourself... As long they are not Muslim you are explaining yourself. [Madiha]

In this context, the following section will focus on the issue of belonging in relation to young Irish Muslims before moving to elaborate on some positive experiences and ways forward to challenge anti-Muslim racism in Ireland as proffered by the participants themselves.

Belonging

The preceding sections, particularly in the education sector, highlight the manner in which Muslim communities can be excluded as a result/absence of formal state policies and practices that encourage and protect diversity. In addition, the more 'informal' experiences of anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination iterated above demonstrate the manner in which Muslim men and women experience exclusionary practices in their day to day public interactions. Participants were asked how they felt in the context of such experiences of exclusion, formal and informal. The findings below reveal their feelings vis-à-vis belonging and their fears, especially for younger Irish Muslims in the context of globalised media accessibility.[121]

Identity Crisis

An interesting theme that emerged in relation to feelings of belonging was that of identity crisis. Muslim communities have been part of Irish society at least since the late 1950s. As such, many Muslims in Ireland, in addition to converts/reverts, are second, third etc. generation men and women from a migrant background.[122] Younger generations of Irish Muslims, born and raised here, reported experiences of identity crisis in a number of ways. At a basic level there is a sense of confusion which is felt more by second or third generation Muslims born and raised in Ireland than for those who may have spent their formative years in a Muslim majority society.

> A bit confused almost. People at work they all think I'm Irish; I'm like yeah I'm Irish... Irish and from Palestine. I'm originally Palestinian and like gets the conversation going, they're like 'but your Irish, you're born and raised here like the only difference is you're Muslim' like I know there's that but it's also the culture... So yeah, born and raised here, kind of feel Irish in some aspects but then like even though like, I've never been home... back to Palestine; I visit family out in Libya... when I go back they're like 'you're Irish', you know you're European' [Hania]

The following exchange between Ahmed, Naseem and Abdel is revealing, emphasising as it does the issue of identity crisis through the perspectives of young Muslim men in and from Dublin:

> Ahmed: Like there is an identity crisis... I was only thinking about this recently this identity crisis and this sort of... this confusion and it has an effect on a lot of people in different situations. Maybe socially they're not very confident. Maybe they don't feel like they fit in, maybe they don't feel like they belong somewhere. Sometimes they do, sometimes they don't... There is all of this... that sort of feeds into the fact that the Muslim young, just fundamentally I think in this country have an identity crisis. 'Cos they don't know who they are; they don't...
> Naseem: I think the most part, the majority of the youth whether they're Muslim or not have an...

Ahmed interjects: No, Muslim[s] especially in terms of place of belonging… but I think it's specifically in terms of a place that you call home, a place that you feel like you actually belong to… and are welcome in. There is an identity crisis there. People don't know what is home. People are confused. They don't know how to portray themselves. Should I be Muslim?? Should I not be ashamed?? Should I be an apologetic one?? Or should I be an aggressive one?? And so on… and for young people that's massively confusing. It's a massive issue.

Abdel: It's like… see the Muslim youth, they feel very confused, the Irish Muslims. Especially like the third and fourth generation. They feel very confused because they're like, all right grand well… for example if just say for example if I don't go out drinking at the weekend, that means I'm not an Irish lad. 'Cos I remember when I was at school coming in on the Monday, talk of the class for like the first two sessions, first two classes – 'ah yeah, yeah I was out there that weekend and I got this and I got that and I scored this girl or I done this and that like.' As a Muslim I wasn't doing any of that so I was kind of just sitting there at the edge going… What?? Why are they talking about that?? So you feel that kind of exclusion… It's kind of a bit of both but what they need to realise is you don't have to do all that to be Irish."

Similarly for Rabia whose father is Arabic but she herself, along with her mother, is Irish finds that she is not assumed as being from Ireland but also…

…then obviously you can't really be seen as Arab either or you not only 'cos you're not Arab enough to be Arab…

[Second generation] feel the sense of belonging even more than us… Like my children when they go to [MUSLIM COUNTRY] they find it very hard to understand people mentality like, they are more Irish when they go to [MUSLIM COUNTRY] the find it like that, and come here [Ireland] and feel excluded. [Zara]

Feelings of exclusion as iterated in some of the quotes above compound those feelings of confusion in terms of identity shared for example by Hania above. Experiences of anti-Muslim racism, whether as hostility or discrimination, communicate to Irish Muslims that they 'do not belong here' and as such are perceived to be vulnerable.

…Youth… are victim of racism - being called Osama bin Laden, all that; they feel that they're not being accepted here, such youth are very vulnerable because they look for identity, identity crisis… [Salah]

For Sadia, these experiences will lessen over time; that the current generation of young adult Irish Muslims is in the eye of a storm that will dissipate as will the feelings of identity crisis.

I honestly think that's because we're first generation Muslims here in Ireland, I think that gets wiped out slowly in time with more generations of Muslims; our parents, 90%

of us right... 90% of the Muslim youth, now their parents came from Muslim countries, they were not born here, so that's why we're experiencing it, our kids' kids won't get it because they were born here and their grandparents were born here and their great grandparents were born here so all of a sudden there is no identity crisis; we are Irish and that's the difference...

Not accepted as Irish

In the sections that follow below, recommendations informed by the participants in this study will be proffered as to how this issue of identity crisis can be addressed. It is important to first focus on the manner in which Irish Muslims feel that they are not accepted as Irish. This manifests differently to those more overt hostile and discriminatory experiences discussed earlier which single people out on the basis of their Muslimness. Instead, participants referred to encountering, for example, incredulity when they try to realise their Irishness in social interaction.

> *I think one of the main problems as a student anyway is having an identity crisis, you can't identify as Irish.* [Rabia]

Despite being Irish born and raised, fellow students will...

> *...ask you 'where you're from?' and you go Irish and they'll go 'where are you really from?'* [Sadia]

> *I've tried integrating and I just get pushed back and that's hard...* [Maryam]

The three previous participants are Irish born Muslim women who wear the hijab and all three have strong Irish accents as with all of the participants in this section. There is a sense of frustration in the voices of these young Irish Muslim men and women.

> *I feel, like Hania was saying... people think she's really Irish, I think with my experience, most people wouldn't believe me that I'm Irish and like I don't know, maybe it's just because my colour but they're like 'no I'm not Irish', I'm like yeah, I was born in the Rotunda (laughs); and like yeah it's most of the places I go I'd have to convince them that I'm Irish...* [Zaynab]

Samir was born in Ireland and has been living here his entire life yet...

> *Some of them, like they're telling me... 'oh you're not Irish.' Even like when people ask me a question... 'oh where are you from?' [I respond] Ireland... 'I mean like where are you actually from, you know what I mean?'... So then I have to explain my parents are from here, there, wherever like...*

> *You're living in a country your whole life and then but still they don't see you the way you want to be seen. And like if they're treating you that way then you just feel like you*

shouldn't be in the country, you should be just going somewhere else... [Amr]

You don't know where you belong... but really your identity is Irish... [Samir]

The above comments present an image of Irish society as a diverse society and with, in this case, different ethno-national and religious backgrounds making up the fabric of what the realities of Irishness are today. Research in Ireland with Muslim men and women in particular, has in the past revealed the manner in which those who convert/revert to Islam are perceived as traitors to Ireland and its assumed inherent relationship to Catholicness.[123] Aisha's and the others' perceptions that they are not being accepted as Irish raises questions in terms of what Irishness means in 2016. The literature refers to catchall, historical and exclusionary constructions of Irishness as being made up of white skin colour; heterosexual; born on the island of Ireland; being settled thus excluding members of the Traveller Community; and membership of the Catholic faith.[124] Amaal migrated to Ireland when faced with conflict; she always felt at home in Ireland until experiencing a number of instances of anti-Muslim hostility in one week, now she's not so sure.

Like [this was] the first time I feel strange in Ireland. I used to feel this is my country but then after that I feel like... it's strange. [Amaal]

The voices of participants in this research, bolstered by changes in Census data and the strong support for events such as the marriage referendum, demonstrate that historic perspectives on Irishness may be out-dated, or on the way to being so. It is important then that various institutions in Irish society - social and political - come to reflect the realities of the diverse society that is twenty-first century Ireland. Inclusion and positive representation in socio-political institutions are key in this regard as will be discussed further below.

Vulnerabilities[125]

These feelings of identity crisis and not being accepted as Irish, having to affirm one's Irishness in the course of social interaction, were identified by some participants as an area of vulnerability among Muslim communities. For Zara, experiences of exclusion among young Muslim men and women can serve to push them away to negative effect. At another level, if these experiences of hostility and discrimination are not addressed, Karim fears that people will eventually, out of frustration, take the law into their own hands.

If the nation don't let them feel that they are part of the country, and they are Irish, they will start acting against [it]. It's not going to be good for anybody. It's not going to be good for them. It's not going to be good for the country. Like if you feel that somebody's good with you, he feels that you're a good person and accept you, you try to be good for him; but if you feel you are good for him and he's rejecting you... That's I think, that's what's going to happen... You feel like I didn't do anything wrong, I try to be good like, I'm doing good at study, I'm respecting my teachers... Why they always make me feel like stranger? [Zara]

if [anti-Muslim hostility] continues, if the Gard doesn't take action and the law within the state do not look after this problem, then eventually what will happen is what happened

in the UK and other countries where people who have a fear, or maybe they know they are going to be targeted, like by gangs, start forming gangs [of their own] and then you're going to end up having gang problems; Muslims getting together for protection purpose because the police or the Gards don't provide the protection and the problem will escalate eventually you know in few decades it's going to get worse... [Karim]

Young Irish Muslims need to feel part of Irish society and government must take action to ensure that this is recognised in policy and practice. This is not about integration on the part of young Muslims. The young men and women in the research *are* integrated; they are born and raised in Ireland; they are studying and working across a range of spheres in Irish society. The onus resides on government and other State institutions to meaningfully recognise and mainstream inclusion beyond the realm of "paper policies."[126]

Grooming?

In the past year or so various instances of 'grooming' of young Muslim individuals in the United Kingdom have come under the media spotlight. These have referred to cases involving young British Muslims who have travelled to conflict zones in Syria and Iraq to join different groups.[127] For current purposes it is worth focussing on the fear raised by some participants in this study that young Muslims in Ireland may be targeted for the aforementioned internet grooming. Social media is perceived as particularly problematic in this light, as according to one participant:

Anybody can set up a website and say this is what Islam is and these radicals are doing it so, this is the danger there. [Salah]

Only a small minority of participants felt that young Muslims may be exposed to such grooming practices. Furthermore, any individual, Muslim or otherwise, may be more or less exposed to such targeting practices. However, the risk that is posed to individuals, from the perspectives of participants is amplified when people are excluded from Irish society through, for example, the experiences of anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination discussed above, or if they are the target of sensationalist media or political discourses; especially in the context of election campaigns. For Farhad the stigmatisation of young Muslims in Ireland feeds into the narrative propagated by groups such as Daesh who wish to attract people to their cause.

The problem is those lunatic so called 'Islamists' preying on people... [in the context of the refugee crisis] if you analyse the situation... there is an audience and there is a political hunger for this kind of [anti-migrant discourse]; so for him [politician] to get into the power he needs to satisfy this kind of agendas and he knows clearly inside of him that the problem is not this [migration] people but he wants to... gain more votes... However, the consequences on our youth and I will say it, is getting radicalised. Those people preying, even locally or on the internet they say, 'listen we told you guys, those non-Muslim leaders... they hate you, they don't want you or whatever. Come we give you comfort; come and join us, with us you reach salvation... you're one of us.'... That's why you see teenagers from the UK taking the plane going all the way to Syria going all the way, they getting brainwashed because they didn't find whatever they, that kind of a

comfort that kind of integrity, that kind of sense of being part of the society in the UK. So those people through the internet or face to face, they're preying on them and bringing them all the way to Iraq so this is something that can happen in the future... [Farhad]

Susan: and then there's the political reality you know, places like Syria, I do know people who have gone out there...
Sadia: But they're so few, they're so few. I don't think that's a problem, I think... the bigger problem is the way we're viewed in the media, not what happens in Ireland or whatever and that automatically translates to the youth that anything in the West hates us. Whether it's American media or British media or whatever, the West hate us and as a result they grow up with that...

The latter point of Farhad's contribution above in relation to the future is important, as is the exchange between Susan and Sadia. Participants do not state that this is a problem already. While it is reported that approximately thirty people have travelled to Syria and Iraq from Ireland, at less than half a per cent of the total Muslim population in Ireland, these numbers are vanishingly small.[128] Moreover, while travelling to such conflict zones could mean engaging in combat, it could also mean joining the local humanitarian effort. The point is that government must act now, not in a context of security policies but through implementing meaningful policy measures related to inclusion as iterated above; that is, if the voices of Muslim men and women, those closest to the issue, are to be listened to.

The next two sections of this report mark a change in tenor to focus on some of the more positive experiences of participants starting with what Ireland and in particular Dublin means to Irish Muslims. From here, examples of good practice in terms of inclusion, particularly in the workplace will be elaborated upon. These will, in part, form the basis for policy and practice recommendations discussed in the latter stages of this report.

Section 6: Home and Experiences of Good Practice

Dublin – Ireland

Despite the feelings of exclusion and confusion in terms of belonging, participants revealed a deep bond with Ireland and the city of Dublin revealing the complexity of social interaction in this research. All of those who took part in this research live in Dublin and come from across the city and surrounding suburbs. Each of the focus groups and interviews ended with the simple question: what does Dublin mean to you. The word home was repeated by different participants: Ireland is home to an estimated sixty-five thousand Muslim men, women and children. Here are some of the responses.

> *Salah: Dublin is home, to me it's home, definitely*
> *Mehmet: Definitely, of course it is home…*
> *Jaaved: Yeah, of course, it's home…*
> *Salah: Dublin is the place I love the most, in the whole world, if I go to Pakistan, I want to be back in Dublin…*
> *Mehmet: ….I would be like up the Dubs…*

Similarly for Amr and Mohammed:

> *Amr: To be honest, when I go away I actually miss Dublin. It's my home. I feel, like I've been living here my whole life…I feel like I belong here…*
> *Mohammed: You're part of it…*
>
> *We feel safe here you know. Like I feel safer here, to be honest with you… more than [COUNTRY of ORIGIN]…* [Moosa]
>
> *I tell you James, when we went to my country for the holiday, summer, you know, we really feel missed Ireland, we want back to Ireland, we feel [Ireland] is my country now. I missed Ireland, I missed the weather, I missed the people… when I arrive at the airport I feel oh my God I am home…* [Nahla]

One particular interview with Fatima really revealed the importance of Dublin and Ireland as home. A friend recently made a short film about Dublin. Here is how Fatima responded to seeing it:

> *…they had cameras around Dublin. People didn't know the cameras were there. And it shows, it was on Moore Street, on the Ha'Penny Bridge, it was. When I saw that I got goose bumps. Then I thought to myself I'm really Irish. I really am, because when I saw these places I was like: Ohh Dublin is amazing, you know… I feel honestly and I'm not saying this for any interview purposes and I'm not saying this to sound cheesy but I really do feel home, you know. Even when I was coming back to Dublin I was like: Ohh, finally I'm going home, home, you know. It's something automatic, I said: Ohh, I'm going back home because this is where like, this is me. I am. Like, I've so many memories in Dublin*

as a child as in college... I go back [to University] and say hi, just say hi because this is the part of me. This is what has created me. I, honestly, I am who I am because of being here [in Dublin].

Experiences of Good Practice

The following quotes refer to experiences of good practice in different spheres of social interaction, namely: when accessing employment; in employment; and in education. These examples of experiences are united in that there is a recognition of and positive engagement with diversity and, in this case, Muslim communities and their ability to manifest and practice their faith in a welcoming environment. In each instance, the quotes below provide simple yet incredibly important examples of how employers and educational institutions can create an inclusive environment in the work/education context.

Accessing Employment

Hania: I applied for a job, and it was the only job I actually applied for. I got an interview and then they called me back again, they wanted me to give a presentation. So I went back again, they called me for a third time... and they told me that I got the job...

JC: Did they ever ask you about the headscarf or anything?

Hania: They actually, in the interview, when they offered me the job they asked me 'we've never actually had any Muslim before so this is something new to us which is like, they were this is pretty cool', but I was like OK?? And they [asked] 'is there anything we need to know about you??... Is there anything we can do to kind of help you or you know make your experience better here?' I was like just 'give me a prayer room and that'll be fine'... I was so impressed... at that stage I was like they're actually the nicest people ever because you know I've been to a lot of interviews especially during my internships and stuff, they've never asked me anything like that; 'do you need something', you know 'you're Muslim is there any like' and they have no knowledge of Islam so like they're asking... They started asking me about prayers and then we got... a whole discussion about that and fasting; and during Ramadan they gave me time off, so they let me go home an hour earlier just kind of... because they knew that we were breaking our fast at 10pm...

In Employment

about... prayer at work; I used to work for a company called XXXX and a company called XXXX I asked them for a prayer place, they gave it to me, they gave it to me; there was one room in fact, one of the companies they said this is the seminar room, you know whenever it's free use it. Fantastic and in both companies I asked them to get off on Fridays and I would work on Thursday or other working days for longer, so instead of four or five o'clock I would go home at six o'clock, that was granted as well. So every Friday I was working only half a day and until 12; normally I would work until five or four because I'd start at eight so the four days I would Monday, Tuesday, Wednesday, Thursday work that extra hour, give and take there. [Salah]

...we were like ten Muslims all from the same area, guys from Somalia and all, actually we were all employed almost at the same time. At that time they provided us with a place to pray as well. Imagine, imagine then that time [mid-90s] at work, at that point, I ask for half day for salat-a-jumma, Friday prayers, they even gave us... they said on your expense... we dock you through your wages. So on Fridays, at half eleven we were allowed go home... [Moosa]

Moosa continues....

...my wife in the mid-90s, she started working in [civil society organisation] she works in the office, she told them I'm a Muslim, at a certain time I have to pray and they didn't have any problems with that. Until now she even comes from X STREET every Friday you know during her break time, during her lunch break... for the last 11/12 years now, probably 15 years I don't know; I think the Irish people when it comes to religion they are very flexible...

Work is not restricted just to the immediate location, the social aspect of work also occurs off-site. This is also an area for consideration for employers if they are to build a vibrant, inclusive team ethos in the work space. Hania again...

Nights out, it's like boring, they know I don't drink...I'd go for the meals yeah and just show my face just so they know that we do socialise but they understand after that like, it's totally cool... 'We know you don't drink there's no point,' like they say there's no point in my being there. And even like with the whole, when they're trying to organise a girls night out, basically all it was dinner and the cinema and... to cater for everyone, to get everyone on board coming out and everyone liked it.

Aadil recalls his similarly inclusive experiences at work:

...my new job that I've been for the last month and a half, two months. And, we just been through Ramadan. And I'm the first Muslim to join the team and my manager, he knew that I was fasting and he saw people around me eat... he called me on to the side, it was like two weeks after starting, and he said: do you want me to speak to the rest of the team and ask not to eat in front of you. I was just blown away because I've never had that sort of consideration... So, in any case, I said it's absolutely fine, I just laughed it off and said that's no problem.

In Education
Karim's comment below underscores the need, discussed in part above, for educational institutions to be inclusive in their policies in a context where the international student/education market is an important economic consideration.[129]

...Universities provide the… place for the prayer in [A UNIVERSITY in Dublin] I asked for one and they gave me free hand to go and plan it; and I planned it and they done it, but it's within their good interest as well so because they are bringing people from the middle east and they can say 'listen we have a prayer room for you guys,' Muslims… so it suited them... [Karim]

Lecturers like, I know Friday prayer I never want to miss Friday prayers, so I used to have a class that used to clash with the Friday prayers, so I emailed the lecturer and explained to him that I'm Muslim and I need to pray Friday prayers, so, if I leave the class I'm going to make sure that I leave quietly and come back quietly, I won't be disturbing the class. He said yeah that's no problem do whatever you need to do and you can join back to class... [Amr]

These vignettes of experience will be drawn on again later in this report when discussing recommendations for positive policy and practice strategies to be developed by the Immigrant Council of Ireland and others. In what follows, the voices of participants will elaborate on what and how they feel the Immigrant Council of Ireland can do to positively support them in the challenge against anti-Muslim racism in Ireland.

Section 7: Challenging anti-Muslim racism: Participants' perspectives

As noted at the outset, this research study is premised on four sub-questions. The first two of these have been addressed above – that is we have developed our understanding of experiences of anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination in Dublin. The rest of this report will address the remaining two questions:

1. Listen to the voices of Muslim individuals and community representatives to identify shared themes of preferred actions and supports in the face of anti-Muslim racism.
2. Identify how the Immigrant Council can work with Muslim communities to effect change at the social and political level.

The following sections will detail participants' suggestions in terms of the campaigns, advocacy, supports and training that the Immigrant Council could provide in order to challenge anti-Muslim racism in Dublin and beyond. These will form the basis for recommendations which are presented below. It must be stressed that from the outset, this research has sought to act as a channel for the voices and perspectives of Muslim women and men to emerge. The researcher and the broader Immigrant Council of Ireland organisation does not claim to be speaking for Muslim communities.[130]

Campaigns: Challenging stereotypes

There is a desire by all parties involved in this research to ensure that anti-Muslim racism in Dublin and Ireland is challenged. Participants had different views in this regard. However, there was consensus that there was a need, among other measures, for the creation of a counter-narrative to the construction of Muslim identities present in popular, political and media discourses, nationally and internationally; a counter-narrative that challenges the all too pervasive negative stereotypes of Muslim communities – and their effects. The comments below illustrate how Muslim people internalise the manner in which they are constructed as 'Other'; an important way forward is to challenge these constructions of difference through raising awareness that Muslim men and women are part of Irish society and how a recognition of this will go some way to challenging negative perceptions of Muslim communities.

> …*we're not those bad people, you know*. [Fatima]

> *Here, I feel like there is that whole [perception], you know, stereotype that Muslims haven't integrated fully…* [Hania]

> …*We're not what people say we are, we're just like normal people… make it available to people…* [Aisha]

> *I think Immigrant Council, first of all you see, the community, the Muslim community, first and foremost is to make the larger community kind of understand that [Muslim] people, they are not different, they are them; they are part of this country, they are part of the community, they are Irish citizens… the second thing, after that, a campaign is important; a campaign to create awareness, who are Muslims? What is Islam? Because people have, as I said the perception you, you want to make sure that you basically get rid of that wrong perception and tell them the reality so for that, campaign to create awareness, what is Islam, who are Muslims; now, Muslims in Ireland…* [Salah]

The perspective shared in the last comment is important in that it makes a distinction between the types of messages campaigns should communicate. First, there is a need to raise awareness of the fact that Muslim communities are already part of Irish society. There may be migrants arriving from different parts of the world, some of whom are Muslim; however the fact remains that recognition that Muslim men and women are already a vibrant part of Irish society needs to be communicated in a campaign format. Secondly, awareness campaigns need to bring to the fore who Irish Muslims are, what they do etc.; the 'normal' sort of things discussed further below. Not all participants felt that these campaigns need to refer to Islam but should be more about Muslims as people. Nonetheless, information on the faith of Islam, the diversity within the faith, would also be useful given that research demonstrates that often the only sources people may have on Islam are media.[131]

Campaign Ideas: Retelling racism?

While there was consensus in the need to challenge negative perceptions of Muslim communities through public campaigns, the same cannot be said about discussing experiences of anti-Muslim racism. Participants were asked if they would like to see public awareness campaigns that directly raise the realities of anti-Muslim racism, for example by sharing some of the quotes documented in this research in high profile media campaigns.

The Immigrant Council of Ireland has a long record of generating, designing and implementing campaigns that aim to encourage the reporting of racism; indeed, these campaigns were readily recognised and recalled by some of the participants. When shown an image of the Immigrant Council of Ireland's "There's No Room for Racism" campaign publicised throughout local Dublin and national public transport Samir and Amr agreed that campaigns such as this, that directly address racism, were positive, may deter racism and indeed provided reassurance that:

> Samir: They're doing something… Every time I see the word racism oh it's got to do with me, let me just read it…
> Amr: Yeah…
> JC: Would it make you nervous??
> Samir: No, I feel like, oh they've done something, like I feel a part of that like, in a way, but the person that's beside me reading that as well is he going to see me as black and not actually do racism by reading that? Or, I don't know like…

However, this perspective was in the minority. The majority of participants felt that 'retelling racism' could be counterproductive by making people, Muslim or members of groups targeted with racism, feel insecure through the sharing of other people's experiences; experiences which they may not have heard of before, thus making them self-conscious and defensive. Moreover, as one Muslim woman put it, she did not "want to be promoted as vulnerable" [Fatima].

> …if you are making campaign [retelling racism], people will feel… if I have not experienced anything and people share this experience with me in the local [community]… again I'm feeling insecure to be honest. [Maria]

I don't want to be promoted as someone who is vulnerable. Because when [you] show people that we're vulnerable then they'll treat us in a way... It could be good and bad... I don't want to be treated like I'm someone special, because I'm not. I'm just a human, you know. And if we talk about our experiences, if I tell people, I don't like telling people my experiences I've had simply because I don't like people being sympathetic. I don't want empathy, I just want to be treated as a normal person, simply, you know. [Fatima]

I think if you go on the racism angle then we have to go on the defence and we have to explain ourselves and it becomes a debate for discussion... but if you're campaigning the normalcy of being a Muslim living, then there is no question to be had no debate to be told this is it, this is life and that's what we are like. [Sadia]

The notion of creating a debate in the context of stereotypical representations could be counter-productive as the end result may be ordinary Muslim men and women having to 'answer' for groups such as Daesh which they have nothing in common with. Instead of discussing issues related to them they again end up being a representative for an entire religion and everyone therein, reinforcing homogenising images of Muslim communities. The last two comments are telling in that both refer to the importance of campaigns of normalcy, of the everyday.

Campaign Ideas: 'Doing everyday'
The preceding quotes evidence a need for campaigns that focus on the 'normalcy' of Muslimess. The otherwise mundane, for example the shared realities of being a parent, a student, being a football fan etc. activities and identities that are common in Irish society. The below vignettes elaborate on participants' perspectives that Muslims be represented in campaigns that humanise; campaigns that present the realities of Muslim men, women and children as 'everyday people'. Campaigns such as these would meet those racialising discourses that dehumanise Muslim communities head on by instead emphasising diversity as opposed to homogeneity, common humanity instead of difference.

We're Muslims, we are not different species, you know. And that's really, really important. And when people see that you are kind of normal people... We eat the same food they eat, or maybe slightly different food. And you know, you go to work and have the same lunch time. It's, we are not different species and I think that's really important because with what's going on in media... somehow we may... [all be] labelled with terrorist mark. [Aadil]

...I think every, well for me anyway, I think every day Muslim; just saying, quoting something... just say for example I dunno... quoting something about the religion, their name and like you know whatever DIT, UCD, DCU [student].... whatever... or engineer or fire fighters just something so people say 'aw well, they're human as well'... we don't have to advertise the fact... like we're not gonna say 'Muslim firefighter.' We're just gonna [say instead] Mohammed, 43, firefighter. People are gonna know straight away that he's a Muslim but they're gonna emphasise... this guy, this bloke, is a normal average lad. He's a normal guy... [Jamaal]

…just normalise Muslims, we are not aliens (laughter) or monsters… 'so you are like us' like that [was said] after a big conversation I have with colleagues, 'so you are like us' I said yeah we are… [Zara]

…kids growing up just to see 'oh yeah I saw something that on TV her wearing a hijab;' if I see a girl in the supermarket tomorrow wearing the hijab 'oh I seen something like that on TV, it's normal' [Mohammed]

…I wouldn't like to be promoted as someone who is: oh my God yeah, she is Muslim. I don't want that. I'm human, I work, I, I live, I eat, I drink, I drive, I'm human. Just simply a different faith that's all. [Maryam]

The other thing I think in the media they should have more programmes about Muslims, the good things; because they always show negative things that Muslim are always bad or something bad going on in their countries, different countries; but there's, even in Ireland there's so many professional Muslims and who are doing so well and they helping the communities and they're being working… Like we've been here 24 years and my husband, he is a professional and he is a workaholic and he has helped so many people and he loves this country… he thinks this is home and for my children they think that this is home… so there are so many people who are doing so much for the community, for Ireland that they should be recognised. [Tasmina]

The latter point raised by Tasmina is important, denoting as it does the contribution that Muslim communities make to Irish society. This point resonates with the argument above that Muslim men and women in Irish society are already integrated and this needs to be recognised. However, it is important to note that when we are discussing the contribution of any person or group in Ireland we do not do this in the context of their economic worth, this is not what Tasmina is referring to here, nor is it the aim of this research to take such a position.

A final point to note in this section on campaigns is that there may be room for both explicitly anti-racism campaigns and those that speak to everyday experiences common to all people. Certainly this was the perspective of one participant:

If you get the two [campaign types] together under the one thing… kind of mesh them together and try to show people what do you want to cancel out… put the two positive and normal and our daily life together, to be aware of the negative… rather than just show the positive [alone]… [Maria]

This point raised by Maria is an important consideration. Racism needs to be called out for what it is; to fail to do so is to perpetuate 'blindness' towards racism, that racism is not a problem for our society, that we all have equal chance of discrimination or hostility. Such discourses are at best a code for governmental unwillingness to address racism as a pernicious phenomenon; at worst, indicative of state racism.[132]

Campaign Ideas: Working within Muslim Communities

The aforementioned campaigns focus very much on challenging anti-Muslim stereotypes and create a counter-narrative of what it is to be Muslim in the Irish context and abroad. There was also, in addition to these 'external' campaigns, an evident need to raise awareness among Muslim communities in terms of their rights and how they may go about, for example, reporting anti-Muslim racism and to whom. These campaigns may go beyond simple media campaigns in isolation to include personal outreach on the part of the Immigrant Council of Ireland to Muslim communities.

> One idea for example that the Immigrant Council prints flyers and leaflets you know, 'have you been a victim of anti-Islamic sentiments'… put them in the mosques, put them on the organiser and this is another way of doing it and people can contact the Immigrant Council rather than contacting the mosques; but the mosques kind of facilitate, kind of provide the platform or the mosque could organise that, when people want to report, they could report it to the Immigrant Council but, rather than in the offices of the Immigrant Council, a representative of the Immigrant Council would for example visit the mosque for a consultation hour or whatever… [Salah]

> You know if they set up any posters in the mosque and they are not there, even person who is going there, if I am not meeting their representative, that poster is there, that's their representative and it is written 'if you have any problems you can contact them', people there will be more incident reporting… [Maria]

Mary refers to the need for any such campaigns to reach out to the communities in as broad and as deep a sense as possible because:

> I think you're really only touching the tip of the iceberg here because anyone that's here [in this discussion] is quite articulate; we seem to, we all seem to have like an Irish background and educated and everything like that, but, even if you go to the [Muslim women's group meetings] you see the amount of women there that they don't, they wouldn't know how to access their [rights], the language barrier and…

In sum, drawing on the voices of participants, there is a need for raising awareness of the rights of Muslim men and women vis-à-vis experiences of hostility and discrimination; how one can access these rights as well as report their experiences; and finally outreach on the part of civil society organisations and partners that delves deep into Muslim communities to reach those who may be most in the dark in terms of rights and supports. The research is in many ways indicative of what is required: strong and widespread interaction with Muslim communities, identifying their needs and requirements from the perspectives of those who need them most. Whatever format these campaigns take, they should involve the building of strong relationships and result in sustainable practices.

A note on the following recommendations

As noted at the outset, this research study is premised on four sub-questions; two of which focus on participants' views on responding to anti-Muslim racism and the role that the Immigrant Council can fulfil in this regard. However, the findings revealed in this study demonstrate that the challenge to Islamophobia

and anti-Muslim racism in Ireland is greater than any one organisation. While referred at times in this report as an exemplar civil society organisation, the recommendations presented here are not limited to initiatives that the Immigrant Council could take. For the challenge against Islamophobia and anti-Muslim racism to be successful there is a need for a broad range of organisations derived from civil society, the State, academia, Muslim representative groups and individuals to work, whether on their own initiative or as part of a coalition, to make sure that the recommendations presented here become a reality. Indeed, a first step could arguably be the formation of a coalition, derived from the aforementioned list of actors, which would work together as a united front against Islamophobia and anti-Muslim racism in Ireland.

In terms of substantive recommendations, participants' suggestions centred on: awareness raising campaigns, advocacy, supports and training that civil society organisations, academic partners and State bodies and Muslim communities could work to develop in order to challenge anti-Muslim racism in Dublin and beyond. These suggestions form the basis for recommendations presented here.

Recommendation 1: Raising awareness
Awareness raising campaigns: Media
- Develop public media campaigns that increase the visibility of Muslim men and women in Ireland – such as those already undertaken with Dublin public transport providers by the Immigrant Council.
- When developing these campaigns the focus should be on the normalcy of being Muslim in Irish society; these campaigns do not have to discuss Islam or even refer explicitly to the religious aspect of those included – for example 'Mohammed, 43 firefighter' as proffered below.
- Relatedly, these campaigns should emphasise the diversity of Muslim identities in Irish society – thus challenging ideas of Muslim homogeneity.
- New campaigns should not necessarily focus on people's experiences of anti-Muslim racism as this sends a message of vulnerability and may increase fear.

Awareness raising campaigns: Events
- Organise social/sporting events – some participants held high praise for initiatives run by Sport Against Racism Ireland and in particular its award winning Hijabs and Hat-tricks campaign.[133] Initiatives such as this were perceived as vital in creating a context for positive interaction and shared understanding and should be extended.
- Organise public lectures and seminars with Muslim partners, academics, and/or community based partners and civil society organisations on the topic of Muslim communities in Ireland.

Awareness raising campaigns: Muslim communities and their rights
- Raise awareness among Muslim communities as to where and how people can report experiences of anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination.
- Raise awareness among Muslim communities of their legal rights vis-à-vis anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination.
    - Raising awareness of one's rights may be best facilitated through the medium of coffee mornings and other informal gatherings that are already run regularly by Muslim community groups.

Training and Support

Public awareness campaigns that aim to address the anti-Muslim stereotypes are one part of a variety of ideas and suggestions that participants raised during the context of this research. During the interviews and discussion groups participants also highlighted how civil society organisations and partners may be able to support Muslim communities through training and support.

Media & Muslims

To briefly recap, participants' perspectives of the media were predominantly negative to the point that some felt there is a media agenda targeting Muslim communities and that all media outlets care about is selling copy. Differing perspectives emerged in this research in relation to whether or not Muslim communities should respond, through the media or otherwise, in the aftermath of international events such as the attacks at Charlie Hedbo or in Tunisia earlier in 2015. In one instance, a representative of one Muslim organisation in particular noted how despite condemning international terrorism on their website and releasing press statements repeating this condemnation these were not being picked up and acted upon by mainstream media. It is worth noting again:

> *But why it's always come and announce it; you announce it once, twice, three times you don't feel because when you condemn it all the time you feel you are the criminal, but we as a Muslim you are not a criminal; something happened outside our state it's not here. You condemn it once, you explain it to the people… the media comes why did you not announce it?… Why do I announce it all the time?? We have a website, we issue statement if there's any killing and you cannot keep all the time doing this… [Tariq]*

It is worth underscoring that some people did not feel they should respond to terrorist attacks claimed in the name of 'Islam' as these acts have nothing to do with vast majority of Muslims in Ireland and abroad. Despite this there is clear evidence of pressure being applied to Muslim representative organisations to respond to these issues. Furthermore, some people did feel that representative organisations should respond:

> *JC: Should they [representative organisations] come out?*
> *Karim: Oh they must, in our view they must because they are crimes, they are against humanity, they are against the teachings of Islam and by them going silent and not talking about it… not just mention in it in maybe Friday prayer, or, you know within the mosque, they should go out very clearly to the media to the Irish media and make it very blunt and clear denunciation… pulling Islam away from such crimes… I feel if that we have a Muslim leader here it's his or her responsibility to come out unequivocally at each time and defend and protect and do everything that's within the best interest of the Muslim community otherwise they are actually not doing their job…*

Some Muslim groups in Dublin were having particular success in getting their messages of condemnation across to various media fora – including broadcast, print and new social media. There was a feeling among some participants that training in the area of media engagement and relationship building is something that civil society organisations and academic partners could assist them with; and that through such training the

Muslim communities would be better equipped to engage with media actors, if they choose to do so. As the following comments reflect, media engagement is perceived as vital by participants in the area of public relations.

> I personally believe that we are lacking some PR, some proper PR and it would, I personally suggest that we need to have a proper PR department whereby formed by people who are born in our own generation; second or third generation born here. Why? Because they're born here they know this society, intellectual and I even propose that they, to do a monthly meeting with the media. [Farhad]

Recommendation 2: Media Training

- Training and support: Media engagement: civil society organisations and academic partners should work with Muslim communities specifically on the subject of media engagement; providing people with the tools and the knowhow of how to respond and engage with media outlets in relation to issues concerning the communities.
- Any training provided should not be restricted to people working in specific centres or mosques but made available to Muslim men and women interested in this area. This would encourage and open access for a wide range of voices to reach media outlets; not the same 'go to' people that are repeatedly contacted by the media for issues relating to Muslim communities.

Psycho-social Supports

Academics and community organisations have long called for improved data collection of anti-Muslim racism and other forms of racism in the Irish context, particularly in the aftermath of the State closure of the National Consultative Committee on Racism and Interculturalism.[134] There is also a need to go beyond the collection of reports of anti-Muslim racism and the collation of data. As it currently stands, people who experience anti-Muslim racism are by and large left to their own devices in terms of emotional support. There is clearly a gap wherein civil society organisations, with partners, could help in formalising support mechanisms among communities. The following quotes demonstrate how people are currently getting support informally from other community members. These supports may be offered in a more general context:

> When we sit in the communities, Muslim community, in the mosque, we talk about what's happening so people they talk about themselves… What we hear from my friends in the community you know, ah, anti-Muslims is everywhere, even in Muslim countries… so anti-Muslim is not [only] in Europe, it's everywhere… at the end of the prayer you sit together and you know… we deal in the psychological way also… Friday prayer is group therapy… the people come into to the mosque and will go outside very glad… when he stay outside he gets a lot of problems… anything that feels better to release it instead of keeping it, it's harming, that is always true; when we sit we talk we let him to say what he needs all, after that we negotiate… [Osa]

…Or in a more specific manner with sessions dedicated to women for example:

…like even once a week we can come and sit and talk, we need that… [Khadija]

In both examples, these are informal gatherings wherein people can share their experiences of anti-Muslim racism as well as other emotional stressors that they may be experiencing. Gatherings of this sort may or may not be happening across communities. This needs to be mapped. In the absence of formal support mechanisms there is space for civil society organisations and partners to work with Muslim communities for example in organising, supporting and disseminating these practices. Furthermore, the Immigrant Council has established connections with bodies that provide emotional support to men and women. These contacts, as well as those within academia and partner organisations, offer other potential avenues for support that are worth exploring in future work.

Recommendation 3: Psycho-social support
- Civil society organisations and partners should engage directly with members of Muslim communities to help identify/provide platforms through which those who are the target of anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination can be supported in dealing with their experiences.
- This will require further research in terms of:
    - Charting in more definitive terms, what kinds of supports are already in operation among Muslim communities.
    - Mapping the possibilities of how this support may manifest, working with Muslim communities.

Advocate and Interlocutor

In addition to providing these 'hands on' supports, interview and focus group discussions also highlighted other means through which civil society organisations and partners can help Muslim communities challenge anti-Muslim racism. These primarily require civil society organisations, working in conjunction with Muslim communities, to act as a partner-advocate for Muslim issues. Established civil society organisations have access to experience, institutional knowledge and networks that can offer Muslim communities an additional means to have their voices heard at a national level. The following subsections arose during this research and identify areas wherein civil society organisations and partners can play an active role, working with Muslim communities, to challenge anti-Muslim racism.

Building on Good Practice: At/accessing employment
As noted above, while this research has documented experiences of anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination in Dublin, there is also evidence of good practice, particularly in the context of in/or looking for work. By way of reminder, here is Hania again:

> *…in the interview, when they offered me the job they asked me, 'we've never actually had any Muslim before so this is something new to us… is there anything we need to know about you?… is there anything we can do to kind of help you or you know make your experience better here?'*

Participants referred to being offered prayer facilities at work, flexibility in relation to time for prayers, and in particular for Friday prayers. Employers in this context recognise that their practices may not be inclusive

for a more diverse society, as demonstrated in the comment above. Civil society organisations could play an important role, working with Muslim communities in Ireland to disseminate guidelines on good practice amongst employers, employer organisations and of course employee representative groups. The Muslim Council of Britain previously published a document for employers/employees specifically for the UK context.[135] The issues it deals with include legal requirements; recruitment; and organisational culture among others. A similar document, based on the evidence presented here and in previous research, is required in the Irish context.[136] Civil society organisations, working as neutral arbiters and partners are in a strong position to assist in the drafting and production of a document that is informed by the perspectives of all Muslim communities in Ireland as opposed to being aligned with any particular aspect of Islam.

Another point relating to employers is that of training. This research has documented the manner in which security staff in the retail context 'single out', profile, Muslim men and women and members of other minority communities for extra surveillance. This research cannot determine if this is based on employers' directives or an artefact of the security industry culture. Either way this has to stop.

The contributions of participants above also highlight the manner in which people experience discrimination at/looking for work from potential/actual employers and colleagues. Ireland is an increasingly diverse society; discrimination in the workplace must be challenged and employers must be reminded of their obligations to staff and potential employees. The opening quote in this section highlights a positive, engaging stance by an employer and this should be encouraged more widely. While more research is required, civil society organisations are positioned to engage with the issues discussed here, in particular through working with employers and their representative groups to ensure that staff are trained appropriately; that diversity is welcomed and discrimination challenged.

Recommendation 4: At/accessing employment
- Civil society organisations and partners should engage with an inclusive range of Muslim representative bodies to draft a good practice guide for employers. This should focus on the recognition and facilitation of the needs of Muslim employees set to a legal requirement context.
- An engagement with employers/employer representative bodies should be undertaken to raise awareness of, and, challenge discrimination in the workspace. This may take the form of publicity campaigns or the drafting of employer policy documents/pledges that:
  - Challenge discrimination by staff towards customers and colleagues.
  - Remind employers of their obligations vis-à-vis legislative obligations.
  - Disseminate examples of good practice undertaken by employers in relation to diversity recognition.

Good Practice: Media Inclusion
The importance of the role played by the media in constructing and maintaining stereotypes of Muslimness was clearly understood in the words of the participants. Participants demonstrated a distrust of the media; perceived the media as having an agenda; that the media dealt only in stereotypes of Muslim communities that serve to homogenise and eschew diversity. All the while, there is a concomitant lack of representations of Muslims in the Irish media which engages with their lives as 'everyday' citizens. These findings suggest

two approaches that civil society organisations and partners can and should pursue with media actors: the encouragement of a nuanced recognition of Muslim diversity; and the inclusion of Muslim men and women in various media productions in the Irish context that highlights their active role in Irish society.

> *…in the media television in the radio they [Immigrant Council] need to speak to, to make meetings with the presenters of the TV and radio because sometimes, like, the very famous presenters say somethings that should not be said and they have a lot of fans and they will be, they will be affected a lot by… so awareness all levels…* [Zara]

> *…If they can influence the media, if they can influence that don't say whenever somebody blows up or somebody comes up, don't say, you know 'the Muslim 25 year old Muslim blew,' I don't know, just say '25 year old Libyan or Nigerian or whatever it is…' They should not associate in the media they should avoid, you know not mention the word Muslim just for the fact it's Muslim…* [Karim]

> *…I think we need some guys in Immigrant [Council] to speak to media… especially when there is a problem, say for example we don't wish but happens against attack in Rome, London, Iraq, ISIS so the media would concentrate about Islam the Muslims doing that and every Muslim should be in suspicion. So I suggest that if someone comes to talk to the media to say they [ISIS e.g.] don't represent everybody…* [Saad]

The issue of inclusion in the media is another interesting point. There are very few Muslim men and women, indeed possibly none, in the context of news reporting or other Irish specific media contexts. Inclusion in such settings would go some way towards humanising Irish Muslim communities in a highly accessible context. This is not an issue that is isolated to Muslim communities in Ireland but also encompasses non-Muslim 'racial' minorities as well.

> *…even in the media, to show Muslim faces, Irish Muslim faces; I mean I've been saying this about African communities, you know in Irish TV, you hardly see any you know African and there are so many Africans with lovely Irish accent, many of them are my students here, they go to colleges and when they speak I mean if you speak with them on the phone you wouldn't imagine that it's a coloured person… such people to give them some kind of media attention maybe you know even in small roles but at least that. People that watch the TV media, media makes minds, media changes people's hearts, minds; so they'll know ok, you know it's not only the white Irish people, you know the white native Irish now…* [Salah]

> *…you never see Muslims on TV if it's not about Islam, or a documentary on Islam… if you were to get a Muslim, or even just like a group of people to do some sort of a programme, it doesn't have to be on the religion just to show that they're normal people…* [Rabia]

In addition to just simple inclusion, there needs to be a diversity of voices heard. As noted, participants referred to the same Muslim spokespeople being given access to the media as representatives of Muslim communities. This was felt to be restrictive:

There should be like a media pack [for media actors] about Islam and about different Muslim leaders or Islamic leaders including people like XXXX XXXX because I think they interview the same types of people all the time and so conversation becomes very polarised around people... [Aleena]

Recommendation 5: Media Inclusion

- Established civil society organisations should use their influence and engage with various media actors to encourage a greater recognition of Muslim diversity and lay a challenge down to the production of stereotypes of Muslimness in Irish media. The use of language by media producers must be addressed so that terms such as 'Muslim' and 'Islam' are not further stigmatised in contemporary discourse through their association with particular acts; where people do commit acts 'in the name of Islam,' which does happen, the diversity of Muslim communities and opinions therein must be underscored, not side-lined.

- The RTE documentary, Baz: The Lost Muslim is a good example of how inclusion, and recognition, of diversity can be made manifest in Irish media.[137] However, this is a 'one off'. Inclusion must be mainstreamed so that the diversity of Irish society is reflected as a matter of course in Irish media – reading the news, the weather forecast for example.

- Civil society organisations should advocate for the inclusion of a greater range of Muslim men and women's voices in mainstream domestically produced media content. Civil society organisations such as the Immigrant Council cannot and do not claim to speak for Muslim communities in Ireland but they could act as a conduit for greater inclusion.

Good Practice: Policing

There is a need for the development of anti-profiling and in general anti-racism training within An Garda Síochána. This is not to deny the very good work currently undertaken by members of An Garda Síochána in community relations. Previous researches demonstrate the good work of members of the service and the bad.[138] The findings presented here also demonstrate the negative interactions that members of Muslim communities can experience; be they in the context of being singled out for special attention or through the perception, held by some participants in this research, that Gardaí will offer preferential treatment to those they perceive as Irish – An Garda Síochána have to police all Irish communities professionally. Osa puts it in simple terms:

...what we want, the law, the police; the police here has to do its job, has to care... instead of [being] against you...

It's complex, it's because they lost that trust... they know if they go report it the Gardaí will do nothing now, so that kind of trust, kind of connection between those people getting abused and the Gardaí is lost. There is a disconnection there... [Farhad]

Recommendation 6: Inclusive policing

- Trusting relationships need to be built between Muslim communities and An Garda Síochána. Civil society organisations could act as interlocutors, providing a neutral platform from which members

of Muslim communities, representatives and otherwise, can interact with An Garda Síochána and develop trust. Indeed, it cannot be just Muslim community representatives that are involved, they often have good relationships with local Gardaí;[139] the focus should be on engaging the 'average' Muslim man or woman.

- Civil society organisations should explore possibilities of delivering training to the staff of An Garda Síochána on the topics of racial/ethnic/religious profiling; and, in the area of challenging all racisms among Garda staff.

Good Practice: Education

In the education context, as demonstrated above, Muslim parents and children face discriminatory practices when it comes to school enrolment, particularly but not necessarily only in the area of secondary schools. In relation to young Irish Muslims in the education system, this research and others demonstrate that they can experience discriminatory, unprofessional, indeed racist practices at the hands of staff.[140] In addition, young Irish Muslims also face hostility from their peers who target them on their basis of their Muslimness. Participants were clear in this study in terms of what could be done to ameliorate the experiences of young Muslims in Ireland in the education sector and how the civil society organisations could be of assistance. Suggestions referred to civil society organisations working with partners to design and implement training modules for the continuous professional development of in-service teachers; this would mirrored by a similar model in the pre-service training context. A central part of this, given the prevalence of anti-Muslim tropes would ensure that issues relating to Muslim communities would be given the attention required, not overlooked as some participants felt was currently the case. In order to challenge anti-Muslim racism at the level of younger children, participants also suggested that modules/training would be delivered to school-going youth about Muslim communities and Islam. This need not necessarily be done in the context of religious education but instead where the focus is on diversity and indeed the 'sameness' of Muslims and non-Muslims.

> *I believe in the school whatever, they don't mention about Islam... they don't talk at all about it, you know what I mean. So they have to put something... small subject to the kids you know in the schools... showing the good things not just what they hear in the news because when you're a kid when they told you something it's going to your head, you never forget it you know like...so I believe this is good idea if they bring something to put it in on the school and teach the kids, even the teacher as well most of the teacher they don't know, they have to get more education...* [Moosa]

> *...if you're going to teach it [about Islam], teach correct; don't pick what you want to teach, as well. The fact people think I'm oppressed obviously even teachers themselves don't have education, they haven't got proper information about what my rights are in Islam you know...* [Fatima]

Recommendation 7: Education and the diversity of Muslims and Islam

- As a starting point, civil society organisations and academic partners should undertake a study which maps current interventions in pre/in-service teacher training, focusing particularly on those spaces wherein diversity and all issues relating to Muslim communities and Islam arise. This should engage scholars and service providers 'in the field' to gain an understanding of what is already being done.
- Identify the lacunae that may exist and work with partners to bring about change.
- Similarly, a scoping approach is required in terms of the curriculum and the manner in which Muslim communities and related issues are engaged with in the classroom; again, scholars and practitioners in this area should be recruited for participation.

Advocating for legislative change

This final substantive section engages with the potential for the civil society organisations to work with partners in advocating for change in various aspects of legislation in Ireland. Established civil society organisations are privileged in the sense that they may have access to a bank of knowledge vis-à-vis the legal landscape in Ireland; thus they are ideally positioned, if the necessary resources are in place, to lend their experience to minority communities, Muslims among them, in advocating for legislative change – the areas of educational policies and hate crime legislation are particularly pertinent in the context discussed throughout this report.

Education

This research highlights again the problematic character of Irish equality legislation, the persistence of which amounts to nothing less than the maintenance of barriers to diversity in the educational context. As noted above, schools can deny students a place in the classroom because of their faith/no-faith identity; furthermore, the current structure of the education system which remains predominated by the Catholic Church means that de facto, those who are not Catholic are denied the opportunity to teach young Irish children. In both scenarios, the diversity that provides such richness to Irish society is obfuscated under a façade of 'we are all the same' read Catholic. This is compounded by the Government's policy 'to not have a policy' in the realm of religious dress in schools. This 'non-policy,' as with the other points raised here arguably flouts those constitutional ambitions to protect religious diversity and freedom of belief as stated in the Irish Constitution, namely in Article 44. As Susan put it…

> …people can't be allowed to discriminate against someone on the basis of their gender
> or their religion or you know; that has to be the law…

Recommendation 8: Education and legislation

Three points arise on which the civil society organisations can work with partners to encourage the Government to enact policy and implement legislative change. Discrimination in all its forms must be challenged. The rights of Catholics, Muslims, Hindus, Sikhs, Bahá'is, Protestants, Buddhists, all faiths and none must be protected equally.

- Legislative permission to discriminate on the basis of faith/no-faith must be challenged in the context of school enrolment policies – unequivocally; no potential for exceptions.

- Legislative permission to discriminate in the selection of staff in the educational context must be challenged – as with family status and sexual orientation, people of different faiths and none should have equal opportunities in teacher recruitment.
- The rights of all children and staff to manifest their faith identity must be protected.

Hate Crime

The summer of 2015 witnessed the presentation of evidence based research by staff in the University of Limerick on the topic of hate crime in Ireland. This research added to existing evidence that hate crime is a reality in the Irish context.[141] In addition to drawing on the experiences of those who have been the target of hate crime in all its forms, the Limerick research undertook an evaluation of international best practice in terms of hate crime legislation, and, also engaged with a range of legal professionals and sought their advice on the workability of potential legislative remedy.

Drawing on their findings, the Limerick researchers presented draft heads for hate crime legislation in Ireland, thus doing the heavy lifting in terms of drafting evidence based legislation. This legislation remains to be enacted. Until such a time as it is, men and women in Ireland who are targeted for hate crime, simply because of who they are or are perceived to be, will not be able to enjoy the full protections of the State. Civil society organisations and partners can play a leading role in ensuring that the proposed legislation on hate crime in Ireland is implemented as soon as possible.

Recommendation 9: Hate crime legislation
- Civil society organisations must advocate and actively lobby government and all political parties for the implementation of hate crime legislation.

Moving Forward: Maintaining an Inclusive approach

Before concluding this report it is important to iterate the need for engagement with Muslim communities in the broadest possible terms. The recommendations and suggestions made in this report, be they in reference to campaigns, training and/or advocacy, or indeed those areas identified as requiring further research need to be made in lockstep with Muslim men and women. From the outset of this study, the researcher and the Immigrant Council of Ireland have always maintained that they do not speak for Muslim communities. This research has provided a platform for a range of Irish Muslim men and women to share their perspectives, their experiences – it is important that their voices are those that are heard. Bearing this inclusive approach in mind, it is vital that the next stages of this work are inclusive of a diversity of Muslim voices; maintaining the grassroots approach undertaken in this research that, yes engages with representative groups, but also individuals and activists from a range of perspectives and backgrounds; affiliated to organisations and unaffiliated.

There is no question that Muslim representative organisations, who are already working at grassroots level, and which were very supportive of this fieldwork, will continue to play a key role in the development of this work. A range of participants in this research time and again noted the importance of local imams and Islamic student university societies in terms of progressing this work into the future. Importantly, the words of the participants, when asked about the issue of moving this work forward and how it should be approached

noted the need for inclusivity be it in terms of age, gender, religious perspective, ethno-national diversity, among others; that groups and individuals involved be derived from across the communities and that they come together for the greater good Muslims in Ireland:

> I feel, really, the engagement needs to be grassroots with the people, the real youth on the streets. With people that, they are living there their daily life, working with the mosques, working with youth groups, working with people that are more real. You have a lot of intellectuals, think-tanks and stuff that's fine, you know, they have their place. But in terms of impacting, making a difference is really working with grassroots on any sort of project or initiative working directly with the Muslims. [Fatima]

> It comes from like the community and Muslims showing up here in Ireland. Like, everyone in here classifies themselves as Irish. We were born here, grew up here in Ireland so we know what the situation or the 'suss' is here. But it's up to this generation here, growing up, to be the future spokespeople, spokespersons… here in Ireland. [Jamaal]

> …it's not for us being one denomination to say look it's about the [Sunni/Sufi/Shia etc etc] way. No, it's about… You know our religion is encompassing, it's about everybody. But the certain things that in terms of rights for example halal meat, halal food in the canteens, a place for prayer, access to ablution. Things [that] are quite universal that all of us will come together and say 'look we worry about… the halal food in the canteens our children are going to be eating. We want a space for prayer like the Christians have for going to the chapel. We just want a room that could be used and they can go, they'll go in these intervals'…. [Aadil]

> …the hijab monologue was great in that you know, even the committee that they got together were all so different, with different background and different how they perceive things was so different… It was just women… but they tried to bring women of different backgrounds so you had converts or the reverts, you had somebody from Bangladeshi, Pakistani background, Palestinian, Iranian, Irish, Sudanese. I thought that was pretty good. [Aafreen]

Recommendation 10: Moving forward together
- New projects, developing from this research or otherwise, that aim to work with Muslim communities need to be inclusive of the diversity of Muslims and Islam in Dublin and Ireland; those affiliated with representative groups and those who are unaffiliated.

Section 8: Conclusion

The voices heard throughout this report evidence the realities of racism facing Muslim communities in Ireland today. The people who took part in this study recalled their experiences of hostility, be it in the form of verbal abuse; serious physical assaults; graffiti and/or damage to property. Muslim men and women from across the age spectrum detailed how they have experienced discrimination in/accessing work; in/accessing education; using public transport; and in shops and restaurants. These experiences grate against any ideals we have to live in an Ireland that claims to value and respect religious freedom, diversity and uphold civil liberty; a society wherein all are treated equally. The impacts of these experiences of the individuals and communities targeted include feelings of fear; shock; anger; frustration and depression.

Civil society organisations, working with partners in the State, the non-governmental sector, academia and most importantly of all, across Muslim communities can lay a challenge to Islamophobia and anti-Muslim racism in Ireland. A course forward has already been plotted in this research. Participants in this study have identified the areas they feel need to be targeted if anti-Muslim racism is to be challenged in Irish society. These are detailed above and include, but are not limited to raising awareness, through campaigns, of the fact that Muslim communities are part of Irish society, of Irish communities. The people who took part in this study repeatedly referred to Ireland and in particular Dublin as home; awareness campaigns acknowledging this would go some way towards addressing the negative stereotypes invoked in experiences of anti-Muslim racism. Campaigns are also required for members of Muslim communities so that they know and understand their rights and how they can take action when subjected to hostility and discrimination.

In addition to raising awareness, participants also identified the need for training when it comes to media engagement. Media actors are perceived by participants as a key conduit through which stereotypical (mis) understandings of Muslims and Islam make their way into public perception. Furthermore, participants also note how they find it difficult to have their voices heard in established media outlets. Media engagement training across Muslim communities could empower individuals and organisations to ensure that informed and diverse understandings reach the public. Additionally, civil society organisations and partners can also advocate for greater diversity in the Irish media, and in this instance, the inclusion of Muslim faces and voices.

The experiences of anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination as detailed earlier in this report have a profound impact on those targeted. It is vital that civil society organisations and partners work to map, and if possible, formalise the supports that are available for people. People who have been targeted with anti-Muslim racism should not be left to live with their experience in silence and isolation.

As advocates, civil society organisations can engage with employers/employer organisations to raise awareness of the experiences of Muslim men and women in and accessing work. This would not only put a spotlight on the issue of workplace discrimination but it would also remind employers of their responsibilities and how they can draw from examples of best practice to ensure their workplace is welcoming for diversity.

An Garda Síochána are a key partner for civil society organisations and Muslim communities in the challenge against anti-Muslim racism. These established relationships place civil society organisations in an ideal position to 1) encourage trusting relationships between the Gardaí and Muslim communities and 2) advocate against practices of racial or religious profiling of Muslim men and women by Garda staff.

The experiences shared in this report highlight three areas wherein civil society organisations can advocate for change at the level of legislation. Young Muslims in Ireland and their parents face exclusionary enrolment policies that discriminate against them on the basis of their religious identity. Further, when in school, young Muslim women are the mercy of their school principals and teachers when it comes to their ability to manifest their faith. Muslim would-be teachers are de facto excluded from the teaching profession because of their religious identity, the current patronage structure of the Irish education system through the protection of ethos clause as detailed in equality law – this must change. In relation to hate crime legislation, the experiences of hostility and abuse described above further underscore the need for legal redress for those who have been targeted. Working with partners, civil society organisations can help lead the drive for policy and legislative change in these areas.

Finally, any or all of these initiatives need to develop in a manner that is inclusive of a range of Muslim voices. Men, women, boys and girls; different ethnicities; political perspectives and aspects of Islam and so on must be included in any future work if it is to truly claim to be representative of Muslims in Dublin and Ireland.

Given that this research was undertaken with Muslims in Dublin, it is fitting to leave the last word to Fatima:

> *I've so many memories in Dublin as a child as in college... I go back [to University] and say hi, just say hi because this is the part of me. This is what has created me. I, honestly, I am who I am because of being here.*

Appendix 1

Sex	
Female	33
Male	33

Table 1: Participants' sex.

Age	Male	Female	Total
18-24	8	10	18
25-35	9	6	15
36-45	10	11	21
46-55	3	3	6
56-65	2	0	2
65-76	0	0	0
76+	0	1	1
Missing	1	2	3
Total	33	33	66

Table 2: Participants' age.

Nationalities		Nationalities	
Irish	15	Algerian	1
Irish/American	1	British	1
Irish/Iranian	1	Congolese	1
Irish/Nigerian	2	Danish	2
Irish/Pakistani	2	Iranian	1
Irish/Somali	1	Iraqi	4
Irish/Egyptian	3	Ivorian	1
Irish/Iraqi	2	Malaysian	1
Irish/Libyan	8	Mauritian	1
Irish/Lebanese	1	Pakistani	1
Irish/South African	2	Palestinian	1
Irish Tunisian	1	Somali	1
Irish/Algerian	1	Sudanese	2
Afghan	3	USA	1
Albanian	1	Not Given	3

Table 3: Participants' nationalities, including dual nationalities

Endnotes

1 Carr, J. (2016) *Experiences of Islamophobia: Living with racism in the neoliberal era*, London and New York: Routledge. Islamophobia is used in this report to refer to the manner in which Muslim communities are constructed in public, political and media discourses among others; discourses that set Muslim communities apart from others on the basis of their religious identities. Anti-Muslim racism is used here to denote the exclusionary practices of hostility and discrimination, informed by Islamophobic discourses, which consequently manifest in the lives of Muslim people.

2 See European Network Against Racism Ireland (2016) iReport [online] available: http://enarireland.org/ireport-quartertly/ [accessed: 5th February 2016].

3 Carr (2016).

4 Carr (2016); Zempi, I. and Chakraborti, N. (2014) *Islamophobia, Victimisation and the Veil*, Basingstoke and New York: Palgrave MacMillan.

5 See Faas, D. , Darmody, M. and Beata Sokolowska (2015) "Religious diversity in primary schools: reflections from the Republic of Ireland", *British Journal of Religious Education*, DOI: 10.1080/01416200.2015.1025700; Smyth, E., Darmody, M. McGinnity, F. and Delma Byrne (2009) Adapting to Diversity: Irish schools and newcomer students, Economic and Social Research Institute, Report. [online] available: http://emn.ie/files/p_201103011110262009_AdaptingtoDiversity_ESRI.pdf [accessed: 11th November 2015].

6 This study focuses on the experiences of Muslim communities in Ireland but the experience of exclusion at enrolment is not isolated to Muslim families. It is worth noting the recent reported case of a young Hindu child and the discriminatory practices she and her parents experienced when trying to enrol her in a local, Catholic, school see Holland, K. (2015) Hindu family fails to get place for child in local school, The Irish Times, 13th October, 2015 [Online] available: http://www.irishtimes.com/news/social-affairs/hindu-family-fails-to-get-place-for-child-in-local-school-1.2388898 [accessed: 11th November 2015].

7 Irish Statute Book (2016) Equality (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2015 [online] available: http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2015/act/43/section/11/enacted/en/html#sec11

8 Equal Status Acts 2000-2008 [accessed: 26th January 2016].

9 See also Devine, D. Kenny, M. and Eilenn Macneela (2008) "Naming the 'other': Children's construction and experience of racisms in Irish primary schools," *Race Ethnicity and Education*, Vol.11(4): 369-385.

10 Open Society Institute (2011) Unveiling the Truth: Why 32 Muslim women wear the full-face veil in France, [online] available: https://www.opensocietyfoundations.org/reports/unveiling-truth-why-32-muslim-women-wear-full-face-veil-france [accessed: 10th December 2015].

11 Carr (2016).

12 Ibid.

13 Arabic acronym for ISIL/ISIS see BBC (2016) Isis, Isil, IS or Daesh? One group, many names [online] available: http://www.bbc.com/news/world-middle-east-27994277 [accessed: 9th February 2016].

14 Ummah: Global Muslim community.

15 See Sports Against Racism Ireland (2015) Hijabs and Hat-tricks, [online] available: http://www.sari.ie/hijabs-and-hat-tricks/ [accessed: 10th December 2015].

16 See RTE (2016) "Baz the Lost Muslim," [online] available: http://www.rte.ie/tv/programmes/bazthelostmuslim.html [accessed: 29th January 2016].

17 Carr (2016).

18 See BBC (2016) 'Paris Attacks What Happened on the Night' [online] available: http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-34818994 [accessed: 4th February 2016]; RTE (2016) 'Three Irish confirmed dead in Tunisia,' [online] available: http://www.rte.ie/news/2015/0628/711121-tunisia-attack/ [accessed: 4th February 2016]; Saul, H. (2015) 'Paris attacks timeline: From Charlie Hebdo to a Jewish grocery store – how two hostage situations unfolded,' Independent, 9th January 2015 [online] available: http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/europe/paris-attacks-timeline-from-charlie-hebdo-to-dammartin-en-goele-how-the-double-hostage-situation-9968543.html [accessed: 4th February 2016].

19 Hall, M. and Holehouse, M. (2015) 'Migrant crisis: Refugees welcomed in Germany like war heroes as Berlin expects 10,000 in one day,' The Telegraph, 6th September 2015 [online] available: http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/europe/germany/11847545/Migrant-crisis-Refugees-welcomed-in-Germany-like-war-heroes-as-Berlin-expects-10000-in-one-day.html [accessed: 5th February 2016]; Traynor, I. (2015) 'Migration crisis: Hungary PM says Europe in grip of madness,' The Guardian, 3rd September 2015 [online] available: http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/sep/03/migration-crisis-hungary-pm-victor-orban-europe-response-madness [accessed: 4th February 2016].

20 Awan and Zempi (2015).

21 Carr (2016).

22 See European Network Against Racism Ireland (2016).

23 Roche, B. (2016) 'Anti-Islamic group Pegida Ireland to be launched at Dublin rally,' The Irish Times, 30th January 2016 [online] available: http://www.irishtimes.com/news/ireland/irish-news/anti-islamic-group-pegida-ireland-to-be-launched-at-dublin-rally-1.2515875 [accessed: 4th February 2016].

24 For a detailed exposition see: Scharbrodt, O., Sakaranaho, T., Khan, A.H., Shanneik, Y. and Vivian Ibrahim (2015) *Muslims in Ireland: Past and present*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

25 Central Statistics Office (2012) Census 2011: This is Ireland (Part 1) [online] available: http://www.cso.ie/en/census/census2011reports/census2011thisisirelandpart1/ [accessed: 12th November 2015].

26 Carr (2016).

27 Scharbrodt O and Sakaranaho T (2011) "Islam and Muslims in the Republic of Ireland: An Introduction to the Special Issue", *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, Vol.31(4), 469-485; Scharbrot, O. (2011) "Islam in Ireland: Organising a migrant religion", in Cosgrove, O., Cox, L., Kuhling, C. And Peter Mulholland (eds.) *Ireland's New Religious Movements*, Newcastle-Upon-Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 318-337; Scharbrodt, O. (2012) "Muslim Immigration to the Republic of Ireland: Trajectories and dynamics since World War II", *Éire-Ireland: A Journal of Irish Studies*, Vol. 47 (1&2), 221-243.

28 See for example Scharbrodt et al (2015); Shanneik, Y. (2011) "Conversion and Religious Habitus: The experiences of Irish women converts to Islam in the pre-Celtic Tiger era", *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, Vol.31(4), 503-517. Flynn, K. (2006) "Understanding Islam in Ireland", *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations*, Vo.17 (2), 223-238.

29 Carr, J. (2011) "Regulating Islamophobia: The need for collecting disaggregated data on racism in Ireland," *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs* Vol.31(4): 574-593.

30 See Immigrant Council of Ireland (2015) Racism Hotline http://immigrantcouncil.ie/pages/services and European Network Against Racism Ireland (2016) iReport [online] available: https://www.ireport.ie/ [accessed: 10th January 2016].

31 Carr, J. (2016) *Experiences of Islamophobia: Living with racism in the neoliberal era*, London and New York: Routledge.

32 Ibid.

33 See Awan and Zempi (2015).

Littler, M. and Feldman, M. (2015) Tell MAMA Reporting 2014/2015: Annual Monitoring, Cumulative Extremism and Policy Implications [Online] available: http://tellmamauk.org/wp-content/uploads/pdf/Tell%20MAMA%20Reporting%202014-2015.pdf [accessed: 9th November 2015].

34 Carr (2016).

35 Ibid.

36 These include the Immigrant Council of Ireland; European Network Against Racism Ireland among others.

37 See https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5L6ovASzZGI ; Finn, C. (2015) 'Protestor tears up anti-Islam banner at Clonskeagh Mosque march', The Journal.ie [online] available:

http://www.thejournal.ie/clonskeagh-mosque-protest-1914647-Feb2015/ [accessed: 9th November 2015].

38 Lucey, A. (2015) 'Irish anti-Islamic group protests mosque in Kerry', Irish Central [online] available: http://www.irishcentral.com/news/Irish-anti-Islamic-group-protests-mosque-in-Kerry.html [accessed: 9th November

2015].

Radio Kerry (2015) 'Kerry Muslims find anti-Muslim propaganda hypocrtical' [online] available: http://www.radiokerry.ie/news/kerry-muslims-find-anti-muslim-propaganda-hypocritical/ [accessed 9th November 2015].

It is worth noting that no formal objections were lodged with the local council and permission was granted for the construction of the mosque. See Lucey, A. (2015a) 'Kerry mosque plan approved but no call to prayer allowed', Irish Times, 8th September 2015 [online] available: http://www.irishtimes.com/news/social-affairs/religion-and-beliefs/kerry-mosque-plan-approved-but-no-call-to-prayer-allowed-1.2344412 [accessed: 9th November 2015].

39 Anti-Islam Ireland (2015) 'Anti-Islam Ireland Visit to the Kilkenny imam' [online] available: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5b1Ul2J3x7o [accessed: 9th November 2015]. Meredith, C. (2014) 'Britain First 'Invade' Crayford Mosque Demanding Removal of 'Sexist' Signs in Bizarre Video', Huffington Post, 15th July 2014 [online] available:

http://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/2014/07/15/britain-first-mosque-video_n_5587353.html; [accessed: 9th November 2015].

40 Healy, C. (2015) 'Saudi woman attacked on Dublin bus by man who said, 'I hate Muslims', The Journal.ie [online] available: http://www.thejournal.ie/saudi-woman-attack-dublin-bus-muslims-2328732-Sep2015/ [accessed: 9th November 2015].

41 Feehan, C. and Kearns, D. (2015) '"I don't want to be treated by someone in a hijab" – Patient refuses care from two Muslim doctors', Independent.ie; http://www.independent.ie/irish-news/health/i-dont-want-to-be-treated-by-someone-in-a-hijab-patient-refuses-care-from-two-muslim-doctors-34276594.html [accessed: January 5th, 2016].

42 Sound Migration (2016) "anti-Islam Ireland RTE Liveline 11th December 2015" https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mWMbBHVZSjo&feature=youtu.be [accessed: January 4th, 2016].

43 See ENAR Ireland (2016) iReport [online] available: http://enarireland.org/ireport-quartertly/ [accessed: 10th January 2016].

44 Ibid.

45 See Allen, C. And Nielsen, J. (2002) "Summary Report on Islamophobia in the EU after 11 September 2001" [online], available: http://fra.europa.eu/fraWebsite/attachments/Synthesis-report_en.pdf [accessed: 10th November 2015]. Carr (2016).

46 See O'Curry, S. and Michael, L. (2015) iReport 5th and 6th Quarterly Reports [online] available: http://enarireland.org/ireport-quartertly/ [accessed: 10th November 2015].

47 Carr (2016) p.52.

48 Ibid.

49 Hennink, M., Hutter, I. and Ajay Bailey (2011) Qualitative Research Methods, LA, London, New Delhi, Singapore, Washington: Sage.

50 Hennink et al (2011) p.109.

51 Flick, U. (2009) An Introduction to Qualitative Research, 4th ed., LA, London, New Delhi, Singapore, Washington DC: Sage.; Hennink et al (2011).

52 Flick (2009); Hennink et al (2011).

53 Creswell, J. (2007) Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing among five approaches, 2nd ed., Thousand Oaks: Sage.

54 See Appendix 1 for more detail.

55 Carr (2016).

56 Crenshaw, K. (1991) "Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, identity politics, and violence against women of colour", Stanford Law Review, Vol.43(6), 1241-1299.

57 See Schweppe, J., Haynes, A. and Carr, J. (2015) 'Out of the Shadows: Legislating for Hate Crime in Ireland', Limerick: HHRG/ICCL

58 Carr (2016); See also ENAR Ireland (2015) iReports for example; also Transgender Equality Network Ireland (2014) STAD Report [online] available: http://www.teni.ie/attachments/95628615-9aea-4abb-86f4-5687daoe7335.PDF [accessed: 10th November 2015].

59 See for example: Poynting, S. and Noble, G. (2004) Living with Racism: The experience and reporting by Arab and Muslim Australians of discrimination, abuse and violence since 11 September 2001, Report to the Human Rights and Equal Opportunity Commission [online] available: https://www.humanrights.gov.au/publications/isma-listen-independent-research [accessed: 10th November 2015]; Ameli, S.R., Merali, A. and Ehan Shahghasemi (2012) France and the Hated Society: Muslim experiences; Wembley: Islamic Human Rights Commission.

60 Carr (2016); Poynting et al (2004).

61 Awan and Zempi (2015); Razack, S. H. (2004) "Imperilled Muslim Women, Dangerous Muslim Men and Civilised Europeans: Legal and social responses to forced marriages." Feminist Legal Studies Vol.12(2), 129-174.

62 Carr (2016).

63 Allen, C., Isakjee, A. & zlem gtem Young (2014) "Maybe we are hated." The experience and impact of anti-Muslim hate on British Muslim Women, Institute of Applied Social Studies, School of Social Policy, University of Birmingham [online] available: http://issuu.com/drchrisallen/docs/maybe_we_are_hated_-_report_on_anti

[accessed: 11th November 2015]. Awan and Zempi (2015);

64 Fieldwork was conducted prior to the attacks in Paris on November 13th 2015.

65 Awan and Zempi (2015); Feldman, M. and Littler, M. (2014) Tell MAMA Reporting 2013/14 Anti-Muslim Overview, Analysis and Cumulative Extremism', Report [online] available: http://tellmamauk.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/07/finalreport.pdf [accessed: 11th November 2015].

66 Carr (2016).

67 Carr (2016); Zempi, I. and Chakraborti, N. (2014) *Islamophobia, Victimisation and the Veil*, Basingstoke and New York: Palgrave MacMillan.

68 For strikingly similar instances see research published in the UK by Allen et al (2014) referred to above.

69 See Awan and Zempi (2015) for similar examples from the UK context.

70 Perry (2001) notes the manner in which hate crimes serve not only to intimidate the immediate individual(s) targeted but the broader community from which they derive; hate crimes send a 'message' that you do not belong, you are not 'one of us', you are a target. See Perry, B. (2001) *In the Name of Hate*, London and New York: Routledge.

71 Carr (2016); See also Carr, J., Haynes, A., Garland, J., Power, M. and Schweppe, J. (2015) More than a Club; more than a game. Contribution to the evaluation of the Hijabs and Hat-tricks project Report for Sports Against Racism Ireland. [Online] available: http://www.researchgate.net/publication/274195035_More_than_a_club_more_than_a_game_Contribution_to_the_evaluation_of_the_Hijabs_and_Hat-tricks_project [accessed: 11th November 2015].

72 Carr (2016); For further examples that do not focus on Muslimness see research carried out by McGinnity et al (2009) on experiences of discrimination in recruitment "using distinctive names to signal ethnic or national origin" p.vii. For more go to: http://www.esri.ie/pubs/BKMNEXT137.pdf

73 See Faas, D. , Darmody, M. and Beata Sokolowska (2015) "Religious diversity in primary schools: reflections from the Republic of Ireland", *British Journal of Religious Education*, DOI: 10.1080/01416200.2015.1025700; Smyth, E., Darmody, M. McGinnity, F. and Delma Byrne (2009) Adapting to Diversity: Irish schools and newcomer students, Economic and Social Research Institute, Report. [online] available: http://emn.ie/files/p_201103011110262009_AdaptingtoDiversity_ESRI.pdf [accessed: 11th November 2015].

74 This study focuses on the experiences of Muslim communities in Ireland but the experience of exclusion at enrolment is not isolated to Muslim families. It is worth noting the recent reported case of a young Hindu child and the discriminatory practices she and her parents experienced when trying to enrol her in a local, Catholic, school see Holland, K. (2015) Hindu family fails to get place for child in local school, The Irish Times, 13th October, 2015 [Online] available: http://www.irishtimes.com/news/social-affairs/hindu-family-fails-to-get-place-for-child-in-local-school-1.2388898 [accessed: 11th November 2015].

75 See Equal Status Act 2000-2008 http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2000/act/8/section/7/enacted/en/html

76 See Hogan, C. (2011) "Accommodating Islam in the Denominational Irish Education System: Religious Freedom and Education in the Republic of Ireland

77 See the Education (Admission to Schools) Bill 2015 - https://www.education.ie/en/The-Education-System/Legislation/Education-Admission-to-Schools-Bill-2015.pdf

78 See The Irish Times (2015) School Admissions Bill: Battle looms over rules on past pupils [online] available: http://www.irishtimes.com/news/education/school-admissions-bill-battle-looms-over-rules-on-past-pupils-1.2166728 [accessed: October 14th 2015].

79 Darmody, M., Smyth, E. and Selina McCoy (2012) School Sector Variation Among Primary Schools in Ireland, Report. Economic and Social Research Institute; https://www.educatetogether.ie/sites/default/files/school_sector_variation_0.pdf [accessed: January 5th, 2016]; Faas, D., Sokolowska, B. and Merike Darmody (2015) '"Everybody is available to them": Support measures for migrant students in Irish secondary schools', British Journal of Educational Studies, Vol.63(4): 447-466. Humphreys, J. (2015) "How the Catholic Church Could Solve the Patronage Problem", The Irish Times; http://www.irishtimes.com/opinion/how-the-catholic-church-could-solve-the-school-patronage-problem-1.2297551 [accessed: January 7th, 2016].

80 Irish Statute Book (2016) Equality (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2015 [online] available: http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2015/act/43/section/11/enacted/en/html#sec11

81 Equal Status Acts 2000-2008 [accessed: 26th January 2016].

82 Mary Immaculate College (2016) Certificate in Religious Studies, [online] available: http://www.mic.ul.ie/education/lsre/Pages/CertRelEd.aspx [accessed: 26th January 2016]. Alternative non-denominational education is provided by Educate Together (2016) group comprising of 77 primary and an anticipated 9 secondary schools nationally by year-end 2016 see https://www.educatetogether.ie/about/what-is-educate-together; Educate Together schools do not deliver religious instruction   http://www.educatetogether.ie/about/learn-together [accessed: 26th January 2016].

83 See also Devine, D. Kenny, M. and Eilenn Macneela (2008) "Naming the 'other': Children's construction and experience of racisms in Irish primary schools," Race Ethnicity and Education, Vol.11(4): 369-385.

84 For a critique of current practice see Bryan, A. (2012) "'You've got to teach people that racism is wrong and then they won't be racist': Curricular representations and young people's understandings of 'race' and racism," Journal of Curriculum Studies, Vol.44(5): 599-629.

85 See Central Statistics Office (2012) Census 2011 [online] available: http://www.cso.ie/en/media/csoie/census/documents/census2011profile7/Profile,7,Education,Ethnicity,and,Irish,Traveller,entire,doc.pdf [accessed: 11th November 2015].

86 Bryan, A. and Bracken, M. (2011) "'They think the book is right and I am wrong'", in Darmody, M., Tyrell, N. and Steve Song eds.; *The Changing Faces of Ireland: Exploring the Lives of Immigrant and Ethnic Minority Children*, Rotterdam, Boston, Taipei: Sense Publishers; pp.105-123.

87 For an exposition see Hogan, C. (2011) "Accommodating Islam: in the Denominational Irish Education System: Religious freedom and education in the Republic of Ireland," *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, Vol.31(4): 554-573.

88 MacCormaic, R. (2008) "No directive on hijabs in classroom to be issued", The Irish Times [online] available: http://www.irishtimes.com/news/no-directive-on-hijabs-in-classroom-to-be-issued-1.940516 [accessed: 15th October 2015]

89 Department of Education and Skills (2015) "23 September, 2008 – Ministers agree recommendations on school uniform policy" [online] available: http://www.education.ie/en/Press-Events/Press-Releases/2008-Press-Releases/PR08-09-23A.html [accessed: 15th October 2015].

90 Department of Education and Skills (2015) "23 September, 2008 – Ministers agree recommendations on school uniform policy."

91 Devine, D. (2009) "Mobilising Capitals? Migrant children's negotiation of their everyday lives in school," *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, Vol.30(5): 521-535.

92 Carr (2016); McGinnity, F., Nelson, J., Lunn, P. and Emma Quinn (2009) Discrimination in Recruitment: Evidence from a field experiment, Report, Economic and Social Research Institute [online] available: http://www.esri.ie/pubs/BKMNEXT137.pdf [accessed: 11th November 2015].

93 McGinnity et al (2009).

94 For a similar discussion see research conducted by the Open Society Institute (2011).

95 Carr (2016); Crenshaw (1991).

96 Open Society Institute (2011).

97 Ibid, p.127.

98 Ibid.

99 For research on this topic in the USA context see: Ghumman, S., and Ryan, A.M. (2013) "Not welcome here: Discrimination towards women who wear the Muslim headscarf," *Human Relations* Vol.66.(5) 671-698.

100 Open Society Institute (2010).

101 O'Curry, S. and Michael, L. (2014) Reports of Racism in Ireland: 3rd Quarterly Report of iReport.ie [online] available: http://enarireland.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/07/iReport3_Final_150dpi.pdf [accessed: 12th November 2015].

102 See ENAR Ireland (2016) Reporting Organisations [online] available: http://enarireland.org/reporting-organisations/ [accessed: 12th January 2016].

103 See ENAR Ireland (2016).

104 For more on the Irish context see Carr (2016).

105 Carr, J. (2015) "Muslim communities in Ireland and the Irish gaze", in Mirhosseini, S.A. and Rouzbeh, H. (eds.) *Instances of Islamophobia: Demonising the Muslim 'Other'*, Boulder, New York, London: Lexington Books. Hickman, M., Thomas, L., Silvestri, S. and Henri Nickels (2011) "Suspect Communities'? Counter-terrorism policy, the press, and the impact on Irish and Muslim communities in Britain"; London Metropolitan University [online], available:

http://www.statewatch.org/news/2011/jul/uk-london-met-suspect-communities-findings.pdf   [accessed: 12th November 2015].

106 Hillyard, P. (1993) *Suspect community: people's experience of the Prevention of Terrorism Acts in Britain*, London: Pluto Press.

107 Carr (2016).

108 Carr (2016).

109 Allen et al (2014); Awan and Zempi (2015); Carr (2016).

110 Fanning, B., Killoran, B., Ní Bhroin and Geoff McEvoy (2011) Taking Racism Seriously, [online] available: http://immigrantcouncil.ie/pages/publications/40/30 [accessed: 10th December 2015].

111 Carr (2016).

112 Carr (2016).

113 Allen et al (2014).

114 Zempi and Chakraborti (2014).

115 Ghumman, S., and Ryan, A.M. (2013) "Not welcome here: Discrimination towards women who wear the Muslim headscarf," *Human Relations* Vol.66.(5) 671-698.

116 For a similar finding see Allen et al (2014).

117 Carr, J. (2016a) ""You can't have Muslim Irish children". Media, Islamophobia and Ireland: constructing different shades of green", in Haynes, A., Power, M.J., Devereux, E., Dillane, A. and James Carr (eds.) *Public and Political Discourses of Migration*, London: Rowman and Littlefield; Frost, D. (2008) Islamophobia: Examining causal links between the media and "race hate" from "below", *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, Vol.28(11): 564-578; Hussain, M. (2000) "Islam, Media, and Minorities in Denmark", *Current*

Sociology, Vol.48(4), 95-116; Lewis, J., Mason, P. and Kerry Moore (2011) "Images of Islam in the UK: The representation of British Muslims in the national press 2000-8", in Petley J and Richardson R. (eds.) *Pointing the Finger: Islam and Muslims in the British Media*, Oxford: Oneworld; pp.40-66.

118 Inspired by Muhammad (2013) "YouGov Poll" [online] available: http://www.inspiredbymuhammad.com/yougov.php [accessed: 13th November 2015]; Lewis et al (2011).

119 Allen et al note these perceptions also in their research with Muslim women in the UK.

120 Carr (2016); Hillyard (1993).

121 See Gest, J. (2010) *Apart: Alienated and engaged Muslims in the West*, Columbia: Hurst, for an elaboration of the broader European experience of Muslim communities.

122 Approximately 30% of Muslims in Ireland are Irish citizens. See Central Statistics Office (2012).

123 Carr (2016).

124 Tracey, M. (2000) "Racism and Immigration in Ireland: A comparative analysis", MPhil Thesis, Trinity College Dublin, Ireland [online] available: http://www.tcd.ie/sociology/ethnicracialstudies/assets/documents/Marshall_01.pdf [accessed: 13th November 2015].

125 I am not representing Muslim communities in Dublin as vulnerable: they are not; the term is used here to communicate some of the issues that participants felt were pertinent to the discussion.

126 Fanning et al (2011).

127 Khan, S. (2015) "The jihadi girls who went to Syria weren't just radicalised by Isis – they were groomed," Independent, 25th February 2015 [online] available: http://www.independent.co.uk/voices/comment/the-jihadi-girls-who-went-to-syria-werent-just-radicalised-by-isis-they-were-groomed-10069109.html [accessed: 27th January 2016].

128 International Centre for the Study of Radicalisation and Political Violence (2016) Foreign fighter total in Syria/Iraq now exceeds 20,000; surpasses Afghanistan conflict in the 1980s [online] available: http://icsr.info/2015/01/foreign-fighter-total-syriairaq-now-exceeds-20000-surpasses-afghanistan-conflict-1980s/ [accessed: 4th February 2016].

129   Education in Ireland (2014) "Why study in Ireland?" [online] available: http://www.educationinireland.com/en/Why-Study-in-Ireland-/ [accessed: 12th November 2015];

Education in Ireland (2014a) International Students in Higher education in Ireland 2009/10, [online] available: http://www.educationinireland.com/en/publications/international-students-in-higher-education-in-ireland-2010-.pdf [accessed: 12th November 2015].

130 Nor should it to be construed from this report that Muslim communities cannot 'help themselves'; the

researcher and the Immigrant Council of Ireland abhor acts of anti-Muslim hostility and discrimination and as such feel it is only right to stand, work with and support all people who have to live with racism.

131 Inspired by Muhammad (2013).

132 Carr (2016); Goldberg, D.T. (2009) *The Threat of Race: Reflections on racial neoliberalism*, Malden, Oxford, Victoria: Blackwell Publishing; Lentin, A. and Titley, G. (2011) *The Crises of Multiculturalism: Racism in a neoliberal age*, London and New York: Zed Books.

133 See Sports Against Racism Ireland (2015) Hijabs and Hat-tricks, [online] available: http://www.sari.ie/ hijabs-and-hat-tricks/ [accessed: 10th December 2015].

134 Carr (2016); Lynch C (2011) *Putting Racism on the Record: a framework for monitoring racist incidents*, Dublin: Irish Network Against Racism (ENAR Ireland).

135 See Muslim Council of Britain (2014) Muslims in the Workplace, [online] available: http://www.mcb.org. uk/wp-content/uploads/2014/06/Muslims-in-the-Workplace.pdf [accessed: 20th December 2015].

136 The Islamic Cultural Centre of Ireland do offer a range of general advice and information documents related to Islam but none specifically for employers/employees; see http://www.islamireland.ie/publications/

137 See RTE (2016) "Baz the Lost Muslim," [online] available: http://www.rte.ie/tv/programmes/bazthelostmuslim. html [accessed: 29th January 2016].

138 Carr (2016); Fanning et al (2011).

139 Carr (2016).

140 Bryan and Bracken (2011).

141 Carr (2016); ENAR Ireland (2016); Fanning et al (2011).

Immigrant Council
of Ireland
Independant Law Centre