

Comparative Report: Disrupt Demand

Working for equality



Comparative Report: Disrupt Demand



Co-funded by the Internal Security
Fund of the European Union



Working for equality



Acknowledgements

The Immigrant Council of Ireland and project partners would like to thank the European Commission for its financial support of Disrupt Demand. We would also like to extend our gratitude to the different state agencies, civil society organisations and academics that provided their time, advice and insight. Particular thanks go to the survivors who shared their experiences and gave invaluable input. The Immigrant Council of Ireland and partners would like to especially thank Denise Charlton and Dr Monica O'Connor who were the project researchers and gave invaluable guidance.

About the Author

Dr Monica O'Connor is an independent researcher and policy analyst. She is the author and co-author of numerous publications on violence against women including 'Globalisation, Sex Trafficking and Prostitution: The Experiences of Migrant Women in Ireland' (Kelleher Associates, O'Connor & Pillinger, 2009), which was commissioned by the Immigrant Council of Ireland. In 2010 she received a three-year Government of Ireland Scholarship from the Irish Research Council to undertake doctoral research examining the issues of choice, consent, agency and harm in the lives of prostituted and trafficked women in Ireland. She is currently a senior researcher in the Sexual Exploitation Research Project (SERP) at the School of Social Policy, Social Work and Social Justice, University College Dublin and is a Research Fellow at the WiSE Research Centre at Glasgow Caledonian University.

Project Partners

Immigrant Council of Ireland is the lead partner in the Disrupt Demand project and is a human rights organisation and law centre. It supports and advocates for the rights of immigrants and their families and acts as a catalyst for public debate, legal and policy change. The Immigrant Council of Ireland is also a leading anti-trafficking organisation with expertise in policy and legislative change in this area. It has considerable experience with leading EU projects in the area of human trafficking and has produced high quality research and submissions, including on the issue of demand reduction.

Mouvement du Nid is a grassroots organisation and a social movement in France that acts in support of prostituted persons and is in opposition to the prostitution system that exploits their precarious conditions and vulnerability. Mouvement du Nid concentrates on the causes and consequences of prostitution.

Institute for Feminism and Human Rights is an international not-for-profit policy and research institute based in Sweden with members in a number of countries in Europe and internationally. The Institute for Feminism and Human Rights works to prevent and eliminate the socio-economic, legal and political discrimination of women and girls through the use of feminist strategies and research methods, and the application of international, regional and national human rights instruments.

Klaipeda Social and Psychological Services Center is a Lithuanian based non-governmental and non-profit organisation. Its main goal is to provide psychosocial help for victims of violence (physical, psychological, sexual, economical and institutional), including trafficking in human beings and sexual exploitation for the purposes of prostitution.

Mediterranean Institute for Gender Studies is a Cyprus-based non-governmental organisation primarily focused on gender equality and women's rights. The Mediterranean Institute for Gender Studies works to eliminate all forms of discrimination against women through a combination of research, lobbying and advocacy, education and training, awareness-raising, as well as the provision of expertise and consultancy services. The organisation has been working on demand reduction and prevention strategies in Cyprus, ultimately aiming at substantive legal changes.

EXIT (Exit – pois prostituutiosta ry) is a Finnish non-governmental organisation working to diminish prostitution and sexual maltreatment by focusing on preventive and advocacy work and participating in public debate. Youth Exit (Nuorten Exit) works on the domain of primary and secondary prevention of sexual maltreatment and paid sex with a focus on adolescents and young adults. The Exit Prostitution Association also works with substance abusers aged 18 to 25 years, providing counselling regarding sexual violence, different forms of maltreatment and prostitution.

Content

Section 1: Introduction	04
1.1 European Directives and International Instruments Addressing Demand	05
1.2 'Disrupt Demand'	06
1.3 Consultation Process	07
1.4 The National Reports	07
1.5 The Comparative Report	07
Section 2: Background Context to Trafficking for Sexual Exploitation, Prostitution and Demand	08
2.1 Trafficking in Human Beings	09
2.2 Gender, Migration, Trafficking and Prostitution	10
2.3 Gender Equality and Violence Against Women	11
2.4 Understanding Demand	11
Section 3: Comparative Analysis of Demand in the Six Member States	14
3.1 Gender Equality and Violence Against Women	15
3.2 The Profile of Trafficked Women and Women in Prostitution	16
3.3 Demand: The Buyers of Sex	18
3.4 National Legislation Addressing Demand	20
3.4.1 Criminalising the Purchase Of Sexual Acts from a Trafficked Person	20
3.4.2 Criminalising the Purchase of Sex from any Person	21
3.4.3 Criminalising Prostitution	24
Section 4: Conclusions and Recommendations	28
4.1 Conclusions	29
4.2 Recommendations	30
References	34
Appendices	38
Appendix 1: The reporting template for the production of national reports	39
Appendix 2: Research, government data and reports cited in the national reports	41
Cyprus	41
Finland	44
France	46
Ireland	48
Lithuania	50
Sweden	52

1

Introduction

This section provides the background to the ‘Disrupt Demand’ project, which was a ‘study examining campaign strategies in EU Member States to introduce legislative measures to discourage demand for sex trafficking’. The project is funded by the Internal Security Fund of the European Union (HOME/2015/ISFP/AG/THBX).

1.1. European Directives and international instruments addressing demand

Directive 2011/36/EU (replacing Council Framework Decision 2002/629/JHA)¹ is the most recent indication of the commitment of the European Union to addressing the demand for human trafficking. Article 18 states:

Member States shall take appropriate measures, such as education and training, to discourage and reduce the demand that fosters all forms of exploitation related to trafficking in human beings.

Part 4 specifically addresses the use of the services of victims of trafficking:

In order to make the preventing and combating of trafficking in human beings more effective by discouraging demand, Member States shall consider taking measures to establish as a criminal offence the use of services which are the objects of exploitation as referred to in Article 2, with the knowledge that the person is a victim of an offence referred to in Article 2.

This directive reflects and re-enforces international instruments and conventions which specifically address demand. In 1949, the UN adopted the *Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others*.² The Convention is one of the few international human rights instruments which sets forth the principle that prostitution and trafficking are ‘incompatible with the dignity and worth of the human person’. Women in prostitution are not to be considered as criminals but as victims who the state has a responsibility to protect. The Convention advocates punishment for those ‘who procure, entice or lead’ others into prostitution. Article 6 of The United Nations *Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women* (CEDAW) (1979) also stipulates:

States parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution of women.

1. Directive 2011/36/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of the European Union on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting its victims, and replacing Council Framework Decision 2002/629/JHA, 2011 O. J. L 101 of 15.4.2011. URL: <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ:L:2011:101:0001:0011:EN:PDF>

2. Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others. Approved by General Assembly resolution 317 (IV), 1949. URL: https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/legislation-and-case-law-international-legislation-united-nations/convention-suppression-traffic_en

Over the past two decades international concern regarding the rise in trafficking of human beings has resulted in international instruments, conventions and directives. In 2000, the UN Assembly adopted the *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children*,³ which provided a definition and framework forming the basis of legislation at a global level. The Palermo Protocol (as it is known) specifically requires Member States to address demand. Article 9 urges states to:

Adopt or strengthen legislative or other measures, such as educational, social or cultural measures... to discourage the demand that fosters all forms of exploitation of persons, especially women and children, that leads to trafficking.

The Council of Europe *Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings*⁴ also

urges states to consider taking measures to criminalise the use of services which are the object of exploitation, with the knowledge that the person is a victim of trafficking (Article 19).

These international instruments and the European Directive urging Member States to take action to address demand have led to the introduction of specific legal provisions and targeted measures in most Member States. However, despite these initiatives, trafficking has continued to grow within and into the European Union. This has increased the need to assess the effectiveness of measures aiming to reduce demand for the buying of services from victims of trafficking, in particular demand for buying sex from victims of trafficking for sexual exploitation.

1.2 'Disrupt Demand'

Within this context the 'Disrupt Demand' project is timely. The project is designed to support efforts to prevent human trafficking for sexual exploitation by reducing demand, through mapping and analysing successful strategies involving legal changes, and fostering co-operation among key stakeholders. For this purpose, existing laws and implementation strategies addressing demand and mechanisms for monitoring their effectiveness were analysed with a view to identifying and promoting good, transferable practice among Member States. The project is led by the Immigrant Council of Ireland, an organisation recognised as a leading anti-trafficking civil society organisation and licensed independent law centre in Ireland, with expertise in policy and legislative change in this area. The partners are Mouvement du Nid (MdN) which were instrumental in effecting comprehensive legislative change for demand reduction in France, enacted in early 2016. The Institute for Feminism and Human Rights (IFHR) brings valuable expertise and knowledge from

Sweden, a country which has implemented legal change to effectively reduce demand and prevent human trafficking for over 20 years. Klaipeda Social and Psychological Services (KSPSC) in Lithuania is a lead non-governmental organisation (NGO) and service provider attempting to influence legislative change to tackle demand. Mediterranean Institute for Gender Studies (MIGS) has vast experience in research programmes and EU funded projects, and has been working on demand reduction and prevention strategies in Cyprus. Exit Prostitution Association is a lead organisation in monitoring and evaluating legislative change and the implementation of demand-reduction measures in Finland.

3. UN General Assembly, *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime*, 15 November 2000. URL: <http://www.refworld.org/docid/4720706c0.html>

4. Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, 2005 O. J. L 197.

1.3 Consultation process

A consultation process was conducted in Dublin in the initial phase of the project with the leading experts from the partner organisations represented: firstly, to ensure a shared understanding of the project aims and secondly, to facilitate discussion and build agreement on the purpose and content of the national and comparative reports. The researcher designed a draft template for the production of national reports which was sent to all partners prior to the consultation process. The template focused

on the legislative and policy context addressing demand and specific campaign strategies in relation to achieving legislative change in each country. This ensured clarity and consistency in relation to the data which should be gathered and the writing format and structure of the reports. The template was amended following the consultation process (see Appendix 1). Six national reports were compiled and sent to the researcher and form the basis of the main sections of this comparative report.

1.4 The national reports

The national reports contain a broad overview of trafficking and prostitution in the six Member States with a specific focus on demand for the purchase of sex from victims of trafficking. The reports are not exhaustive but seek to provide a comprehensive picture of the response to demand in their respective countries, drawing on data from research, government reports, police crime statistics and reports. The reports contain a brief historical and cultural background; the national legislative and policy frameworks to address trafficking;

structural mechanisms including National Referral Mechanisms; historical and current responses to prostitution in each country; law enforcement measures relating to the demand for the purchase of sex; public awareness campaigns; and strategies employed by the NGO sector to achieve legislative change in relation to demand. The analysis of the political and cultural context surrounding the phenomena of trafficking and prostitution reflects the views of each individual expert.

1.5 The comparative report

This report specifically focuses on measures to address demand for the purchase of sex from victims of human trafficking and from women and girls exploited in prostitution. Section 2 contextualises the issue of demand for the purchase of sex from victims of trafficking within the wider context of the gendered nature of trafficking and the commercial sex trade, into which the majority of girls and women are trafficked. Section 3 is drawn from the six national reports providing an analysis of the response to demand in the six countries, including: the profile of women who are prostituted and trafficked; the profile of the buyers of sex; analysis of the current legal and policy frameworks; the enforcement and

implementation of the laws addressing demand; the wider approach to the criminalisation of the organisers who facilitate and profit from supplying girls and women to meet demand; and public awareness campaigns addressing demand. Where empirical studies are directly cited from the national reports they are referenced in this text and further research, government data and reports cited in the national reports are listed in Appendix 2 to facilitate ease of reading. The outcomes of this project and this comparative report will contribute to our understanding of the effectiveness of measures to address demand in Member States.

2

Background context to trafficking for sexual exploitation, prostitution and demand

2.1 Trafficking in human beings

Trafficking in human beings is a complex phenomenon, intersecting with poverty, war and conflict, migration, socio-economic and gender inequalities, and violence against women. Impoverished regions of the world face high levels of indebtedness, deepening economic crises, increased gender inequalities and lowered social protection for women (UNESCO, 2004). The number of international migrants worldwide has continued to grow rapidly in recent years, reaching 258 million in 2017 with a constant migratory flow of people from poorer, less economically advanced regions and countries into richer, post-industrialised areas of the world (UN, 2017). On the other hand, restrictive migration policies and limited legal avenues to migrate create a context in which a range of people seek to profit by 'facilitating' movement and migration, including smugglers and traffickers. This places people in precarious situations where they are *'embarking on even more hazardous crossings'* (UNFPA, 2006:10). It is within these *'fertile fields of exploitation'* (Kelly, 2005:5) that vulnerable girls and women are easily targeted by operators who rapidly identify the potential for huge profit in 'facilitating' illegal migration and human trafficking, ensuring a supply of people to meet the demand for cheap, migrant labour, which in turn furnishes opportunities for exploitation in economic sectors of destination countries (Kelly, 2002). Trafficking, smuggling and illegal migration intersect and overlap in origin countries and what may begin as voluntary migration *'can result in trafficking and/or exploitation at a later stage'* (Anderson and Rogaly, 2005:19); a mutual agreement to be smuggled can result in a trafficking situation *'depending upon the actual conduct of the persons facilitating this form of illegal migration'* (Cadell, 2008:121). Once embarked upon a route of irregular migration, the evidence suggests the potential for exploitation is high, thus as Melrose (2010) argues, it is perhaps best to conceptualise these processes as existing on a *'continuum of predatory and exploitative practices'* (ibid:60). The current migration crisis created by war and conflict has exacerbated the risks for vulnerable people of being trafficked, due to the displacement of large masses of people and increasing numbers of people both being forced and desperately seeking to migrate. Women and girls are highly vulnerable and at risk of human trafficking for sexual exploitation in these precarious situations (Akee, Basu, Chau and Khamis, 2016).

Human trafficking is a highly gendered phenomenon. Data generated since 2005 by US State Department's *Trafficking in Persons Reports* (TIP) on transnational trafficking in persons estimates that between 600,000 to 800,000 men, women, and children are trafficked across international borders each year. A total of 80 per cent are women and girls, with up to 50 per cent under 18, the majority of whom are trafficked into commercial sexual exploitation. The International Labour Organisation (ILO) estimates 20.9 million people globally are victims of forced labour, including trafficking for sexual exploitation, and that this *'captures the full realm of human trafficking for labour and sexual exploitation'* (ILO, 2010:13). Within this, 4.5 million (22 per cent) are estimated to be victims of forced sexual exploitation and 14.2 million are victims of forced labour exploited in the private economy. Data from the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) indicates the vast majority, 96 per cent, of the identified victims of trafficking in human beings for sexual exploitation are female (UNODC, 2010). Trafficking into and within the European Union is highly gendered with three-quarters (75 per cent) of victims for all purposes being female. Data from Eurostat (2015) indicates a distinct gender split within the different types of exploitation, with trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation being the most prevalent form of trafficking in the EU (two-thirds or 67 per cent) and nearly all, 96 per cent, women.

Estimates of victims of human trafficking are based on those identified and registered as such in nation states. Therefore, despite the improved global estimates provided by bodies such as the ILO, UNODC and Eurostat, the ILO acknowledge an ongoing lack of reliable national data, made all the more complex by significant variations in the interpretation of the UN Protocol and depending upon who has the role of identifying victims of trafficking. Thus, the ratio between estimates of those who are identified as victims of trafficking and those who remain unidentified varies according to expert opinions, with estimates falling within a range of one in four, one in 10 and one in 20 (Di Nicola *et al.*, 2005; Kutnik *et al.*, 2007; UNODC, 2010).

2.2 Gender, migration, trafficking and prostitution

The demand for cheap labour continues to grow in particular sectors of the economies of richer countries with high levels of exploitation and most irregular migrants and trafficked people will find themselves within this 'shadow economy' (Sassen, 2003:264); locations where, as many commentators have observed, the normal protections of the state and the legal systems are largely absent (Aronowitz, Theuermann and Tyurykanova, 2010; Van Liemt, 2004). Female migrants are mainly located within the personal services or 'tertiary sector' (Monzini, 2005:70) including care work, catering, domestic labour, contract cleaning, and the 'sexual entertainment' and prostitution sectors. Migrant women now make up between 80 per cent and 90 per cent of those in prostitution in Italy, Spain, Austria and Luxembourg, and between 60 per cent and 75 per cent in Finland, the Netherlands, Belgium, Germany, France, Greece, Denmark and Norway (Tampep, 2009), suggesting an average of 84 per cent which is the widest range of nationalities in any one region (UNODC, 2010). The routes of migrant women into prostitution and international trafficking reflect the same pattern from less developed and poorer regions to richer ones, leading from the global South to the North. However, in the European context, the majority of victims of trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation are now female EU nationals from the poorer regions in Central and Eastern European states to the wealthier Western European Member States (Europol, 2016). The emergence of 'transnational red-light districts' in border regions in Europe such as Germany and the Czech Republic and Finland and Russia have been described as 'locations where the gendered and ethnicised demand of the wealthy and the supply of the poor are encountered in their most visible form' (Marttila, 2008:33).

The commercial sex trade is a highly lucrative location for exploiting women due to a number of factors including: the demand for a constant supply of new girls and women to meet male demand; the level of criminality, illegal activity, coercion and violence within the prostitution-related activities; the high profit margins for pimps and brothel owners in the organisation of the sale of commercial sex; and the potential for multiple occasions of use and exploitation (D'Cunha, 2002; Monzini, 2005; Kelleher et al., 2009). The UNODC (2010) estimates that as many as one million women in Europe are involved in prostitution

and one in seven of the women involved in this industry are trafficking victims, amounting to 140,000 women in total. It is estimated that in any national regime that regulates prostitution activities, between 10 per cent and 24 per cent of women will fit the international definition of being trafficked (Kutnik et al., 2007; Seo-Young et al., 2012) and that the profits alone from trafficked women in Europe could be as high as €2.5 billion (UNODC, 2010). Significantly, research consistently indicates victims of trafficking are inserted into the prostitution market, in which the demand for adult women as well as underage girls is high, and are intended for the same kind of users who consider the women and girls to be 'interchangeable goods' (Monzini, 2005:3). Consequently, any measures seeking to address human trafficking for sexual exploitation must recognise victims 'can be hidden within mixed populations of independent, exploited and coerced prostitutes and in mixed migration flows' (Walby et al., 2016).

In this context it is important to refer to the definition of human trafficking within the UN Palermo Protocol, which defines the broad range of situations of recruitment and transportation in which the consent of the person is deemed to be irrelevant where consent has been acquired by means of force, coercion, deception, fraud, the abuse of power over a person in a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits in order to gain control of a person. As Sigma Huda, the UN Special Rapporteur on Violence against Women argues, it is rare that entry to and involvement in prostitution 'does not involve, at the very least, an abuse of power and/or an abuse of vulnerability' including 'power disparities based on gender, race, ethnicity and poverty', and that therefore, one can conclude 'for the most part prostitution as actually practiced in the world, usually does satisfy the elements of trafficking' (Huda, 2006:23).

2.3 Gender equality and violence against women

The Resolution of the European Parliament of 26 February 2014 specifically addresses the impact of sexual exploitation and prostitution on gender equality (2013/2103(INI)). It recommends the European Commission undertakes further research on patterns of prostitution, trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation and the increased level of sex tourism in the EU. The Walby et al. (2016) study into the gender dimensions of trafficking recognises that while in legalised or regulated systems of prostitution, such as in Germany and the Netherlands, a certain level of exploitation is considered acceptable and legal when it is 'proportionate', in another sense:

the taking of profits from the selling of sex may be considered unreasonable exploitation per se, in the context of the pursuit of the goal of gender inequality whereby mutuality rather than commercial exchange in intimacy is regarded as an essential part of a system of gender equality (Walby et al., 2016:28).

The report also recognises the specific harm of sexual exploitation in that there are:

severe, brutal and long-term, gender-specific physical, gynaecological and mental health harms, risks to life and traumas from trafficking for purposes of sexual exploitation (Walby et al., 2016:8).

This reflects a substantial body of empirical evidence on the harm of sexual exploitation for trafficked and prostituted women. In a study of 207 girls and women who had been trafficked, almost all (95 per cent) had been subjected to severe and on-going physical and sexual violence; over half (57 per cent) reported physical injuries; 89 per cent reported threats of violence to themselves and their families including threats to kill, and 70 per cent reported that they had no freedom of movement (Zimmerman et al., 2006). Numerous studies indicate the consequences of being exploited in prostitution for women's physical, sexual, reproductive and mental health are severe and that the rates and frequency of extreme violence, including homicide, are exponentially higher for women in prostitution than the general population of women and girls (Coy, 2009; Farley et al., 2003; O'Connor, 2017; Potterat et al., 2004; Raphael and Shapiro, 2002; Raymond et al., 2002)

2.3 Gender equality and violence against women

Human traffickers operate within global supply and demand chains involving the targeting, recruitment and coercion of vulnerable people, those who transport and move people into destination countries' exploitative markets, those who profit from the exploitation of victims in those destination countries and the final link in the chain of exploitation, the buyer or consumer of labour or services from those victims (Monzini, 2005). The ILO uses the term 'demand' as 'the desire and preference for a particular commodity labour or service' and the term 'demand side' of trafficking to describe the 'nature and extent of exploitation of the trafficked victims after reaching the destination point'. They also factor in the 'social, cultural, political, economic, legal and development factors that

shape the demand and influence or enable the trafficking process' (ILO, 2006:2). However, without the demand for specific goods or services there would be no market and therefore no need for a supply. The International Organisation for Migration (IOM) identifies demand as the root cause of trafficking while acknowledging other contributing factors:

The demand for cheap labour, sexual services and certain criminal activities are root causes of trafficking. Poverty of opportunity and resources, as well as a lack of social power are other contributing factors. (IOM, 2014)

Some argue the demand for a service or goods does not necessarily mean a deliberate or intentional demand for that service or goods to be produced

by an exploited or trafficked person. However, in unregulated and exploitative sectors the ILO (2006:15) concludes that in reality 'demand for labour/services' may be indivisible from 'demand for labour/services from a trafficked person' and that studies of the demand aspect of trafficking should 'focus more broadly on demand for a certain type of labour/services' (2006:15).

A recent report examining progress taken by the European Commission and any other relevant stakeholders under the EU Strategy towards the eradication of trafficking in human beings (2012–2016) states:

Trafficking in human beings is a crime driven by demand and profit. The profits, in both the legal and illegal economies, result in a complex interplay between supply and demand that must be addressed if the crime is to be eradicated.

In relation to trafficking for sexual exploitation, this 'complex interplay' involves traffickers and recruiters targeting and exploiting vulnerable girls and women in order to supply them to the commercial sex trade; local pimps and prostitution 'businesses' and organisers profiting from that exploitation; and the demand from buyers of sex for a fresh supply of women and girls to meet their sexual demands in the commercial prostitution trade. As Walby et al. (2016:23) state:

Demand reduction concerns changing the wider environment into which people may be trafficked so as to reduce incentives for trafficking. In the case of trafficking for purposes of sexual exploitation, this wider environment is critically shaped by the institution of prostitution.

“

The demand for cheap labour, sexual services and certain criminal activities are root causes of trafficking. Poverty of opportunity and resources, as well as a lack of social power are other contributing factors. (IOM, 2014)

3

Comparative analysis of demand in the six Member States

3.1 Gender equality and violence against women

The critical importance of locating the issues of human trafficking, prostitution and demand firmly within a gender equality and gender-based violence framework underpins the six national reports, written by country experts. There is a shared understanding of trafficking and prostitution as gender specific forms of exploitation, both rooted in and causing gender inequality:

*Like other types of gender-based violence, such as domestic abuse and structural violence against women, trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation has wider causes of gender and social inequalities, and has wider social implications beyond the obvious and immediate damage to the victims of trafficking only. **Cypriot report***

The Cypriot expert also highlights how patriarchal values strongly promote the gender stereotypes and the objectification of women in Cyprus, especially migrant women, which *inter alia* normalises and increases demand for sexual services. This is demonstrated by the flourishing businesses of cabaret, nightclubs, bars, private apartments and massage parlour owners, which have become the location for the exploitation of thousands of trafficked women.

The Finnish expert finds political responses to trafficking for sexual exploitation and prostitution are framed by perspectives on violence against women. She explains that despite being regarded in many ways as a forerunner of women's citizenship and women's civil and political rights, Finland has struggled with adopting new policies and legislation when it comes to women's rights for their bodies and sexuality:

*The latest CEDAW report in 2014 criticised Finland once again for neglect concerning legislation on rape, support services for victims of rape, prostitution and domestic violence practices and services. These contexts frame the public and political attitude to prostitution in Finland. **Finnish report***

Prostitution is understood by all the experts as a serious barrier to gender equality, which is not just harmful to the prostituted woman or child, but also to society at large. Trafficking and prostitution are regarded as incompatible with internationally accepted principles of human

rights and the dignity and worth of the human person and the equal rights of men and women:

*To end prostitution and human trafficking for sexual purposes, the political, social, legal and economic conditions under which women and girls live should be ameliorated by introducing measures such as poverty reduction, sustainable development, measures that promote gender equality and counteract male violence against women and girls, as well as social programmes focusing specifically on women and girls. **Swedish report***

The Lithuanian report describes how the intersection of gender inequality and poverty is a driving factor in making girls and women vulnerable. Furthermore it outlines how pimps and traffickers intentionally target girls and women who experience economic, racial and/or ethnic marginalisation and discrimination:

*Fewer available jobs for women in the job market, gender discriminatory work policies, high level of unemployment, the wider economic situation, the low status of females in society and the problem of unequal opportunities for men and women are all push factors, with the main pull factor being the powerful demand for 'sexual services'. Networks of casinos and striptease clubs are expanding, and the means to recruit women for sexual exploitation are changing. **Lithuanian report***

The harm to women's physical, sexual, reproductive and psychological health is highlighted by the experts, all of whom work directly with trafficked women and women in prostitution and/or work closely with specialist services:

*Regardless of location and operating mode, prostitution behind closed doors forges a lawless zone where all types of violence go unpunished: insults, humiliations, assaults, rapes and even murders. Beyond this violence, the imposed sexual act itself is a form of violence, as proven by the physical and psychological damage and trauma presented by prostituted persons. **French report***

The consistent rise in the number of girls and women trafficked and prostituted in the European Union is of grave concern to all the experts. The Irish report reveals the highly organised and mobile nature of the contemporary sex trade where

international traffickers collaborate with pimps and prostitution agencies in destination countries in the commercial sexual exploitation of women and girls:

The sex industry is present and thriving in every county in Ireland; it is a highly gendered phenomenon and there are clearly interconnections between prostitution and trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation. Irish women still constitute a small number of women in prostitution but the vast majority of women are young, vulnerable migrants recruited and trafficked from impoverished regions of the world. Irish report

While they acknowledge EU and Member State initiatives to address this phenomenon, there is consensus that without recognising the demand to have girls and women available for sale as the root cause of trafficking for sexual exploitation, measures to combat it will fail:

It is understood that if men did not consider it their incontrovertible right to buy and sexually exploit women and children, prostitution and trafficking in human beings for sexual purposes would not occur. Swedish report

3.2 The profile of trafficked women and women in prostitution

The six Member States are countries of destination and transit for victims of trafficking, with Lithuania also being an origin or source country. The profile of women and girls who are trafficked and recruited into the commercial prostitution trade of the six countries reflects the general European pattern that the majority are migrant girls and women from impoverished regions of the world and the European Union, although national citizens still constitute a minority of women and girls who are trafficked and prostituted in each country. Third country nationals who are consistently identified across the six Member States include women from West Africa, particularly Nigeria, and Brazil, China, Ukraine and Russia. However, all six countries have seen a major increase in European citizens being identified as victims of trafficking, visible in indoor and street prostitution: in particular women from Lithuania, Estonia, Bulgaria, Latvia, Poland and Romania. Street prostitution remains visible in all countries but to a far lesser extent as the current commercial prostitution trade is primarily located in indoor venues such as nightclubs, strip clubs and massage parlours. It is increasingly found in private premises such as hotels and apartments, mainly organised through the internet, as well as in the homes of the prostitution users. The lack of available, reliable and consistent data in relation to the numbers of women in prostitution and those identified as victims, trafficked for sexual exploitation, was an issue of concern for most countries.

The historical and geopolitical contexts and the specific patterns of migration pertaining to each Member State has an impact on who constitutes victims of trafficking and those exploited in prostitution. In Cyprus, many migrant women have historically been and still are trafficked in Cyprus for sexual exploitation under the pretext of working as 'entertainment' dancers in cabarets and nightclubs by obtaining the 'artiste' visas (now renamed as 'performer' visa). The term 'artiste' in Cyprus has been used interchangeably with the term 'prostitute' not only by the wider Cypriot society, but also by the state itself since the mid-70s. During the 1980s the issue of the 'artistes' became subject to heated debate, since migrant women working under this specific status were often forced and coerced into prostitution. This resulted in attempts from the relevant governmental authorities to implement stricter criteria for the entry of 'artistes' to Cyprus in order to limit sexual exploitation but also to exercise more control over labour migration more generally. The majority of women who entered Cyprus under this status came mainly from two Asian countries, the Philippines and Thailand, but also from countries of the Middle East and Latin America. During the 1990s, the collapse of socialist regimes of the eastern bloc and the increase in unemployment and poverty – mostly affecting women – combined with the prohibition of Filipino women working as 'artistes', led to the birth of a new 'trend' in relation to sexual exploitation of women in Cyprus. Eastern European women became the women of choice for traffickers and buyers of sexual services, a phenomenon which continues to the present day.

In Finland, the commercial sex trade expanded in the early 1990s with the dissolution of the Soviet Union, the establishment of new regimes in the former Eastern Bloc and a serious domestic recession. The recession caused large-scale unemployment and bankruptcies that led to the need to start new small businesses, which included topless bars, striptease bars and sex telephone services. The trade of Finnish and foreign women for prostitution purposes expanded and demand and buying of sex became more acceptable and more visible in the public sphere. The Finnish expert highlights the high mobility of migrant women in prostitution in Finland, being moved around the country, staying in one place only for a short period of time and many then leaving the country. An estimation by the Finnish National Bureau of Investigation is that 500 to 1,000 persons are selling sex on any given day with only about 200 to 300 of them estimated to be living permanently in Finland (Niemi and Aaltonen, 2014).

From the early 2000s, Ireland saw a major shift from street-based prostitution, mainly populated by Irish and some women from the U.K., to a rapidly expanding indoor commercial sex trade populated by migrant women. Research published in 2009 (Kelleher *et al.*, 2009) revealed a highly organised and mobile sex trade with an estimated 1,000 women in indoor prostitution. Over 800 women are advertised on the internet; 87 per cent to 97 per cent of whom are migrant women aged between 18 and 58 years with some evidence that girls as young as 16 years are involved; 51 different nationalities of women advertised including a high number of women from Latin America and Central European countries. This research found 102 women were identified as victims trafficked for sexual exploitation, 11 per cent of whom were minors at the time, the majority of whom were from West Africa. Official figures published since 2009 indicate that an average of 65 people were identified as alleged and/or suspected victims of trafficking each year, the majority of whom are women who have been trafficked for the purpose of sexual exploitation from Africa, South Asia and Latin America with an increasing number from the EU in recent times. The Irish authorities have recently reported an increase in suspected victims of trafficking from Nigeria (some related to upheavals from Boko Haram attacking villages), Romania, Brazil and Pakistan. The identification process in Ireland continues to be criticised by international monitoring bodies and it is believed the official figures do not reflect the number of women trafficked to Ireland.

Lithuania is a transit and destination country, but it is also a source country for women and girls subjected to trafficking for the purpose of prostitution. Observers estimate 40 per cent of

identified Lithuanian trafficking victims are women and girls subjected to sex trafficking within the country. Lithuanian women are also subjected to sex trafficking in Western Europe and Scandinavia. An average of 100 victims of trafficking are identified on an annual basis, the majority of whom have been trafficked for the purpose of sexual exploitation. As an origin country, Lithuania provides valuable insight into the targeting and recruiting of vulnerable girls and women by pimps and traffickers. Poverty is a critical underlying factor in all cases, but the Lithuanian expert describes how the intersection of poverty with other factors in the lives of marginalised and isolated groups in society leads to their being directly targeted by pimps and traffickers:

[Risk factors include] experience of poverty or homelessness, lack of education, use of alcohol, drugs or gambling addiction, involvement in criminal activities, experience of psychological, physical or sexual abuse, violence in a family, young people unable to take care of his or her social, material, emotional life, people who have mental disorders and those already involved in prostitution. Lithuanian report

Lithuania has identified children in residential care as a particularly vulnerable group. It has been revealed that an estimated 4,000 children institutionalised in orphanages, and those in special schools and foster homes have been groomed and targeted for sexual abuse, sexual exploitation and prostitution by people known to them. Lithuania has also seen the emergence of a new form of trafficking which targets the same vulnerable girls and women for the purpose of exploitative sham marriage. The patterns of recruitment into prostitution are similar in that girls and young women are groomed and targeted by organisers and traffickers to migrate to Western European countries, but in this case the purpose is to provide a mechanism for third country nationals to circumvent European immigration laws by marrying an EU citizen. In France, they have also observed a rejuvenation of pimps procuring on council housing estates, with new and very tough networks recruiting the most vulnerable minors. There has also been an alarming phenomenon of the arrival of increasingly younger Nigerian girls and women to France. It is estimated between 6,000 and 8,000 minors are involved in the prostitution sector, 30 per cent of whom are French.

The number of women in prostitution in Sweden has remained very low (approx. 600-800), compared with neighbouring countries, since the introduction of the legislation making the purchase of a sexual service illegal. The number of cases of trafficking in human beings for sexual purposes has also been relatively

stable since the introduction of legislation in 2002 and 2004 which criminalises all forms of trafficking in human beings. The victims of human trafficking for sexual purposes to, through and within Sweden, are almost without exception women and girls, mainly between 16 and 40 years of age, with some younger girls also falling victim. The majority of women in recent years were citizens of EU Member States from Eastern and South-Eastern Europe, in particular Romania, with women being recruited in Bulgaria, Ukraine, Russia, Lithuania and Poland. Some women, who originally came to Europe from Nigeria and who hold residence permits in, for example, Italy and Spain, were also trafficked to Sweden for prostitution purposes. Likewise, the traffickers, recruiters and procurers of victims who were trafficked to Sweden for prostitution purposes over time, are citizens of the same European Member States (some with permanent residency in Sweden) and are part of smaller networks that recruit victims locally in friendship circles, through family connections, or with the use of social media. In 2016, the number

of reported cases of trafficking in human beings for sexual purposes increased to 85 compared with 2015 when only 58 cases were reported. Most of these cases (46) were reported by the Swedish Migration Authority, and involved, in the majority of cases, crimes which were committed in countries other than Sweden, against women and girls who were fleeing armed conflict, starvation or national disasters in countries such as Syria, Iraq and Afghanistan.

The six experts expressed increasing concern regarding the grooming, targeting and sexual exploitation of young girls who are vulnerable, marginalised or in institutional care in their own countries. The current migration crisis is also of grave concern in creating further high risk contexts for girls and women. These issues are critical to highlight as they demonstrate the need for special protection measures to be put in place by statutory and voluntary agencies in Member States and by international agencies working with displaced people and refugee populations.

3.3 Demand: the buyers of sex

A recent EU funded transnational study provides insight into the profile and behaviour of buyers within Member States. The research was conducted in 2014 across five countries: Bulgaria, Cyprus, Finland, Ireland and Lithuania and included interviews or completed surveys with 763 purchasers of sex, 71 face-to-face interviews and 692 online survey responses (Keegan and Yonkova, 2014). The average buyer of sex is male, well-educated, with middle to high income, and in a relationship at the time of the purchase of a sexual act. In the main, the male buyers viewed the females involved in the transactions as consenting adults and were unlikely to conceptualise the women from whom they purchased sex as potential victims of human trafficking. This despite the fact almost one third of male respondents who reported purchasing sex also reported encountering some form of exploitation including sellers who were legally under the age of consensual sex. When asked what would make them refrain from buying, the primary deterrents indicated were public exposure and/or legal measures.

A previously unpublished qualitative study conducted in Cyprus by MIGS casts further light on the attitude of buyers to the women they

purchase. Most interviewees were aware that women in prostitution may be victims of trafficking but they still want the 'services' they paid for and will not ask whether this woman was forced or not into prostitution. As the Cypriot expert explains:

Sex buyers adopt a position of conscious non-responsibility...they are not concerned about the personal histories or circumstances of women... what brings many men into the market of commercial sex is the unrealistic and socially ingrained sense of entitlement to have their 'sexual needs' met under any circumstances, and to obtain what they consider rightfully theirs. Cypriot report

According to the Cypriot expert one of the major factors affecting demand for sexual services in Cyprus is the tendency to stereotype and objectify women, and particularly Eastern European women, as sex symbols:

Racial and ethnic stereotypes play a prominent role in the sex industry and this inherent sexism and racism led to the stereotype that Eastern European women – poor, white, blond, tall and thin – are sexually available, willing to please and with no sexual inhibitions. Cypriot report

This intersection of sexism and racism is also reflected in a study of buyers in Finland, who mostly bought in Baltic countries, in particular Tallinn in Estonia (Marttila, 2008). The study reveals that part of the attraction of prostitution is a desire to have sex in the context of traditional gender order and male dominance accompanied by 'ethno-sexualisation of "other" women', which she argues 'may be used to justify the objectification and exploitation of women of a different nationality' (ibid:42).

Research in Ireland analysing over 1,000 postings on Punter.net Ireland (an internet site where buyers post reviews on the women from whom they have bought sex) reveals the same consumerist and commodified attitude to women as seen in the studies above (Kelleher *et al.*, 2009). The key ratings were for: good value for money; the physical attributes of women; the degree of sexual gratification and satisfaction with explicit details of sexual acts demanded; the expectation that the women enjoy the sex with severe criticism of women who did not appear engaged; and an expectation of 'the girlfriend experience'.

The French expert also points out that demand is influenced by the approach to prostitution in bordering countries. France is surrounded on almost all borders by countries with a non-abolitionist approach: Belgium, Switzerland, Germany and Spain especially, which offer shop windows and brothels of all sizes, from clubs and bars through to 'industrial' establishments. The trafficking of prostituted persons is also significant on borders, traditionally on the Belgian border, and now very widespread towards Geneva but also Catalonia, with young men from the south of France organising carpools to go to the brothels at La Jonquera. This is an important observation for the EU in monitoring trends of buyers following the introduction of measures to address demand in a Member State.

According to Swedish official crime data over 20 years, all perpetrators of the offence that criminalises the purchase of a sexual service or a sexual act from a child under the age of 18, are men and boys. Male prostitution users pay for sexual acts while exploiting women, girls, men and boys. They represent all ages, with the majority being between 25 and 55 years of age, all income classes and a wide diversity of nationalities and ethnic backgrounds. Prostitution users have been, or are, married or cohabiting with a partner of the opposite or same sex, and they often have children. Men who have or have had many sexual partners are the most common prostitution users (National Institute for Population Health, 2000). The majority

of men who had purchased sexual services had done so on one to three occasions, whereas one in 10 of the prostitution users had purchased a sexual service on more than 10 occasions, often in connection with job-related travels (Svedin, 2012).

A recent pilot study of prostitution users in the region of Stockholm showed that of the 274 cases in 2016 reported under the offence that prohibits the purchase of a sexual service (including attempts), 188 prostitution users were Swedish citizens, with the remaining 86 representing 38 different nationalities. All prostitution users were men between 15 and 81 years of age, with seven prostitution users being under 20 years old, the majority of prostitution users contacting the procurers via online prostitution websites, and sexually exploiting the victims in their own private homes or in a hotel (Report 18, National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings, 2017).

Patterns of demand and the attitudes displayed by buyers in the six Member States reflect international research which consistently indicates a commodified and consumerist perspective, with buyers expressing a strong sense of entitlement as consumers to have one's sexual demands met once payment has been made (Coy, Horvath and Kelly, 2007; MacLeod, Farley, Anderson and Golding, 2008; O'Connell Davidson, 1998). The primary concern of buyers is to have their sexual needs met; they are unlikely to be discerning or concerned about the means through which women entered prostitution, the circumstances they are currently in or whether they are coerced or trafficked.

3.4 National legislation addressing demand

All Member States have introduced legislation to address the demand for the purchase of sex from victims of trafficking. However, as this section will demonstrate, measures introduced reflect the different political perspectives on prostitution which pertain to each country. The limited approach in Finland, Cyprus and Lithuania (and prior to 2017 in Ireland) involves laws which criminalise the purchase of sexual acts only where the person is a victim of trafficking and/or procuring. This section will examine these legislative measures and some of the debates surrounding the introduction of these offences.

3.4.1 Criminalising the purchase of sexual acts from a trafficked person

In Finland, there is a partial sex-purchase ban prohibiting purchasing sex from victims of the sexual trade who have been subjected to pandering and human trafficking. The criminal code on sex offences was changed in 2006 after a long political and public debate that began with a government bill in 2004 which did not suggest banning the purchase of sex, but proposed the strengthening of the provision on pandering, establishing a new provision on human trafficking and aggravated pandering and giving the police more rights when investigating certain crimes. This bill laid the groundwork for discussion by extensively describing the current prostitution situation. In 2005, a bill was proposed banning the purchase of sex from any person while not criminalising the selling of sex, with the rationale of curbing the demand of prostitution and international crime connected to prostitution and human trafficking. However, following intensive debate which failed to reflect the human rights and gender equality focus of the original bill, a variety of possible problems with implementation and possible misinterpretations of the provision were brought up including: changing the Criminal Code is not an effective method in reducing organised crime around prostitution; it should not be changed on moral grounds; social policy could better address these issues; and banning the purchase of sex would violate basic rights - meaning mainly the basic rights of those men who purchase sex (Aaltio, 2009). Finally, while there was a strong consensus on protecting the victims of human trafficking and procuring, the bill was defeated and, as a compromise, the provision was to ban the purchase of sex only when the seller was a victim of procuring

and human trafficking, the offender was aware of the circumstances and the attempt was intentional.

A precedent for the threshold of intentionality was set in a 2012 case in the Supreme Court where the defendant accused of the abuse of a sexual trade victim was found innocent as the Supreme Court ruled the offence was not intentional. The Supreme Court stated that although the intention in establishing the partial sex-purchase ban was to encourage buyers of sex to make sure the person in prostitution is not a victim of sexual trade, there could not be a lower threshold in proving intentionality in these cases than there is in other criminal cases. The Supreme Court decided the general provision of intentionality in the Criminal Code was applicable (KKO, 2012:66). This case was widely discussed because of the vulnerable position of the plaintiff: she did not speak Finnish or English and appeared younger than her age would have suggested. In 2015, further changes to the law were made where the purchase of sex from victims of the sexual trade through negligence was criminalised making it a criminal offence to engage in sexual intercourse or comparable sexual act for payment when there is a reason to suspect the seller is a victim of pandering or human trafficking. This means the buyers of sex can no longer avoid legal responsibility by gaining as little information as possible from the person selling sex and the conditions surrounding them. The new provision is meant to be easier to apply (HE 229/2014).

*In Cyprus, Article 17 of the Trafficking Law 60(I) 2014 'penalises persons who use services provided by victims of trafficking if they should reasonably have been able to assume that the service was provided by a victim of trafficking.'*⁵

Article 61 also contains provisions regarding preventive and intervention measures discouraging demand as per the requirements stated in the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings and Directive 2011/36/EU.

When a person is found guilty the person is subject to imprisonment for up to three years or to a fine not exceeding €15,000 or both penalties. To date there have been no convictions under this provision. However, efforts from civil society, mainly MIGS and other local NGOs, by lobbying key MPs are

⁵ *Ibid.*

seeking to exert pressure on the state to remove the wording 'reasonable assumption' found in this article, since it can inhibit the delivery of justice by creating loopholes for perpetrators. The proposal is currently under discussion at the parliamentary committee with responsibility for human rights and equal opportunities for men and women.

In Lithuania, in 2012, the laws on human trafficking were amended to prosecute the users of forced labour and services taking into account Directive 2001/36/EU. The law is clear in that it is only applicable where the use of force can be demonstrated. No buyers of sex have been prosecuted under this law. The issue of the liability of a client for buying sexual services was further addressed in June 2005 in the Administrative Violations Code, which was one of the measures to reduce the demand for prostitution services in Lithuania. The offence covers both persons who earn from prostitution and persons who use paid prostitution services. It excludes persons who have been involved in prostitution who are dependent or under physical or psychological violence or deception, by any means, or being a minor and/or a victim of human trafficking, when the status is recognised in the criminal proceedings. According to this article, a fine (from 300 to 1,000 LTL) may be imposed on the prostitute and the client. In reality, the Lithuanian expert asserts that the evidence consistently indicates that women in prostitution are primarily the focus of law enforcement. In relation to buyers, they are rarely prosecuted and as this is a minor administrative offence the only penalty is a minimal fine.

3.4.2 Criminalising the purchase of sex from any person

The Swedish response to prostitution arose within the context of the public debate which originated in the 1960s regarding sexual relations and power differences between men and women, leading to new insights and new initiatives to strengthen and ameliorate the position of women in society. A feminist analysis of violence against women emerged, framing male violence as a crucial mechanism for maintaining male power and the subordinate position of women. Prostitution is understood to be a form of male sexualised violence against women and as a serious barrier to gender equality, which was harmful to the prostituted woman or child, but also to society at large. The initiative to criminalise men was eventually carried forward in the late 1990s by the women's associations of the political parties.

In 1998 a government bill on violence against women was presented to the Swedish Parliament and, among other actions aiming to address male violence against

women, proposed the criminalisation of the purchase of sexual services. This Act was the outcome of two Commissions of Inquiry presented in 1995 – one on prostitution and one on violence against women. The law on prostitution was thus firmly embedded within measures to address male violence against women, including a strengthened sexual harassment law and a new offence punishing repeated instances of male violence against a woman in an intimate relationship:

The legislation that prohibits the purchase of a sexual service came into being as one in a series of preventive laws and measures aimed specifically at the protection of vulnerable women and girls against serious acts of sexual violence, but also to create a society where the culture of domination through prostitution is changed into a culture where the human rights of all women and girls are protected. Swedish report

On 1 January 1999, Sweden became the first country in the world to introduce a law prohibiting the purchase of sexual services. The legislation was later incorporated into the Penal Code as a criminal law offence, with the following wording:

A person who, in other cases than previously stated in this chapter, obtains a casual sexual relation in exchange for payment shall be sentenced for the purchase of a sexual service to a fine or imprisonment for at the most one year. Swedish Penal Code, Chapter 6: Sexual Crimes, Chapter 6)

What is stated in the first paragraph also applies if the payment has been promised or made by someone else. The offence applies to all forms of sexual services, whether they are purchased on the street, in brothels, in a hotel, in someone's home, or in other similar circumstances. Attempts to purchase a sexual service are also punishable under the Penal Code. Those who are exploited in prostitution are not subject to criminal or administrative penalties and the law provided extensive resources to the provision of services to support those exploited.

There have been some amendments to the offence. The offence now also criminalises the purchase of a sexual service by a third person or group of persons purchasing a sexual service for someone else. This situation can occur when a sexual service is offered as a gift in the context of a stag party or, for example, when businesses offer it as a business benefit or for male business associates. On 1 July 2011, amendments to the offence came into force, including an increase in the maximum sentence from six months to one year in prison. The purpose of the increase of the penalty scale was to allow a more nuanced assessment by the courts in aggravated cases of the purchase of

sexual services. This could be, for example, when the prostitution buyer uses excessive force, or infringes upon the dignity of the victim through humiliating acts. As a result of the increase in the penalty scale, the opportunities for law enforcement to apprehend and arrest prostitution users were also expanded. Law enforcement is permitted to use mobile phone dumping to establish how and through which medium prostitution users are able to contact the organisers of the prostitution users, meet up with their victims and sometimes ascertain the method of payment.

Significantly, from the outset the Swedish law was not simply punitive; it was intended to be declarative and normative, sending a very clear message that it is unacceptable to buy a person for sexual gratification:

the legislation, policies and strategies that aim to discourage the demand are primarily designed to ensure that men take criminal, ethical and normative responsibility for their own and other men's oppressive sexual behaviour, and importantly, change/modify their conduct. Swedish report

From 2000 on, Sweden developed and implemented comprehensive policies and strategies across all policy areas to ensure the implementation of the laws on prostitution and trafficking. In 2001, the Swedish Government appointed a Special Advisor on Prostitution and Trafficking in Human Beings based in the Government Division on Gender Equality. This advisor was charged with the task of coordinating actions within the government, with the responsible public agencies, including the National Police, and with specialised social services agencies, women's equality-seeking associations, and other civil society and human rights organisations. The integration of measures to address prostitution and trafficking into the institutions of the state has continued to the present day; these are elaborated upon in Section 3.4.3.

In April 2016, the French Government passed a comprehensive legislative framework aiming to strengthen the fight against the system of prostitution and trafficking for sexual exploitation. The law reflects abolitionist principles embodying gender equality, human rights and freedom from sexual violence and sexual exploitation. The French law came about after a long, sustained campaign and political engagement led by Mouvement du Nid working closely with politicians and policy makers. The criminalisation of buyers of sex was the subject of heated debates, particularly on the nature of the crime to be filed. In the end, the provision is a simple misdemeanour rather than a more serious offence that abolitionists fought for. The legal provision states that:

The act of soliciting, accepting or obtaining relations of a sexual nature from a person engaging in prostitution, including on an occasional basis, in exchange for remuneration, a promise of remuneration, the provision of benefits in kind or the promise of such benefits is punishable by a €1,500 fine. (Law No 2016-444)

The Act also includes higher penalties for repeated offences punishable by a €3,750 fine and supplementary punishment in the form of awareness training where the buyer is obligated, where required, at his own expense, to complete an awareness course deterring the purchase of sex acts.

While there has been much media focus on these provisions, the law is far more wide-ranging. The Act modifies the provisions of nine legislative codes introducing severe penalties for the organisation of prostitution, pimping and procuring; extensive support measures and resources to support people in prostitution including exit routes and welfare support. It also contains specific measures and residency rights for migrant and trafficked persons. Temporary residence permits to a victim of procuring or trafficking is extended *'for the entire duration of the process to exit prostitution and achieve social and professional integration, as long as the conditions foreseen for its issuance continue to be met.'*

As in Sweden, the law is also intended to be declarative in stating that no individual shall:

derive any gain whatsoever from the prostitution of others, nor shall they organise or facilitate the commodification of the human body and of sexuality; they shall not access the body of others or their sexuality or obtain sexual relations in exchange for remuneration; and no person shall be reduced to selling access to their body and their sexuality to survive. French report

Given the increasing use of the internet in the organisation of prostitution, it is worth noting the French law contains a provision which creates an *'obligation upon internet service providers to promptly inform the competent public authorities of any content that violates the Act in respect of pimping, and to make public the means and measures they devote to combatting such illegal activities'*.

In Ireland, The Criminal Law (Sexual Offences) Act 2017 was enacted with a provision criminalising the purchase of sex. Following a major campaign, lobbying and political engagement by the Turn Off the Red Light campaign, in 2012 the Department of Justice and Equality published a Discussion Document on the Future Direction of Prostitution Legislation. The

Joint Oireachtas (Parliament) Committee on Justice, Defence and Equality was requested by the Minister to undertake public consultation and hearings on the document. The Committee received over 800 written submissions for consideration and, on foot of the submissions, the Committee agreed to hear evidence in a series of public and private hearings from relevant organisations and individuals. The Committee also examined various approaches to reform having regard to the positions adopted in other jurisdictions, including Sweden, New Zealand, the Netherlands, Germany and Australia, noting the differing views expressed by those who engaged with the review process to the different approaches.

In its final report the Committee noted the high degree (four in five) support for the Swedish approach expressed by contributors to the review, including the unequivocal support by Trade Unions which had rejected prostitution as a form of work, the Irish Medical Organisation, the service providers assisting those (including children) who are victims of harm and exploitation in prostitution and organisations supporting migrants and other ethnic minorities who are victims of trafficking. In addition to a strongly positive normative effect on social attitudes to sexuality and gender equality, the Committee found a demand reduction led approach with the introduction of a ban on the purchase of sex could lessen the incidence of harms associated with prostitution and the economic basis for human trafficking in Ireland for the purpose of sexual exploitation. The Committee also concluded that measures which reduce demand for prostitution would contribute to the State's fulfilment of its obligations to eliminate discrimination against women, to combat prostitution and sexual exploitation of children, to suppress the exploitation in prostitution of women, and to prevent and suppress human trafficking and the demand for it. The Committee further recommended law reform to include the introduction of a summary offence penalising the purchase of sexual services of another person by means of prostitution, or any request, agreement or attempt to do so. It should also be clarified that no offence is committed by the person whose sexual services are sold. The Committee also recommended increased penalties for trafficking for the purposes of sexual exploitation.

In 2015, The Criminal Law (Sexual Offences) Bill was published and following a lengthy parliamentary debate the Act was passed on 22 February 2017. The Act is a wide-ranging piece of legislation containing provisions including improved measures to protect children from online predators; strengthened offences to tackle child pornography; harassment orders to protect victims of convicted sex offenders; provisions to be introduced regarding evidence

by victims, particularly children; maintaining the age of consent to sexual activity at 17 years of age and providing for a new 'proximity of age' defence. Part 4 of the Act introduces an offence which criminalises any person who purchases or attempts to purchase sexual activity from another person:

A person who pays, gives, offers or promises to pay or give a person (including a prostitute) money or any other form of remuneration or consideration for the purpose of engaging in sexual activity with a prostitute shall be guilty of an offence and shall be liable on summary conviction— (a) in the case of a first offence, to a class E fine, and (b) in the case of a second or subsequent offence, to a class D fine.

An amendment to older legislation pertaining to the selling of sex on the streets removes the offence for soliciting for the purpose of prostitution but, importantly, the offence of soliciting for the purpose of buying sex remains. This was a critical part of the lobbying process as there was some pressure to maintain a public order offence against the seller in street prostitution.

Although the purchase of sex offence is seen as minor (it is a summary offence involving a fine) the fact it is contained within sexual offences legislation was welcomed by those campaigning for the law, as it sends out a strong signal that this is an unacceptable sexual act. In the introduction of the law and the political debate which ensued during parliamentary debates, the Minister consistently referred to the law as promoting gender equality and that prostitution is a form of violence and sexual exploitation. Unfortunately, unlike in France, there are no statutory provisions or administrative policies providing that a person exploited in prostitution, even in particularly vulnerable situations, is entitled to receive a temporary residence permit if needed in order to co-operate with a criminal investigation/prosecution (including serious organised crime) or to access recovery/exit programmes and support.

Following the passing of the law the Government announced that a review of the law relating to prostitution would be carried out within three years. The review will include:

- information as to the number of arrests and convictions in respect of offences under section 7A of the Act of 1993 during the period from the commencement of that section,
- an assessment of the impact of the operation of that section on the safety and well-being of persons who engage in sexual activity for payment.

To date no figures have been released by an Garda Síochána (the Irish police) on arrests under the new legislation.

In Ireland, prior to 2017, the approach to addressing the demand for the purchase of sex was limited to the purchase of sex from a trafficked person. The Criminal Law (Human Trafficking) Act 2008 contains a provision making it illegal to 'solicit or importune' a trafficked person for the purpose of sex. A person guilty of an offence under this section is liable on summary conviction to a fine not exceeding €5,000 or a term of imprisonment not exceeding 12 months, or both. However, if the defendant can prove that he or she did not know and had no reasonable grounds for believing the person in respect of whom the offence was committed was a trafficked person, s/he cannot be prosecuted. There have been no convictions to date. The 2017 Act amends the trafficking legislation by broadening the scope of the original offence from 'soliciting or importuning' a trafficked person and it is now an offence for a person to pay, give, offer or promise to pay or give a person (including the trafficked person) money or any other form of remuneration or consideration for the purposes of the prostitution of a trafficked person. The maximum penalty for this offence is five years. This offence remains in place alongside the recent introduction of the sex buyer offence which means the offence of buying a victim of trafficking is still considered a more serious offence than the buying of sex from any another person in Irish law. As in France, the criminalisation of the purchase of sex in Ireland came about after a lengthy political process and public campaign which is described in Section 2.

3.4.3 Criminalising prostitution

In line with international obligations, EU Member States have introduced numerous measures to address trafficking in human beings including dedicated legislation, government policy frameworks, national action plans, specialised police officers and units, and a range of provisions to deliver services and legal representation to those identified as victims across the six Member States. Trafficking laws contain severe penalties and police operations have resulted in many successful prosecutions and convictions of traffickers in the six Member States.⁶ However, while it is understood trafficking is a difficult and complex crime to prosecute, there is agreement among experts that the number of convictions remains worryingly low and that sentencing is not consistent or sufficiently harsh to act as a deterrent. Furthermore, in relation to trafficking for sexual exploitation, the conviction of traffickers is only one element of addressing demand embedded within the wider environment in which

trafficking for sexual exploitation exists; namely prostitution. International traffickers co-operate with domestic traffickers, pimps, procurers and organisers of prostitution in destination countries, facilitating and profiting from the demand for girls and women to be available for sexual exploitation. In contrast to the extensive laws, severe penalties and state infrastructure surrounding trafficking, besides Sweden, prostitution has been mainly dealt with as a public order offence within criminal and/or administrative law as a misdemeanour, with harsher penalties for pimping, procuring and the organisation of prostitution. Until very recently in Ireland and France, and currently in Cyprus and Lithuania, the focus of law enforcement is on the maintenance of public order, in particular the buying and selling of sex in street locations, with occasional police operations targeting organised crime and brothel keeping. The experts in these Member States concur that where both the seller and the buyer are criminalised for minor public order offences such as soliciting and importuning, the burden of criminality traditionally fell on women on the streets, with occasional arrests of buyers for soliciting on the streets. As the Cypriot expert states:

prostitution is not perceived as a matter of violence against women and sexual exploitation or a violation of their right to physical integrity, life and freedom, but merely as a behaviour that violates social order and morality. **Cypriot report**

In Cyprus, even though the operation of a brothel, the promotion of women into prostitution, coercion in prostitution and pimping as well as soliciting are criminal offences under the Cypriot Criminal Code, these offences are considered to be misdemeanours and not felonies, which results in low sentences, leading the Cypriot expert to conclude, '[in the] most part indoor locations act with impunity'. Prostitution as such is not a criminal offence so, as it stands, those criminalised under the penal code are the pimps and brothel owners as well as women in prostitution while sex buyers remain invisible. They are regarded as the 'victims' of being solicited to buy sex and consequently not criminalised.

The Cypriot expert also highlights the differential treatment of migrant women in prostitution. In an article under aliens and immigration law, the penal code stipulates that prostitutes and persons living from earnings made from prostitution are prohibited immigrants who are not allowed to enter Cyprus. Therefore, while a woman, irrespective of her ethnic origin, is not subjected to criminal

6. The wider response to trafficking including the details of convictions are contained in the National Reports.

prosecution under the Criminal Code, if a foreign woman is arrested for prostitution, she is deported and declared to be a forbidden immigrant under rapid administrative procedures. Whether she has been the victim of trafficking for sexual exploitation is usually taken into consideration but, inevitably, the woman is issued with the order.

In Finland, although the selling or buying of sex is as such not criminalised, purchasing or offering of 'sexual services' in a public place is prohibited under public order offences. There have been periods of enhanced surveillance of the streets, for example by the Helsinki police in 2011, but not in recent years. The enforcement of the legislation in question is not at all systematic, and according to police statistics street prostitution has not been targeted in recent years. The punishment for a public order offence is a fine of €100 but the offence will not lead to an entry into the criminal record or a trial, since it is considered a minor offence. However, as in Cyprus, there is an additional consequence for non-citizens and those not holding residence permits as they may be refused entry to the country if there is reasonable cause to suspect she or he is selling sexual services. The Finnish expert cites extensive research which concludes, 'one can safely assume that the Public Order Act is targeting mainly women with foreign origin selling sex and only in some cases men buying sex' (Niemi and Aaltonen, 2014).

In relation to cases regarding abuse of victims of the sex trade, procuring and trafficking, there is some evidence of a slow increase since 2010. However, the researchers found the majority of charges of sex purchase are waived and where there is a charge it is minimal, in most cases a fine. They also note that in several procuring and trafficking cases there was no mention that police had registered or investigated sex purchasers (ibid., 2014). The Finnish expert found:

the partial sex-purchase ban probably has little effect in reducing the demand for prostitution, since getting prosecuted for these crimes happens rarely and when it does, the punishment is most probably rather small, even considering the penal scale of this particular offence. This pattern of enforcement does not support the purpose of the provision to especially protect those who are being subjected to trafficking, sexual exploitation and illegal practices. **Finnish report**

The expert also cites the concerns of the National Rapporteur who noted in practice, threats of violence, debt relationship and limitations of one's autonomy are often interpreted as part of pandering/pimping rather than elements of human trafficking. Trafficking in human beings has more often been thought of in terms of recruiting and transportation

of victims rather than seen as a process of abuse and submission. In enforcement and implementation of the law there have been definitive problems with understanding that a situation which had initially started on a voluntary basis can become human trafficking when abuse, violence and threats increase. This might be caused by the general tendency not to recognise violence against women and the fact that prostitution is mostly seen as an immigration and public safety issue in Finnish discourse. These concerns are shared by the Lithuanian expert who highlights the fact there has been a failure to identify victims of trafficking who are located among women in prostitution. Indicators of trafficking including coercion, control and exploitation are not recognised, leading to victims of trafficking being subjected to administrative offences for prostitution.

In Ireland, prior to 2017, a similar pattern pertained with the focus on public order offences on the streets, which resulted in mainly those selling sex being criminalised and occasional police operations on brothel keeping and organised crime. However, the Irish expert observed a dramatically low level of soliciting offences in 2015/6 which would suggest (although this cannot be verified) a number of factors related to the campaign may have had an impact upon police practice including:

the dialogue with the Turn Off the Red Light campaign with the Gardai (police) in relation to the vulnerability of women in prostitution; the report and engagement with the Oireachtas (Parliament) committee and in particular the training and close co-operation with Ruhamá in relation to diverting rather than arresting women on the street; and the awareness of the new law de-criminalising women in prostitution that was coming. **Irish report**

This is an important observation highlighting the value of close co-operation between the police, specialist women's services and those campaigning for change in revealing the harm and levels of exploitation women in prostitution may be subjected to, even if they are not victims of trafficking. However, the streets now represent a very small part of the commercial sex trade in Ireland. For the most part, a trend which has been observed in all six countries is the movement indoors, primarily into brothels and private premises such as apartments and hotels. This further increases the ability of pimps and organisers to operate away from public and police scrutiny. A particular factor of interest in Ireland is that publishing or distributing any advertisements for brothels or prostitutes in Ireland is prohibited. The prohibition also covers advertisements

7. NGO service for women in prostitution.

for brothels posted on the internet but does not cover advertisements located outside the State, which has resulted in the main website advertising prostitution in Ireland being located outside the jurisdiction. The French law has a specific provision making the advertising and promotion of prostitution on the internet a criminal offence and it will be worth monitoring how this can be implemented.

Prior to 2016 in France, as in the countries above, the focus of law enforcement was on women on the streets, procuring and the organisation of prostitution. Every year more than 1,500 prostituted persons were arrested for crimes of solicitation. However since April 2016 not a single prostituted person has been arrested on these grounds and 937 clients have been arrested in the year following the introduction of the law. The French expert notes France has very severe penalties for trafficking and pimping/procuring and that many police operations have resulted in successful prosecutions of transnational procuring and trafficking networks involving Romanian, Nigerian, Chinese, Eastern European, Central and South American and Western European operators, including two French operators. However, a continuing weakness is in the lack of consistency in enforcement and sentencing, with the judiciary in many cases opting for the minimum as opposed to the maximum sentencing options.

The recent French law has clearly had an immediate impact on policing in terms of the focus of law enforcement being on the buyer not the person selling sex on the streets. But the French expert highlights a number of challenges ahead, including: the inconsistency in the implementation of the criminalisation of buyers from region to region; the continued use of other public order offences against women in some areas; weak implementation of the law in relation to minors in prostitution, particularly in relation to the defence by buyers of not knowing her age; trafficked and procured women being regarded as undocumented migrants rather than victims of exploitation; delays in the resourcing and establishment of exit route programmes, services and accommodation for women seeking to exit prostitution. It is also worth noting all the arrests of buyers have been on the streets and that a further challenge will be the policing and arrest of buyers in indoor locations.

For two decades, the Swedish Government has developed a comprehensive integrated strategy on prostitution and trafficking for sexual exploitation, which is embedded within the policies and structures of the state. While the majority of Member States have national action plans (NAPs) on trafficking, the Swedish national action plan integrates both

prostitution and trafficking for sexual purposes and contains 36 separate measures, mainly directed at public agencies. It has five priority areas: protection and support for people at risk; prevention; higher standards and greater efficiency in the justice system; increased national and international co-operation; and higher level of knowledge and awareness. SEK 213 million was set aside over three years to ensure the implementation of the proposed measures. Combatting prostitution and trafficking for sexual exploitation are also an integral part of state policy at both a domestic and international level, within the National Strategy against Men's Violence against Women (2017–2026) and the Swedish Foreign Service Action Plan for a feminist foreign policy (2015–2018), which aims to strengthen the human rights of women and girls. The enforcement of the laws on prostitution and trafficking continue to be prioritised, monitored and resourced within the National Police Authority, the Prosecution Authority, the Swedish National Courts Administration, the Migration Authority, the National Board of Health and Welfare (NBHW) and the Gender Equality Agency (2018).

Since the legislation came into force on 1 January 1999, 7,059 men have been apprehended for attempting to purchase or for having purchased a sexual service resulting in 3,006 convictions. In addition, 1,593 men have been arrested for the purchase of a sexual act from a child under 18 years of age resulting in 233 convictions. There have been 1,328 reported crimes for procuring and 481 for trafficking for sexual exploitation. Through the direct or indirect intervention by the police, many more have been dissuaded from purchasing someone for the purpose of exploitation in prostitution. These arrest figures indicate the successful enforcement of the law but a government-appointed Commission of Inquiry in 2010 indicates the wider positive outcomes of the law. The Inquiry found the law has acted as an effective anti-trafficking measure; reduced the number of people in prostitution compared to neighbouring states such as Denmark, which, at the time, had three times the number of people in prostitution; and has had the desired normative effect with strong public support for the law. The law has proven to be an effective deterrent to sex purchasers with a decrease in reported users down from 13.6 per cent in 1996, 7.9 per cent in 2008 and 7.5 per cent in 2015, with a normative effect on prospective buyers. Despite claims by critics of the Swedish approach that criminalising the purchase of sexual services and sexual acts increases the risk to women in prostitution, the Walby *et al.* (2016) research once again confirms there is no evidence to substantiate this claim.

“

Prostitution is not perceived as a matter of violence against women and sexual exploitation or a violation of their right to physical integrity, life and freedom, but merely as a behaviour that violates social order and morality.
Cypriot report

4

Conclusions and Recommendations

4.1 Conclusions

In examining the approach of Member States to criminalising demand for the purchase of sex from victims of trafficking we can see it is the conceptualisation of prostitution which underpins the legislative and policy framework adopted. If the state deems it is a legitimate demand to have people, primarily girls and women, made available to supply sexual acts for money, then as long as they are not identified as trafficked, procured, pimped or minors, this is regarded as acceptable and legal. Consequently, the only criminalisation of the buyer is where the person bought is proven to be a victim of trafficking or pimping, and where the buyer is aware of that fact. This is the position also taken by the EU Directive 2011/36/EU and the Council of Europe Convention, so these states can claim they are fulfilling their minimum obligations under the Convention and the Directive. This is the approach followed in Cyprus, Finland and Lithuania, and prior to 2016/17, in France and Ireland. The evidence from these countries suggests criminalising the purchase of sex only where there is proof the person is a victim of trafficking or procuring is inoperable from an enforcement point of view and ineffective in relation to the wider goal of acting as a deterrent and reducing demand. Furthermore, in the absence of a national co-ordinated and resourced strategy on prostitution-related activities, the wider environment in which demand for victims of sexual exploitation is situated, the prosecution of pimps, procurers and brothel owners tends to be sporadic with occasional special police operations targeting individual establishments and organised crime groups.

In Sweden, and since 2016 and 2017 in France and Ireland respectively, the state has adopted the position that prostitution is a form of violence against women and therefore the demand to have any girls or women made available to supply sexual acts for money is not regarded as legitimate or acceptable and, therefore, the purchase of sex is a criminal offence. This approach, as described, is underpinned by principles of gender equality and human rights and leads to an integrated national strategy to address both prostitution and trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation. This approach has also proven to be an effective anti-trafficking and demand reduction measure. The most recent figures in relation to Sweden compared to the Netherlands and Germany are telling. It is estimated the Netherlands has a rate of nine times and Germany a rate of between 30

and 40 times that of prostitution in Sweden (Walby *et al*, 2016). In addition, studies demonstrate a very clear correlation between the scale of prostitution and the level of trafficking in a destination country, with the number of victims of trafficking estimated to vary from 10 per cent to 24 per cent of the overall numbers in the sex trade (Seo-Young *et al.*, 2012; Danailova-Trainor and Belser, 2006). This data is critical evidence in relation to what measures are effective to reduce human trafficking for sexual exploitation. In other words, regardless of the regime regulating prostitution-related activities, simply allowing the prostitution industry to grow, increases the flow of trafficked people to that jurisdiction; conversely, addressing demand and reducing the size of the market for prostitution-related activities is an effective anti-trafficking measure.

However, as other countries follow the Swedish approach, it is critical they are fully cognisant of the wide range of institutional mechanisms and measures put in place by the Swedish Government to ensure the success of all the objectives of the law. The positive outcomes for women in prostitution and for society have been possible not simply by enacting a law, but by the continuing commitment of the Swedish state to providing resources for services and policing, and ensuring that the wider intention of the law is embedded in domestic and foreign policy. The French law has also now provided an exemplar of a comprehensive law which not only criminalises the purchase of sex and de-criminalises those exploited in prostitution, but also provides a statutory basis for service provision and exit routes. It is important to note all six experts emphasise the importance of recognising the wider significance of sex purchase laws, not merely as anti-trafficking measures but, fundamentally, about addressing gender inequalities and violence against women.

4.2 Recommendations

The following recommendations arise from the comparative report but are also informed by other relevant EU reports.

- 1** We welcome the efforts by EU Member States to develop a comprehensive legal and policy framework on trafficking in human beings for sexual purposes. However, Member States should recognise the current remit of the EU Directive 2011/36/EU, which criminalises the purchase of sexual services only where there is proof the person is a victim of human trafficking, is inoperable from an enforcement point of view and ineffective in relation to addressing the increasing numbers of victims of trafficking for sexual exploitation within and into the European Union.

 - 2** Recognising the shortcomings in EU Directive 2011/36/EU approach and extensive evidence regarding the success of the Swedish approach, Member States should introduce a criminal offence for buying a person for sexual acts as the only effective means to reduce demand for victims of trafficking for sexual exploitation. Decriminalisation of people exploited in prostitution, including victims of trafficking, should be an integral part of any legislative framework.⁸

 - 3** Member States should develop integrated and co-ordinated whole-of-government strategies to respond to the commercial sex trade and to address the demand for victims of trafficking for sexual exploitation. The introduction of laws relating to prostitution and human trafficking needs to be accompanied by a comprehensive range of measures which include enforcement policies, protection and support for all victims of sexual exploitation, monitoring and evaluation, and preventative initiatives.

 - 4** National action plans on prostitution and human trafficking should be developed, underpinned by the principles of gender equality and human rights and informed by the wider body of law and policy on gender equality and gender-based violence⁹. Detailed targets, benchmarks, indicators, timeframes and budget allocations should be integral to national action plans. Ministerial responsibility and oversight with a dedicated unit within government is required.
-

8. EC (2016:8), *The Gender Dimension of Trafficking in Human Beings*, prepared by Walby, S. et al., concludes that victims of trafficking for sexual exploitation 'can be hidden within mixed populations of independent, exploited and coerced prostitutes and in mixed migration flows'.

9. Yonkova, N., Gillan, S., Keegan, E., O'Connor, M., Charlton, D., and Zobnina, A. (2018) *An analysis of the Anti-trafficking Directive from the perspective of a victim of a gender-based violence*. Vilnius: European Institute for Gender Equality.

5

Member States should ensure that international instruments and EU Directives on human trafficking are fully transposed into national legislation. New and emerging forms of trafficking such as trafficking for exploitative sham marriage should be monitored and laws enacted to reflect these.¹⁰ Academic and community research should be funded and carried out to strengthen laws and policy measures for their prevention.

6

Laws relating to the procurement and organisation of prostitution need to be robust, reflecting the serious nature of these offences and the likely intersection with human trafficking crimes. Further research and action is needed to criminalise online advertising and the use of web-based and other forms of communications technology tools in the organisation of prostitution-related activities, and the targeting of girls and women for sexual exploitation¹¹

7

Specialist police and prosecutions units must be resourced to investigate and prosecute those responsible for prostitution-related activities and to carry out surveillance operations on indoor locations. Training for police should be carried out in co-operation with experienced women's victim-support services to ensure a sex-specific, victim-centred and human rights approach¹². Recognising signs of coercion and control alongside signs of trafficking should form a core part of the training to ensure the identification and referral of all women subjected to coercion and procuring. Police and technical experts should be resourced to investigate, track and prosecute the use of communications technology by organisers of prostitution-related activities. Sentencing patterns should be monitored closely to ensure consistency and that they are commensurate with the seriousness of the offence.

8

Decriminalisation is a core element of the Swedish/Nordic approach but the introduction of the laws prohibiting the purchase of sexual acts/services must also be accompanied by a wide range of measures to ensure there are no negative consequences for prostituted and trafficked women¹³. The right to protection, accommodation, early legal intervention, legal advocacy and support for victims of trafficking have been enshrined in legislation and/or statutory guidance in most Member States¹⁴. Recognising the coercive circumstances in which women enter the sex trade, these rights need to be extended to all women who are subjected to commercial sexual exploitation, when they are in prostitution and when they are seeking to exit.

10. Cosgrove, C., O'Connor, M. and Yonkova, N. (2016) *Exploitative Sham Marriages and Human Trafficking in Ireland*. Dublin: Immigrant Council of Ireland.

11. See e.g. project case study by the Institute for Feminism & Human Rights, and Ekberg, G.S. and Werkman, K. (2016) *A Snapshot Study on the Prevalence, Laws, Policies and Practices regarding Prostitution and Trafficking in Human Beings for the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation in Belgium: Final Report*, Brussels: Sorbus Research.

12. See Benson, S. (2018). Case study on NGO and police co-operation for the 'Disrupt Demand' project.

13. See e.g. Ekberg, G.S. (2018) *Swedish Laws, Policies and Interventions on Prostitution and Trafficking in Human Beings: A Comprehensive Overview*.

14. O'Connor, M. (2015). *Upholding legal rights: Early legal intervention for victims of trafficking*. Dublin: The Immigrant Council of Ireland, EU/ ISEC Programme.

9

Member States should be cognisant of the rights enshrined in the Anti-Trafficking Directive¹⁵ and the Victims' Rights Directive¹⁶ in delivering protection and gender-specific assistance to victims of sexual exploitation. Member States have a responsibility to respond to the long-term needs of women who have been sexually exploited in their jurisdiction regardless of their legal status as migrants, including access to welfare, education, training and employment.

10

Member States should ensure exit programmes are in place for women seeking to exit prostitution and adequate long-term funding for such support services is in place.

11

Public awareness and preventive strategies should be central to government strategies, recognising the wider declarative and normative intentions of the laws that ban the purchase of sexual acts are to prevent and reduce demand, and to increase public awareness of prostitution as an obstacle to gender equality. Attitudinal surveys to assess public support for the legal and policy approach to prostitution and data, including through public surveys on the number and percentage of the population of men who have purchased sex, should be conducted periodically.

12

Member States should commit adequate resources to research in order to ensure solid and reliable evidence in relation to the impacts of the law is publicly available. Areas should include: mapping of the scale and extent of prostitution-related activities and trafficking for sexual exploitation in all relevant localities, including indoor venues; investigation of the number of prostitution-related activities and number of individuals involved online; research on the harmful consequences of prostitution for the health and well-being of girls and women; and the ongoing needs and barriers for women in relation to exiting.

13

An Independent National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings should be appointed by each Member State. The Rapporteur should have the authority and resources to access and evaluate non-identifiable data from the statutory and non-governmental agencies.

15. Directive 2011/36/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 5 April 2011 on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting its victims, and replacing Council Framework Decision 2002/629/JHA.

16. European Union Directive 2012/29/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 25 October 2012 establishing minimum standards on the rights, support and protection of victims of crime, and replacing Council Framework Decision 2001/220/JHA [2012] OJ L315/57.

“

Regardless of the regime regulating prostitution-related activities, simply allowing the prostitution industry to grow, increases the flow of trafficked people to that jurisdiction; conversely, addressing demand and reducing the size of the market for prostitution-related activities is an effective anti-trafficking measure.

References

- Aaltio, E. (2009).** Vapaaksi marginaalista, marginaalista vapautta. Naisliikkeen ja prostituoitujen etuliikkeen kamppailu seksin oston kriminalisoinnista 2002 – 2006. Tane-julkaisuja 2009 (2). Tasa-arvoasiain neuvottelukunta, Helsinki.
- Akee, R., Basu, A.K., Chau, N.H. and Khamis, M. (2010).** *Ethnic Fragmentation, Conflict, Displaced Persons and Human Trafficking: An Empirical Analysis*. Social Science Research Network SSRN Scholarly Paper ID 1667766. Available at: <http://papers.ssrn.com/abstract=1667766>.
- Anderson, B. and Rogaly, B. (2005).** *Forced labour and migration to the U.K.* Study prepared by Compas in collaboration with the Trade Union Congress, U.K.
- Aronowitz, A., Theuermann, G. and Tyurykanova, E. (2010).** *Analysing the business model of trafficking in human beings to better prevent the crime*. Vienna: Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE).
- Cadell, R. (2008).** 'Legal response to People Trafficking; an Overview of the International and Regional Framework'. In P. Downes, A. Zule-Lapimaa, L. Ivanchenko and S. Blumberg (Eds) *Not One Victim More: Human Trafficking in the Baltic States* (pp. 110-155). Tallinn: Living for Tomorrow.
- Coy, M. (2009).** 'Invaded spaces and feeling dirty: Women's narratives of violation in prostitution and sexual violence'. In M. Horvath and J. Brown (Eds.). *Rape: Challenging contemporary thinking* (pp. 184-207). Portland, Oregon, USA: Willan Publishing.
- Coy, M., Horvath, M. and Kelly, L. (2007).** "It's just like going to the supermarket": Men buying sex in East London. Report for Safe Exit, Tower Hamlets, London: London Metropolitan University.
- Danailova-Trainor, G. and Belser, P. (2006).** *Globalization and the illicit market for human trafficking: an empirical analysis of supply and demand*. Working Paper No. 78, Geneva: Policy Integration Department, International Labour Organisation (ILO).
- D'Cunha, J. (2002).** 'Legalising prostitution: In search of an alternative from a gender and rights perspective'. In *Seminar on the effects of Legalization of Prostitution Activities: A critical analysis organized by the Swedish government*, 5-6 November, Sweden.
- Di Nicola, A., Cauduro, A., Lombardi, M. and Ruspini, P. (2005).** *Prostitution and Human Trafficking: Focus on Clients*. New York: Springer-Verlag.
- Ekberg, Gunilla S. et al. (2017).** Swedish Laws, Policies and Interventions on Prostitution and Trafficking in Human Beings: A Comprehensive Overview. Stockholm: Sweden, 22 November 2017). Available at: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/321254711_SWEDISH_
- Europol. (2016).** *Situation Report: Trafficking in Human Beings*. The Hague, February 2016, Doc. Ref. No: 765175.
- Eurostat (2013, 2014, 2015).** *Trafficking in Human Beings*. Eurostat Statistical Working Papers. European Union, Luxembourg.
- Farley, M., Cotton, A., Lynne, J., Zumbeck, S., Spiwak, F., Reyes, M.E., Alvarez, D. and Sezzgin, U. (2003).** 'Prostitution and trafficking in nine countries: An update on violence and post-traumatic stress disorder'. In M. Farley (Ed.) *Prostitution, trafficking and traumatic stress* (pp. 33-74). Haworth Press.
- Farley, M., Bindel, J. and Golding, J. (2009).** *Men who buy sex: who they buy and what they know*. EAVES, London and Prostitution Research and Education, San Francisco.
- Healy, G. and O'Connor, M. (2006).** *The links between prostitution and sex trafficking: A briefing handbook*. European Women's Lobby and the Coalition against Trafficking in Women (CATW).
- International Labour Organization (ILO). (2010).** *Global estimate of forced labour: Results and methodology*. Special Action Programme to Combat Forced Labour (SAP-FL). ILO: Geneva.
- International Organisation for Migration (IOM). (2005).** Costs and benefits of international migration. *IOM World Migration Report Series*, 3. Geneva: IOM.
- International Organisation for Migration. 2014.** *Counter-Trafficking*. [ONLINE] Available at: <http://www.iomvienna.at/en/counter-trafficking>. [Accessed 17 October 2018].
- Keegan, E. and Yonkova, N. (2014).** *Stop Traffik! Tackling demand for sexual services of trafficked women and girls*. The Immigrant Council of Ireland, funded as part of the ISEC Stop Traffik! Programme, European Commission

Kelleher Associates, O'Connor M., and Pillinger, J. (2009). *Globalisation, sex trafficking and prostitution: The experiences of migrant women in Ireland*. Dublin: Immigrant Council of Ireland.

Kelly, L. (2002). *Journeys of jeopardy: A review of research on trafficking in women and children in Europe*. Vienna: International Organisation for Migration (IOM).

Kelly, L. (2005). *Fertile fields: Trafficking in persons in Central Asia*. Vienna: International Organisation for Migration (IOM).

KKO, 2012:66. Korkein oikeus. Seksuaalirikos – Seksikaupan kohteena olevan henkilön hyväksikäyttö. [Case Law: Supreme court. Sex offence. Abuse of a victim of sexual trade.]

Kutnik, B., Belser, P. and Danailova-Trainor, G. (2007). *Methodologies for global and national estimation of human trafficking victims: current and future approaches*. Geneva: International Labour Organisation (ILO).

MacLeod, J., Farley, M., Anderson, L. and Golding, J. (2008). *Challenging men's demand for prostitution in Scotland*. Glasgow: Glasgow Women's Support Project.

Marttila, A.M. (2008). Desiring the "other": Prostitution clients on a transnational red-light district in the border area of Finland, Estonia and Russia. *Gender Technology and Development*, 12, 31-51.

Melrose, M. (2010). 'Mercenary Territory: A U.K. Perspective on Human Trafficking'. In K. A. McCabe and S. Manian (Eds.) *Sex trafficking, a global perspective* (pp. 52-68). Lexington Books: Plymouth.

Monzini, P. (2005). *Sex traffic: Prostitution, crime and exploitation*. London: Zed Books.

Moran, R. (2013). *Paid for: My journey through prostitution*. Dublin: Gill and Macmillan.

National Institute for Population Health. (2000). *Sex in Sweden: On the Swedish Sexual Life*. Online at: <https://www.folkhalsomyndigheten.se/publiceratmaterial/publikationsarkiv/s/Sex-in-Sweden---on-the-Swedish-sexual-life/>

National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings, Lägesrapport 18 - Människohandel för sexuella och andra ändamål (Stockholm, Sweden 2017). *Forthcoming*.

Niemi, J. and Aaltonen, J. (2014). *Abuse of a Victim in Sex Trade. Evaluation of the Finnish sex purchase ban*. Selvityksiä ja ohjeita 13/2014. Oikeusministeriö, Helsinki. Available in English: http://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/sites/antitrafficking/files/abuse_of_a_victim_of_sex_trade_1.pdf

O'Connor, M. (2017). Choice, agency, consent and coercion: Complex issues in the lives of prostituted and trafficked women. U.K. *Women's International Studies Forum*, 62, 8-16.

O'Malley, T. (1996). *Sexual offences: Law, policy and punishment*. Dublin: Round Hall Ltd.

Potterat, J.J., Brewer, D.D., Muth, S.Q., Rothenberg, R.B., Woodhouse, D.E., Muth, J.B., Stites, H.K. and Brody, S. (2004). Mortality in a long term open cohort of prostitute women. *American Journal of Epidemiology*, 159, 778-785.

Raphael, J. and Shapiro, D.L. (2002). *Sisters speak out: The lives and needs of prostituted women in Chicago*. Chicago: Center for Impact Research.

Raymond, J., D'Cunha, J., Ruhaini Dzuhayatin, S., Hynes, P., Ramirez Rodriguez, Z. and Santos, A. (2002). *A comparative study of women trafficked in the migration process: Patterns, profiles and health consequences of sexual exploitation in five countries*. Coalition against Trafficking in Women (CATW).

Sassen, S. (2003). Global cities and survival circuits. In B. Ehrenreich and A. Russell Hochschild (Eds) *Global women: Nannies, maids and sex workers in the new economy* (pp. 1-16).

Seo-Young, C., Dreher, A. and Neumayer, E. (2012). *Does legalized prostitution increase human trafficking?* Economics of Security Working Paper, 71. Berlin. Economics of Security.

Svedin, Carl-Göran et al., *Prostitution i Sverige. Huvudrapport: Kartläggning och utvärdering av prostitutionsgruppernas insatser samt erfarenheter och attityder i befolkningen* (Stockholm, Sweden: Socialstyrelsen, 2012).

Tampep (European Network for HIV/STI Prevention and Health Promotion among Migrant Sex Workers). (2009). *Sex work in Europe: a mapping of the 25 European countries*. The Netherlands: TAMPEP International Foundation.

Trafficking in Persons (TIP) reports (2005-2012).

United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Population Division. (2017). *International Migration Report 2017: Highlights* (ST/ESA/SER.A/404).

United Nations Economic and Social Council (UNESCO). (2004). *Economic causes of trafficking in women in the UNECE Region*. ECE/AC/.28?2004/10.

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC). (2010). *The globalisation of crime: A transnational organised crime threat assessment*. UNODC: Vienna.

United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA). (2006). *State of the World Population: A passage to hope, women and international migration*. UNFPA.

Van Liemt, G. (2004). *Human trafficking in Europe: An economic perspective*. Geneva: International Labour Organisation (ILO).

Walby, S., Apitzsch, B., Armstrong, J., Balderston, S., Follis, K., Francis, B., Kelly, L., May-Chahal, C., Rashid, A., Shire, K., Towers, J. and Tunte, M. (2016). *The Study on the Gender Dimension of Trafficking in Human Beings*. Luxembourg: European Commission.

Zimmerman, C., Hossain, M., Yun, K., Roche B., Morison L. and Watts, C. (2006). *Stolen smiles: report on the physical and psychological health consequences of women and adolescents trafficked in Europe*. London: The London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine.

Appendices

Appendix 1

The reporting template for the production of national reports

1. Context (2 pages)

Political, demographic, cultural context

This section should be short, presenting only information that you believe is relevant to the project, e.g. information which impacts on campaigns for / implementation or enforcement of laws targeting demand for human trafficking for sexual exploitation

2. Legislative Framework (5 pages)

This section will be largely descriptive

Descriptive

Legislative Context

Outline existing laws on human trafficking and prostitution – thus situating laws targeting demand for human trafficking for sexual exploitation within this overall context

Laws Targeting Demand for Human Trafficking

This section should specifically focus on laws targeting demand for human trafficking for sexual exploitation

Rationale

This section should include information on the rationale behind the current legislative context and the specific approach to demand reduction

3. Enforcement and Implementation (5 pages)

Descriptive

Enforcement Patterns

- Who is criminalised under current laws relating to human trafficking and prostitution?
- To what extent are laws targeting demand for human trafficking for sexual exploitation used and who is criminalised under them?

Additional Considerations

Are there any additional or alternative penalties that must be considered when looking at enforcement of the above measures? Is there evidence, for example, of migrant women in prostitution being removed from the country, rather than being prosecuted (qualitative or quantitative)? Is there spent conviction legislation in the country? Does this apply to those prosecuted for offences under current laws, specifically women penalised in prostitution?

Analysis

What can enforcement patterns tell us about implementation of the law? Specifically, under the different models, who is targeted? What can that reveal about the effectiveness of laws targeting demand, including the extent to which they are used and the relationship between different approaches to demand reduction and targeting of vulnerable women in prostitution / potential victims of trafficking?

4. Public Awareness (5 pages)

Descriptive

Generating Awareness

Public awareness campaigns/educational programmes by government which have/will increase support for the laws and deter buyers

Analysis

This section should answer the question – have the **government** invested in the success of any laws targeting demand?

5. Institutional Framework (5 pages)

🔍 Descriptive

National Institutions

- National Coordinators
- National Rapporteurs or Equivalent Mechanisms

Cooperative Structures, e.g. multidisciplinary groups

The above sections should briefly describe the form, functions, and practices of the different institutions and structures in the area.

🔍 Analysis

What role has the above institutions and cooperative structures played in the implementation of laws targeting demand? Have they helped, hindered, or failed to impact on implementation of laws targeting demand?

6. Assessing the Law's Impact (10 pages)

🔍 Descriptive

Impact

- Assessing the impact of the laws on trafficked and prostituted women (current and proposed) and the size of the commercial sex-trade
- Research and evaluation in relation to the wider impact of the laws including attitudinal surveys with the public; demand/buyers research

🔍 Analysis

What can the above tell us about the impact of existing laws targeting demand for human trafficking for sexual exploitation?

7. Achieving Legislative Change (10 pages)

🔍 Descriptive

Campaign strategies used (or being used) to achieve legislative change including:

- research and evidence
- political engagement
- coalition/alliance building
- survivor input and involvement
- specific focus on sectors such as health/trade unions
- public awareness campaigns
- media and communication strategies
- Choose two of the above strategies and describe efforts undertaken by your organisation

🔍 Analysis

Why were those strategies most effective?

Appendix 2:

Research, government data and reports cited in the national reports

Cyprus

- Ali, Masud. "Anatomy of Blame Game: Assessment of the demand-supply interface of trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation." In *Human Trafficking: New Directions for Research* edited by International Organization for Migration (IOM). **URL:** https://www.iom.int/jahia/webdav/shared/shared/mainsite/microsites/IDM/workshops/ensuring_protection_070909/human_trafficking_new_directions_for_research.pdf 'Aliens and Immigration Law', part of the legislative framework of prostitution, Article 6 paragraph 1(e)
- Chrysostomou, Annette. "Police condemned for buying sex to uncover pimping." *Cyprus Mail*. 18 June, 2017. **URL:** <http://cyprus-mail.com/2017/06/18/police-condemned-buying-sex-uncover-pimping/>
- Chuang, Janie. "Beyond a Snapshot: Preventing Human Trafficking in the Global Economy." *Indiana Journal of Global Legal Studies* 13, no. 1 (2006): 137-163. **URL:** <http://www.repository.law.indiana.edu/ijgls/vol13/iss1/5>
- Civil Registry and Migration Department. "Εργάτες, Αθλητές/ Προπονητές, Ιερείς, Καλλιτέχνες, Εργαζόμενοι σε Μπουραρίες, Εκπαιδευόμενοι Λογιστές." **URL:** http://www.moi.gov.cy/moi/crmd/crmd.nsf/0/93d10cfaa8efd620c2257ea7003df5ab?OpenDocument&ExpandSection=7%2C8#_Section7
- Combating Trafficking and Exploitation of Human Beings and Protection of Victims Law (L.87(I)/ 2007)
- Combating Trafficking in Human Beings and Sexual Exploitation of Young Persons Law (L. 31(I)/2000)
- Council of Europe. Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings, 2005 O. J. L 197. **URL:** <https://rm.coe.int/168008371d>
- Criminal Code, Revised Statutes of Cyprus, 1959,
- chapter 154, Part IV. **URL:** <http://www.cylaw.org/nomoi/arith/CAP154.pdf>
- Cyprus Commissioner for Administration (Ombudsman's office). "The Entry and Labour Status of Migrant Artists Women". Cyprus, 2003.
- Cyprus Government report to the CEDAW Committee 2006.
- Cyprus National Action Plans to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings: starting from 2005 and up to the latest one of 2016-2018."
- Demetriou, Marios. "Κατέθεσαν με βάση... την αμνησία τους." *24h*. 26 November, 2016. **URL:** <http://24h.com.cy/2016/11/26/katathesan-me-vasi-tin-amnesia-tous/>
- Demetriou, Marios. "Αθώωθηκαν για την Οξάνα Ράντσεβα." *24h*. 4 February, 2017. **URL:** <http://24h.com.cy/2017/02/04/athootherikan-gia-tin-oxana-rantcheva/>
- European Commission, Trafficking Explained at https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/citizens-corner/trafficking-explained_en
- European Court of Human Rights (ECHR), 2010, *Ranchev vs. Cyprus and Russia*
- <http://cmiskp.echr.coe.int/tkp197/view.asp?action=html&documentId=860538&portal=hbkm&source=externalbydocnumber&table=F69A27FD8FB86142BF01C1166DEA398649>.
- European Parliament Resolution on sexual exploitation and prostitution and its impact on gender equality (2013/2103(INI)).
- European Parliament Directive 2004/81/EC on the residence permit issued to third-country

- nationals who are victims of trafficking in human beings or who have been the subject of an action to facilitate illegal immigration, 2004. **URL:** <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-content/EN/TXT/HTML/?uri=CELEX:32004L0081&from=EN>
- European Parliament and Council of the European Union. Directive 2011/36/EU on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting its victims, and replacing Council Framework Decision 2002/629/JHA, 2011 O.J. L 101 of 15.4.2011. **URL:** <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ:L:2011:101:0001:0011:EN:PDF>
 - EU Strategy towards the Eradication of Trafficking in Human Beings (2012-2016) **URL:** <https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/node/4037>
 - Europol. *Situation Report Trafficking in human beings in the EU*. The Hague. 2016. Available at: https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/sites/antitrafficking/files/situational_report_trafficking_in_human_beings-europol.pdf
 - Farley, M. et al. (2011), “Attitudes and Social Characteristics of Men Who Buy Sex in Scotland”, Psychological Trauma: Theory, Research, Practice and Policy, March 2011
 - Farley, M. et al. (2011), “Comparing Sex Buyers with Men Who Don’t Buy Sex”, Psychologists for Social Responsibility Annual Meeting, July 15, 2011.
 - Farley, Melissa. “Prostitution, Trafficking, and Cultural Amnesia: What we must know in order to keep the business of Sexual Exploitation Running Smoothly.” *Yale Journal of Law and Feminism*, no. 18 (2006): 109-144. **URL:** <http://www.prostitutionresearch.com/pdfs/FarleyYaleLaw2006.pdf>
 - Farley, Melissa, Baral, Isin, Kiremire, Merab, and Ufuk Sezgin. “Prostitution and Trafficking in Nine Countries: An Update on Violence and Posttraumatic Stress Disorder”, *Journal of Trauma Practice*, Vol. 2, No. 3/4, (2003): pp. 33-74. **URL:** <http://www.prostitutionresearch.com/pdf/Prostitutionin9Countries.pdf>
 - Group of Experts on Actions against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA) of the Council of Europe. *Report concerning the implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by Cyprus*. Second Evaluation Round. Strasbourg, 2015. **URL:** <https://rm.coe.int/CoERMPublicCommonSearchServices/DisplayDCTMContent?documentId=0900001680631b96>
 - Hughes, M. Donna. “Supplying Women for the Sex Industry: Trafficking from the Russian Federation; Sexualities in Postcommunism.” Edited by A. Štulhofer, T. Sandfort, V. Diehl Elias, and J. Elias. (Rhode Island: University of Rhode Island, 2004). **URL:** https://www.researchgate.net/publication/253740559_Supplying_Women_for_the_Sex_Industry_Trafficking_from_the_Russian_Federation
 - Immigrant Council of Ireland. *The Learning Toolkit Tackling Demand for Sexual Services of Trafficked Women and Girls*. Dublin: Immigrant Council of Ireland, 2014. p. 4. **URL:** <http://www.stoptraffick.ie/wp-content/uploads/2013/03/Stop-Traffick-Learning-Toolkit.pdf>
 - International Organization for Migration (IOM). *Counter Trafficking*. Available at: <http://www.iomvienna.at/en/counter-trafficking>
 - Kaili Christina and Susana E. Pavlou. “Intimate Partner Violence (IPV) and Sexual Violence (SV) in adolescents: preventive & supportive initiatives in Cyprus.” Nicosia: Mediterranean Institute for Gender Studies, 2015. **URL:** <http://www.medinstgenderstudies.org/wp-content/uploads/Deliverable1.1.CountryReportCyprus1.pdf>
 - Law 60(I)/2014 on Prevention and Combating Trafficking and Exploitation of Persons and Protection of Victims, 2014.
 - Law on Combating Trafficking and Exploitation of Persons and Protection of Victims, 2007.
 - Law on Combating Trafficking in Persons and Sexual Exploitation of Children, 2000.
 - Mediterranean Institute of Gender Studies. *Integration of Female Migrant Domestic Workers: Strategies for Employment and Civic Participation*. 1st Ed. Nicosia: University of Nicosia Press, 2008.
 - Mediterranean Institute of Gender Studies. “Mapping the Realities of Trafficking in Women for the purpose of sexual exploitation in Cyprus.” Cyprus, Nicosia: 2007. **URL:** http://www.medinstgenderstudies.org/wp-content/uploads/migs-trafficking-report_final_711.pdf
 - O’Connor, Monica and Grainne Healy. *The Links between Prostitution and Sex Trafficking: A Briefing Handbook*. 2006
 - Available at: https://cla.umn.edu/sites/cla.umn.edu/files/the_links_btwn_prostitution_sex_trafficking_a_handbook.pdf
 - Phileletheros. Our Place’s history, ‘Sacred servants, prostitutes, artistes’ (translated into English under the title [Η Ιστορία του τόπου μας, ενθύμιον, Ιερόδουλες, πόρνες, αρτίστες]). Nicosia, 2011.
 - Prevention, Fighting against Trafficking in and Exploitation of Human Beings and Protection of Victims. Cyprus, Law N° 60(I) of 2014. **URL:** http://www.cylaw.org/nomoi/arith/2014_1_060.pdf
 - R. v. Urizar, File No. 505-1-084654-090, L-017.10, Court of Québec, District of Longueuil, Criminal Division (J.C.Q.), (2010-08-13), 13 August 2010, Canada and Urizar v. R., No. 500-10-004763-106, Court of Appeal, Quebec, 16 January 2013, Canada. The trial court case is available in the UNODC Human Trafficking Case Law Database (UNODC Case No. CAN005). For detailed facts, see the in-depth analysis in section 5.2 of the Case Digest.
 - Raymond, J., D’Cunha, J., Ruhaini Dzuhayatin, S., Hynes, P., Ramirez Rodriguez, Z. and Santos, A. (2002). *A comparative study of women trafficked in the migration process: Patterns, profiles and health consequences of sexual exploitation in five countries*. Coalition against Trafficking in Women (CATW).
 - Theophanous, Andreas (1995) *Anatomy of the Economic ‘miracle’ 1974-1994*.
 - Transparency International. “Cyprus.” **URL:** <https://www.transparency.org/country/CYP><http://www.transparency.org/>
 - United Nations Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Persons and of the Exploitation of the Prostitution of Others Approved by General Assembly resolution 317 (IV), 1949. **URL:** https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/legislation-and-case-law-international-legislation-united-nations/convention-suppression-traffic_en
 - United Nations General Assembly, *Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime*, 15 November 2000. **URL:** <http://www.refworld.org/docid/4720706c0.html>
 - United Nations Human Rights Office of the High Commissioner, *Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography*, GA Res 54/263, UN Doc A/RES/54/263 (25 May 2000, entered into force on 18 January 2002) **URL:** <http://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/OPSCCRC.aspx>
 - United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. *Evidential Issues in Trafficking in Person Cases (CASE DIGEST)*. Vienna: United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2017. **URL:** https://www.unodc.org/documents/humantrafficking/2017/Case_Digest_Evidential_Issues_in_Trafficking.pdf
 - United Nations Office on Drugs and Crimes (UNODC). “Report on Trafficking in Persons to Europe for Sexual Exploitation.” In *The Globalization of Crime – A Transnational Organized Crime Threat Assessment*. June 2010.
 - Available at: http://www.unodc.org/documents/publications/TiP_Europe_EN_LORES.pdf
 - United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, *United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and the Protocols Thereto*, 2000. **URL:** https://www.unodc.org/documents/middleeastandnorthafrica/organised-crime/UNITED_NATIONS_CONVENTION_AGAINST_TRANSNATIONAL_ORGANIZED_CRIME_AND_THE_PROTOCOLS_THERETO.pdf
 - US Department. *Trafficking in Persons Report*. U.S Department of State Publication Office of the Under Secretary for Civilian Security, Democracy, and Human Rights, 2017. p. 146. **URL:** <https://www.state.gov/documents/organization/271339.pdf>
 - US Department. *Trafficking in Persons Report*. U.S Department of State Publication Office of the Under Secretary for Civilian Security, Democracy, and Human Rights, 2011. **URL:** <http://www.state.gov/g/tip/rls/tiprpt/2011/>
 - Yonkova Nusha, and Edward Keegan, *Stop Traffick! Tackling demand for sexual services of trafficked women and girls*. Dublin: Immigrant Council of Ireland, 2014. **URL:** <http://www.stoptraffick.ie/wp-content/uploads/2013/03/STOP-TRAFFICK-full-report.pdf>

Conferences / seminars

- Cyprus Equality Observatory, 22 March 2017 conference: “Trafficking in women for forced labor”.
- Cyprus Women Lobby, 2012 one-day press seminar: “Violence against Women and Prostitution”.

- Geopolitical Institute Daedalus, 5 December 2006 national conference: “Migration in the 21st century”.
- Mediterranean Institute of Gender Studies and the European Parliament Office in Cyprus, 2014 conference: “The demand dynamics of trafficking in women for sexual exploitation”.

Finland

- Aaltio, Elina. 2009. Vapaaksi marginaalista, marginaalista vapautta. Naisliikkeen ja prostituoitujen etuliikkeen kamppailu seksin oston kriminalisoinnista 2002 – 2006. Tane-julkaisu 2009 (2). Tasa-arvoasiain neuvottelukunta, Helsinki.
- Aliens Act. 30.4.2004/301. Available in English: <http://www.finlex.fi/en/laki/kaannokset/2004/en20040301.pdf>
- All Finnish legislation, case-law and government bills can be found in Finnish and Swedish in address: finlex.fi
- Council of Europe Istanbul Convention. Action against violence against women and domestic violence.
- Criminal Code. 19.12.1889/39. Available in English: <http://www.finlex.fi/fi/laki/kaannokset/1889/en18890039.pdf>
- Finnish Border Guard. 2017. Personal communication via email with Marko Saareks, Head of Unit in Situation and Risk Analysis Centre, The Border Guard HQ. 9.6.2017.
- HE 229/2014. Hallituksen esitys eduskunnalle laiksi rikoslain 20 luvun 8 §:n muuttamisesta. [Government Bill for Parliament to change criminal code chapter 20 section 8.]
- HE 103/2014. Hallituksen esitys eduskunnalle laiksi rikoslain muuttamisesta ja eräksi siihen liittyviksi laeiksi. [Government Bill for Parliament to change criminal code and some related laws]
- HE 221/2005. Hallituksen esitys Eduskunnalle kansainvälisen järjestäytyneen rikollisuuden vastaisen Yhdistyneiden Kansakuntien yleissopimuksen ihmiskauppaa ja maahanmuuttajien salakuljetusta koskevien lisäpöytäkirjojen hyväksymisestä ja niiden

- Mediterranean Institute of Gender Studies, 12 October 2010 conference: “Trafficking in Women for Sexual Exploitation: Policies and Strategies for Prevention and Intervention.” **URL:** http://www.medinstgenderstudies.org/wp-content/uploads/Josie-Christodoulou_THB.pdf

lainsäädännön alaan kuuluvien määräysten voimaansaattamisesta sekä laeiksi rikoslain 20 luvun ja järjestyslain 7 ja 16 • :n muuttamisesta. [The Government Bill to Parliament to accept the United Nation’s supplementar protocol of general agreement on trafficking in persons and immigrant smuggling and to ratify the provovision on them and to change Criminal Code Chapter 20 and Public Order Act Chapters 7 and 16.]

- HE 34/2004. Hallituksen esitys Eduskunnalle laiksi rikoslain muuttamisesta ja eräksi siihen liittyviksi laeiksi. [Government Bill for Parliament to change Criminal Code and some related laws.]
- Hinkkanen, Ville. 2014. Seksikaupan kohteena olevan henkilön hyväksikäyttö.
- Holli, Anna Maria 2012. Kriittisiä näkökulmia tasa-arvon tutkimukseen. In: Tasa-arvo toisin nähtynä. Oikeuden ja politiikan näkökulmia tasa-arvoon ja yhdenvertaisuuteen. Edited by Johanna Kantola, Kevät Nousiainen & Milja Saari. Gaudeamus, Helsinki. 73–96.
- Holli, Anna Maria. 2004. Towards a new prohibitionism? State feminism, women’s movements and prostitution policies in Finland. In: Politics of Prostitution. Women’s Movements, Democratic States and the Global Sex Commerce. Edited by Joyce Outhoorn. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge. 103–122.
- Ihmiskauppa, paritus ja prostituutio. Työryhmän osamietintö. 2003. Työryhmämietintö 2003:5. Oikeusministeriö, Helsinki. [Memorandum from the Ministry of Justice]
- Ihmiskaupan uhrien auttamisjärjestelmä. Tilannekatsaus 1.1.–31.12.2016. 2017. Joutsenon vastaanottokeskus, Konnunsuo. [Ministry of Justice reference.] Available: http://www.migri.fi/download/72023_Tilannekatsaus_1.1.-31.12.2016.pdf?4f27a782f954d488 [14.6.2017.]

fi/download/72023_Tilannekatsaus_1.1.-31.12.2016.pdf?4f27a782f954d488 [14.6.2017.]

- Ihmiskaupan vastainen tarkennettu toimintasuunnitelma. 2008. Sisäministeriön julkaisu 27/2008. Sisäministeriö, Helsinki. [Ministry of Justice reference to national action plan.]
- Ihmiskaupan vastainen toimintasuunnitelma. Työryhmän ehdotukset Suomen kansallisen ihmiskaupan vastaisen toiminnan tehostamiseksi. 2005. Ulkoministeriön julkaisu 18/2005. Ulkoasiainministeriö, Helsinki. [Ministry of Justice reference to national action plan.]
- Jyrkinen, Marjut. 2009. Discourse on the Sex Trade. Implications for Policy and Practice. Policy & Politics. Vol. 37, no 1. 73–100.
- Kansallinen ihmiskaupparaportoiija. Kertomus 2014. 2014. Vähemmistövaltuutettu, Helsinki. [National Rapporteur on Trafficking.]
- Kantola, Johanna; Nousiainen, Kevät & Saari, Milja. 2012. Johdanto. Tasa-arvosta ja sen lukemisesta toisin. In: Tasa-arvo toisin nähtynä. Oikeuden ja politiikan näkökulmia tasa-arvoon ja yhdenvertaisuuteen. Edited by Johanna Kantola, Kevät Nousiainen & Milja Saari. Gaudeamus, Helsinki. 7–27.
- KKO 2012:66. Korkein oikeus. Seksuaalirikos - Seksikaupan kohteena olevan henkilön hyväksikäyttö. [Case Law: Supreme court. Sex offence. Abuse of a victim of sexual trade.]
- Lausuntotiivistelmä. 47/2014 Mietintöjä ja lausuntoja. Oikeusministeriö, Helsinki. National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings. Statement on returning of human trafficking victims to Nigeria. 29.9.2016.
- Niemi, Johanna; Aaltonen, Jussi. 2017. Ihmiskaupan torjuminen seksinostoon puuttamalla. Yhteiskuntapolitiikka. 3/2017.
- Niemi, Johanna; Aaltonen, Jussi. 2014. Abuse of a Victim in Sex Trade. Evaluation of the Finnish sex purchase ban. Selvityksiä ja ohjeita 13/2014. Oikeusministeriö, Helsinki. Available in English: http://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/sites/antitrafficking/files/abuse_of_a_victim_of_sex_trade_1.pdf
- Polstat. Statistic service of the Finnish police. Available in: <http://www.polamk.fi/tki/tilastopalvelu> . [24.4.2017.]

- Public Order Act. 27.6.2003/612. Available in English: <http://www.finlex.fi/en/laki/kaannokset/2003/en20030612.pdf>
- Reception Act. Act for receiving persons seeking for international protection and recognising and helping victims of trafficking in human beings. 17.6.2011/746. Not available in English.
- Roth, Venla. 2011. Näkymättömät uhrin: seksuaaliseen hyväksikäyttöön liittyvän ihmiskaupan tunnistaminen. Lakimies 5/2011. 957–999.
- Roth, Venla. 2010. Defining human trafficking, identifying its victims. A study on the impact and future challenges of the international, European and Finnish legal responses to prostitution-related trafficking in human beings. Turun yliopisto, Turku.
- Skaffari, Pia. 2010. Rajat ylittävä prostituutio: tutkimus naisten kokemuksista pohjoisen itäprostituutiossa. Lapin yliopistokustannus, Rovaniemi.
- Suomen virallinen tilasto (SVT): Syytetyt, tuomitut ja rangaistukset [verkkojulkaisu]. ISSN=1798-6680.
- Tilastokeskus, Helsinki. From: <http://www.stat.fi/til/syyttr/index.html> [27.5.2017] [Source of tables on pages, 11, 12, 13 of Finnish report.]
- UN CEDAW report, Finland, 2014.
- United Nations Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination Against Women.
- Valtioneuvoston ihmiskaupan vastainen toimintaohjelma 2016–2017. 2016. Sisäministeriön julkaisu 29/2016. Sisäministeriö, Helsinki. [Current National Action Plan.]

Campaigns

- “Human trafficking is not a fairy tale” (2012 Ministry of Justice, Non-Discrimination Ombudsman, IOM, four labour unions and other parties)
- “Stop Smugglers” (Finnish Ministry of Foreign Affairs campaign, 2016)
- Yhteisvastuukerays (Finnish Lutheran Church focused in 2017 on victims of human trafficking)

France

- 5th Plan of Action against “all” acts of violence committed against women, 2017/2019.
- “A decision made by the CNDA, Cour Nationale du Droit d’Asile (French National Court for Right of Asylum), dated 24 March 2015, recognised the existence of a social group for female victims of trafficking in human beings for the purpose of sexual exploitation.” (Case Law)
- Abolition 2012 collective, 29 November 2011, first abolitionist Convention at the French National Assembly.
- Access to compensation for damages (article 706-3 of the Code of Criminal Procedure)
- Ac.Sé scheme (“Accueil Sécurisant” or secured reception) is a national protection mechanism for victims of human trafficking (from page 7 of the report)
- Act no 2016-444 of the 13th April 2016, Aiming to Strengthen the Fight Against the Prostitution System and to Assist Prostituted Persons. This legislation impacted the following legislation:
 - article 6 of Act Number 2004-575 of the 21st June 2004 for Confidence in the Digital Economy
 - article L.451-1 of the Family and Social Action Code
 - article 706-40-1 to Title XVII of Book IV of the Code of Criminal Procedure
 - article L.8112-2 of the Labour Code
 - article L121-9 of the Family and Social Action Code
 - article L441-1 of the Building and Dwellings Code
 - article L121-9 of the Family and Social Action Code
 - articles L316-1 and L316-1-1 of the Code governing the Entry and Stay of Foreigners and the Right of Asylum
 - article L851-1 of the Social Security Code
 - article L.345-1 of the Family and Social Action Code
 - articles 222-3, 222-8, 222-10, 222-12 and 222-13 of the Penal Code
 - article 706-3 of the Penal Procedures Code
 - article 2-22 of the Penal Procedures Code
 - article 306 of the Penal Procedures Code
 - article 225-10-1 of the Penal Code
 - article L.1181-1 of Title VII of the 1st Book of the First Section of the Public Health Code
 - article 312-17-1 of the Education Code
 - article L312-16 of the Education Code
 - article 611-1 of the Penal Code and amends article 225-12-1 of the Penal Code
 - articles 131-16 and 225-20 of the Penal Code
- Aggravating circumstances of resorting to the prostitution of others (article 225-12-2 of the French Criminal Code)
- Article L 316-1 of the Ceseda (Code for Entry and Residence of Foreigners in France and the Right of Asylum)
- Article 611-1 on the criminalisation of clients
- Bousquet/Geoffroy report (13 April 2011).
- Carlton trial in 2015 (Case Law)
- “Coalition pour l’Abolition de la Prostitution” (Coalition for the Abolition of Prostitution (CAP international)), 12 November 2014, 1st congress.
- CNCDH (French National Consultative Commission for Human Rights) and rapporteur for human trafficking, 2015 report on human trafficking
- *Comité d’orientation de la Mission interministérielle de protection des femmes contre les violences et de lutte contre la traite des êtres humains* (MIPROF) (Steering committee of the Interministerial mission for the protection of women against violence and the fight against human trafficking). 1st National Action Plan for the Fight Against Human Trafficking, 2014-2016 period.
- Comprehensive reduction of health-related harm policy (article L1181-1 of the Public Health Code)
- Council of Europe Convention on Action Against Trafficking in Human Beings of 16 May 2005.
- European Parliament resolution, 6 February 2013, includes prostitution in the list of acts of violence and violations of human rights which must be fought.
- Extraterritorial application of the penalty for resorting to prostitution (article 225-12-3)
- FEM, «Féministes en Mouvement», 2012. «Mais qu’est-ce qu’elles veulent (encore)?» (“What do they want now.
- French Criminal Code (from pages 3 – 4 of the report); the following articles are referred to:
 - article 225-5 and 225-6
 - article 225-7
 - article 225-7-1
 - article 225-8
 - article 225-9
- French Penal Code: Articles 225-4-1 and 2, and articles 225-14-1 and 2
- French law no. 2003-239 for internal security, dated 18 March 2003, introduced the human trafficking offence in the French Penal Code.
- French law no. 2013-711, dated 5 August 2013 on human trafficking, is an application of European Union law and France’s international commitments
- HCEFH, Haut Conseil à l’Egalité entre les Femmes et les Hommes (High Council for Gender Equality) aka HCE. June 2016, the HCE published a report on sex education for it to be rendered consistent with the French law dated 13 April 2016.
- “Manifeste des salauds” (Bastards’ manifesto) published in a review under the heading “Touche pas à ma pute” (Don’t touch my whore)
- Mouvement du Nid, May 2015. “Prostcost study”: ProstCost investigation providing an estimation of the economic and social costs of prostitution
- Mouvement du Nid, November 2013. Gathering accounts of prostituted persons denouncing the exploitation of which they were victims; particularly focused on the last 30 years. Quarterly publication in *Revue Prostitution et Société* (Prostitution and Society journal).
- Mouvement du Nid, February 11, 2010. Presentation to the French National Assembly of the findings of its assessment of public policies in terms of prostitution.
- Mouvement du Nid and Ifar (Intervention, Training, Action, Research), 2004. The man in question, the process of becoming a prostitution client, a national investigation.
- Noëlle, Laurence. «Renaître de ses hontes» («Reborn from your shame»).
- Ocrteh, Office Central de Répression de la Traite des Etres Humains (French Central Office for the Punishment of Human Trafficking) (reference for data on page 14 of the report)
- Parliament’s adoption of a Resolution to reaffirm France’s abolitionist position (6 December 2011)
- Penalty for repeated offence (Article 225-12-1 of the French Criminal Code)
- Penalty for resorting to the prostitution of a minor or a vulnerable person (article 225-12-1)
- Prohibition from resorting to the prostitution of others (article 611-1 of the French Criminal Code)
- Protection of victims as witnesses and claimants (article 706-40-1 of the Code of Criminal Procedure)
- Protection, assistance and support for exiting prostitution (article L121-9 of the French Family and Social Action Code)
- Strasbourg Administrative Tribunal, 2014 (Case Law)
- Supplementary punishment in the form of awareness training regarding the fight against the purchase of sexual acts (article 131-16 of the French Criminal Code)
- Zéromacho, 2011. Manifesto: “We shall not go to the woods; men say no to prostitution”.

Media

- Candice Renoir, French police drama TV series, dedicated one of its episodes in May 2017 to the murder of a militant abolitionist.
- Caught red-handed in the van of a prostitute, *Le Dauphiné.com*, 16/02/17
- Columns signed by different groups within society in support of the proposed new abolitionist legislation:
 - Health: “violence is inherent to prostitutional activity” and that “the health of prostituted persons and their protection from violence, from assault, from sexually transmitted diseases go hand in hand with a global support system and a reduction of prostitution and its related violence.” – 12 November 2013, *Le Monde*; and 28 March 2015, *Journal du Dimanche*.
 - 13 October 2014, *Journal du Dimanche*
 - Magistrates and lawyers: 10 November 2013, *Journal du Dimanche*
 - «Génération Abolition» (8 organisations, student unions and youth movements), *Osez le Féminisme*: 23 September 2013
- Dubois, Hubert. Documentary: *Survivantes de la prostitution* (Women Survivors of prostitution).
- *La Provence*, 4 August 2016.
- *Le Midi Libre* - Montpellier, 17 prostituted persons arrested, 24/09/16.

Campaigns

- “30 jours, 30 témoignages” (“30 days, 30 accounts”) and “Des voix pour l’abolition” (“Votes for the abolition”) campaigns, 25 October to 25 November 2013.
- “Clients, get yourselves dressed. Buying sex is now banned”: Ministerial campaign launched on 18 October 2016.
- “Girls of paradise”: McCann, a Paris advertising agency, and the Mouvement du Nid, 2016.
- “Les Bourreaux” (The Tormentors) Mouvement du Nid, poster campaign and a 50-second long video, produced by the MdN with the McCann Paris advertising agency, 14 April 2016.

Ireland

- Centre for Gender and Women’s Studies, Trinity College Dublin. (2010). Interdisciplinary Report on Prostitution in Ireland Interdisciplinary Report on Prostitution in Ireland. IHRC.
- Centre for Gender and Women’s Studies, Trinity College Dublin. (2009). Globalisation, Sex Trafficking and Prostitution: The Experiences of Migrant Women in Ireland (ICI 2009) and Interdisciplinary Report on Prostitution in Ireland. IHRC.
- Child Care Act, 1991
- Child Trafficking and Pornography Act 1998
- Children Act, 2001
- Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings.
- Council of Europe Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA) Committee Report 2013
- Criminal Justice (Public Order) Act of 1994
- Criminal Law (Human Trafficking) Amendment Act, 2013
- Criminal Law (Human Trafficking) Act 2008
- Criminal Law (Sexual Offences) Act, 2017

- Mouvement du Nid support for the survivors to have their voices heard in the press.
 - 18 July 2014, Libération, “Pour en finir avec les clients”(“To do away with clients”), by Rosen
 - Prevention comic books (Pour toi Sandra (For you Sandra), Dérapages, cartoonist: Derib.
 - Two plays:
 - Au bout de la nuit (At the end of the night)
 - Nid d’hirondelles (Nest of swallows)
- «Pas ma mère, pas ma sœur» («Not my mother, not my sister»): Mouvement du Nid, 2004.
- “The price for one trick is not the one you think”: for the Euro 2016 football tournament, June 2016.
- “Un orgasme, ça n’a pas de prix” (An orgasm does not have a price): Mouvement du Nid, 2013.

- Criminal Law (Sexual Offences) (Amendment) Act 2007
- Criminal Law (Sexual Offences) Bill 2015
- Department of Justice, Equality and Law Reform. (2012). Discussion Document on Future Direction of Prostitution Legislation available at: <http://www.justice.ie/en/JELR/Pages/PB12000187>
- Department of Justice. (2011). Trafficking in Human Beings Annual Report, available at: [http://www.blueblindfold.gov.ie/website/bbf/bbfweb.nsf/page/OACN-8XNCV710152730-en/\\$File/2011%20Annual%20Report.pdf](http://www.blueblindfold.gov.ie/website/bbf/bbfweb.nsf/page/OACN-8XNCV710152730-en/$File/2011%20Annual%20Report.pdf)
- Department of Justice and Law Reform (now Department of Justice and Equality). (2008, updated in March 2011). Administrative Immigration Arrangements for the Protection of Victims of Human Trafficking (AIAs).
- European Convention on Human Rights Act 2003.
- European Convention on Human Rights
- EU Citizenship Directive 38/2004.
- EU Directive 2011/36/EU on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting its victims
- Gannon (1980: 12)

- Immigrant Council of Ireland (2016). Exploitative Sham Marriages and Human Trafficking in Ireland available at: <http://immigrantcouncil.ie/files/publications/b20d1-hestia-report-final.pdf>
- Immigration Residence and Protection Bill 2010
- Immigration Act 2004
- Immigration Act 1999
- Joint Committee on Justice, Defence and Equality. (2013). Report on hearings and submissions on the Review of Legislation on Prostitution, available at: <https://www.oireachtas.ie/parliament/media/committees/justice/1.Part-1-final.pdf>
- Joint Committee Report 2012
- Law Reform Commission (1985). Report on Vagrancy and Related Offences.
- Minister for Justice and Equality, Frances Fitzgerald, TD, Criminal Law (Sexual Offences) Bill 2015 - Second Stage Speech – Dáil Éireann, 28 January 2016.
- Proceeds of Crime Act 1996/2005
- Ruhama Annual Report 2015
- Second Commission on the Status of Women. January 1993 Report.
- Sex Offenders Act 2001
- Shannon, Geoffrey. Annual reports of the Special Rapporteur on Child Protection, in particular the 4th, 6th and 9th reports for a discussion child prostitution and trafficking, as well as the Sexual Offences Bill 2015: <https://www.dcy.gov.ie/documents/publications/201611189thReportoftheSpecialRapporteuronChildProtection.pdf>
- Shannon, Geoffrey. (2010). Fourth Report of the Special Rapporteur on Child Protection.
- Shannon, Geoffrey. (2016). Ninth Report of the Special Rapporteur on Child Protection.
- S.I. No. 112/2017 - Criminal Law (Sexual Offences) Act 2017 (Commencement) Order 2017 available at: <http://www.irishstatutebook.ie/eli/2017/si/112/made/en/print>
- United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime (the Trafficking Protocol)

- United Nations Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) on 23 December 1985
- United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children
- U.S State Department Trafficking in Persons Report over the past five years (2012-2017)
- Victims of Crime Bill 2016 <http://www.oireachtas.ie/documents/bills28/bills/2016/12116/b12116d.pdf>
- Ward, E. Prostitution and the Irish State: From Prohibitionism to a Globalised Sex Trade, Irish Political Studies Vol. 25, No. 1, 47–65, February 2010.
- Yonkova, N. and Keegan, E. Stop Traffick! Tackling demand for sexual services of trafficked women and girls (ICI, 2014).

Media references

- <http://www.independent.ie/irish-news/courts/men-caught-in-prostitution-sting-by-undercover-gardai-enter-guilty-pleas-26799519.html>
- <http://www.thejournal.ie/prostitution-investigation-2475654-Nov2015/>
- <http://www.thejournal.ie/sex-laws-ireland-in-force-3309170-Mar2017/>
- Irish Government News Service, 27 March 2017. http://www.merrionstreet.ie/en/News-Room/Releases/New_laws_on_Sexual_Offences_take_effect_from_Monday_-_Fitzgerald.html#sthash.TLpwckyB.dpuf
- RTE Investigates Sex for Sale (2016) available at: <https://www.rte.ie/news/investigations-unit/2015/1207/751789-sex-for-sale/>
- RTE Prime Time: Profiting from Prostitution (2012) available at: <https://www.rte.ie/news/player/2012/0207/3193909-prime-time-profiting-from-prostitution/>

Lithuania

- Administrative Violations Code of the Republic of Lithuania: Article 182-1
- Ataskaitos apie prekybos žmonėmis prevencijos ir kontrolės 2009-2012 metų programos įgyvendinimą 2010 metais duomenimis [Reports on 2010 data regarding the implementation of the prevention and control of human trafficking in 2009-2012]. Available online at: <http://www.vrm.lt/index.php?id=566>.
- Bazylevas & Staškovskaja, (2007).
- Čaplinskas & Mårdh, (2001).
- Code of Criminal Procedure
- Council of Europe Conventions:
 - Action against Trafficking in Human Beings
 - Protection of Children against Sexual Exploitation and Sexual Abuse
 - Mutual Assistance in Criminal Matters
 - Extradition
 - Transfer of Proceedings in Criminal Matters
- Dalia Puidokiene, 2012. *Covert Codes of Women in Prostitution: Pathways for Recovering Roots after Trauma Interface*. Academic dissertation. Faculty of Social Sciences at the University of Lapland, Rovaniemi, Finland.
- Immigrant Council Ireland et al., *Stop Traffic! Tackling Demand for Sexual Services of Trafficked Women and Girls* (Dublin, Ireland: ICI, 2014).
- Government program “On the Prevention of Organized Crime and Corruption” (“Dėl organizuoto nusikalstamumo ir korupcijos prevencijos” org. Lt.) one of the social prevention measures are foreseen in the prevention of prostitution and human trafficking
- Government Resolution No. 430 of 18 April 2012 (approving a procedure for granting a reflection period to foreign nationals who are victims of THB)
- GRETA Report concerning the implementation of the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings by Lithuania, Strasbourg, 19 December 2014.
- I. Sviklaitė. 2010. Socialinių reklamų jaunimui raiška Lietuvoje. Magistro baigiamasis darbas. VU.
- Implementation of the National Crime Prevention and Control Program for the years 2013-2015. Plan
- Inga Simonaviciute. 2014. *Prekyba žmonėmis internetinėje erdvėje: mąstai, verbavimo būdai, socialinio darbuotojo vaidmuo prevencijos procese (Trafficking in Human Beings in the Internet: Insights, Ways of Recruiting, Role of a Social Worker in the Prevention Process)*. Supervisor D. Puidokiene. Klaipeda University, Lithuania.
- International Labour Organisation (ILO) Conventions:
 - Forced or Compulsory Labour (No.29)
 - Abolition of Forced Labour (No.105)
 - Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour (No.182)
- Kristina Budginienė, 2017. *Socialinio darbuotojo galimybės mažinant išnaudojimą prostitucijos tikslais: prevencijos aspektas (The social worker's possibilities of reducing exploitation of people for prostitution purposes: an aspect of prevention.)*. Supervisor D. Puidokiene. Klaipeda University, Lithuania.
- Kristina Butkutė, 2009. *Ryšys tarp ŽIV plitimo ir moterų prostitucijos (The Link Between the HIV and Women's Prostitution)*. Supervisor I. Dirgeliene, D. Puidokiene. Klaipeda University, Lithuania.
- L. Garneliene, 2016.
- Law on Compensation for Damages Caused by Violent Crimes
- Law on Fundamentals of Protection of the Rights of the Child, Law on State-Guaranteed Legal Aid
- Law on Legal Protection of Personal Data Processed during Police and Judicial Co-operation in Criminal Cases
- Law on the Legal Status of Aliens
- Law on Protection against Domestic Violence
- Law on Protection of the Participants of Criminal Process and Criminal Intelligence, Officers of Justice and Law Enforcement Institutions against Criminal Influence
- Law on Social Services
- Law on Support for Employment
- Lina Mockutė-Kiaupienė, 2015. *Psichosocialinio smurto prevencijų prostitucijos situacijoje: nevyriausybinių organizacijų veiklos aspektai (Prevention of Psychosocial Violence in Prostitution: Aspects of Practise of Non – governmental Organizations)*. Supervisor D. Puidokiene. Klaipeda University, Lithuania.
- Lithuanian Criminal Code: Articles 147, 147-1, 147-2, 157
- Lithuanian Human Rights League (LHRL) & Ministry of the Interior of the Republic of Lithuania. 2007. *Situation of Trafficking in Human Beings in Lithuania*. Summary Report prepared by M. N. Stačiokienė, 2006. Programme for the Prevention and Control of Trafficking in Human Beings 2005-2008. Vilnius: Lithuanian Human Rights League, 48.
- Natalia Ollus, Anniina Jokinen and Matti Joutsen (eds.) 2013. *Exploitation of migrant workers in Finland, Sweden, Estonia and Lithuania: Uncovering the links between recruitment, irregular employment practices and labour trafficking*. European Institute for Crime Prevention and Control, affiliated with the United Nations (HEUNI).
- Order No. 1V-750 of 6 September 2013 of the Minister of the Interior on the implementation of Articles 19 and 20 of Directive 2011/36/EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 5 April 2011 on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting its victims.
- Order No. V-230 of 12 December 2012 of the Minister of Foreign Affairs approving the procedure for the use of funds under the Inter-institutional Action Plan for the Implementation of the National Crime Prevention and Control Programme 2013-2015.
- Petkevičiūtė. 2006. Visuomenę keisti padeda ir plakatai. <http://www.ve.lt/naujienos/lietuva/lietuvos-naujienos/visuomene-keisti-padedai-ir-plakatai-398801/>
- Pruskus, V. 2010. *Prostitucijos fenomenas. Gatvės prostitucija Lietuvoje: raiška, sklaida ir kontrolė [Prostitution phenomenon. Street prostitution in Lithuania: Expression, dissemination and control]*. Vilnius; Vilniaus pedagoginio universiteto leidykla, p.167.
- Renata Tutlytė, 2006. *Psichosocialinis moterų j(si) traukimo į prostituciją aspektas (Psychosocial Aspect of Women's Involvement in Prostitution)*. Supervisor D. Puidokiene. Klaipeda University, Lithuania.
- Ruškus, (2005).
- Sipavičienė, Tureikytė & Rogaitė, (2005).
- State Security Development for 2015–2025 Programme (replaced the Interinstitutional Action Plan 132 for the implementation of the National Crime Prevention and Control Program, which replaced previous national plans on THB)
- State Security Policy Department of the Ministry of the Interior yearly reports are available online (in Lithuanian) at: <http://www.vrm.lt/go.php/lit/Prekybos-zmonemis-prevencijos-ir-kontroles-programa/246/1>
- Tarptautinė Migracijos Organizacija/Vilnius Universitetas, (2005, 26).
- Toma Šalnytė, 2006. *Nevyriausybinių organizacijų patirtis teikiant socialinę pagalbą moterims nukentėjusioms nuo prekybos žmonėmis (Non-Governmental Organization's Experience in Providing Social Assistance to Women Victims of Trafficking in Human Beings)*. Supervisor D. Puidokiene. Klaipeda University, Lithuania.
- Trafficking profile in Lithuania (Trafficking in Persons report, US Department, 2016)
- United Nations Convention against Transnational Organised Crime (ratified in 2002)
 - Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children
 - Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea and Air.
- United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
- United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child
 - Optional Protocol on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography
- V. Vrublevskienė. 2009. Prostitucijos verslo aukų viktimologinė analizė. Magistro baigiamasis darbas. MRU.
- Viktorija Račkauskaitė, 2008. Įgalinimu grįstos socialinės pagalbos teikimo ypatumai prekybos žmonėmis aukoms (*Features of Empowerment-Based Social Assistance to Victims of Trafficking*). Supervisor Aurelija Žebrauskaitė, D. Puidokiene. Klaipeda College, Lithuania.

Campaigns

November 2009: Vilnius police officers, the Vilnius City Area Public Prosecutor's Office and NGO representatives for Vilnius Special children's care and foster home children organised an educational event – "do not become a victim of trafficking in human beings!" ("Netapk prekybos žmonėmis auka!" org. lt.).

Sweden

- Aliens Act (2005:716) (Chapter 5: Residence permits, section 15). Online at: http://www.government.se/contentassets/784b3d7be3a54a0185f284bbb2683055/aliensact-2005_716.pdf
See also: *Förstärkt straffrättsligt skydd mot människohandel* (prop. 2009/2010:152) (Chapter 6).
Online at: http://www.riksdagen.se/sv/Dokument-Lagar/Forslag/Propositioner-och-skrivelser/Forstarkt-straffrattsligt-skyd_GX03152/
- *Anti-violence Against Women Act. Kvinnofrid, Prop. 1997/98:55*
- *Årsredovisning 2016 – Migrationsverket* (Stockholm, Sweden: Migrationsverket, 2016) at 137. Online at: <https://www.migrationsverket.se/download/18.4100dc0b159d67dc6142a4e/1487775100129/Årsredovisning+2016.pdf>
- *Årsredovisning 2015 – Migrationsverket* (Stockholm, Sweden: Migrationsverket, 2015) at 26. Online at: <http://www.migrationsverket.se/download/18.2d998ffc151ac3871593f89/1456151216443/Årsredovisning+2015.pdf>
- *Årsredovisning 2014 – Migrationsverket* (Stockholm, Sweden: Migrationsverket, 2014) at 98. Online at: <http://www.migrationsverket.se/download/18.39a9cd9514a346077212ead/1424702424160/Årsredovisning+2014.pdf>
- *Årsredovisning 2013 – Migrationsverket* (Stockholm, Sweden: Migrationsverket, 2013) at 29. Online at: <http://www.migrationsverket.se/download/18.7c00d8e6143101d166d29f5/1414049602234/%25252525C3%2525252585rsredovisning+2013.pdf> [Swedish]

Conferences

- International conference, 25th March 2015: "Are you for the violence against a person? Where are you?" ("Ar tu už smurtą prieš žmogų? Kur tu esi?")
- Klaipėda Social and Psychological Services Centre conference held in Lithuanian Parliament in 19-20th June 2014: International STOP TRAFFICK! Conference "Deconstructing the Demand for Sexual Services: Prevention of Exploitation through Prostitution and Sex Trafficking".
- *Brottsbalk* (1962:700). Online at: http://www.lagboken.se/dokument/Lagar-ochforordningar/903/Brottsbalk-1962_700?pageid=64855&search=koppleri
- *Brottsoffermyndighetens årsredovisning 2013* (Umeå, Sverige: BROM, February 2014) at 10. Online at: <http://www.brottsoffermyndigheten.se/Filer/Böcker/BrOMs%20årsredovisning%202013.pdf>
- *Brottsoffermyndighetens årsredovisning 2014* (Umeå, Sverige: BROM, February 2015). Online at: <http://www.brottsoffermyndigheten.se/Filer/Böcker/BrOMs%20årsredovisning%202014.pdf>
- *Brottsoffermyndighetens årsredovisning 2015* (Umeå, Sverige: BROM, February 2016) at 9. Online at: http://www.brottsoffermyndigheten.se/Filer/Informationssidor/Arsredovisning_2015.pdf
- Chicago Alliance Against Sexual Exploitation, *Deconstructing the Demand for Prostitution: Preliminary Insights from Interviews with Men Who Purchase Sex* (Chicago, Illinois: CAASE, 2008). *Report of the Special Rapporteur on the human rights aspects of the victims of trafficking in persons, especially women and children, Dr. Sigma Huda* (E/CN.4/2006/62) (20 December 2006) at 11, para. 52.
- Commission of Inquiry into Trafficking in Human Beings. *Ett starkt straffrättsligt skydd mot människohandel och annat utnyttjande av utsatta personer* (SOU 2016:70). Online at: <http://www.regeringen.se/pressmeddelanden/2016/10/ett-starkt-straffrattsligt-skydd-motmanniskohandel-och-annat-utnyttjande-av-utsatta-personer/>

- Commission of Inquiry into Trafficking in Human Beings. *Tilläggsdirektiv till Utredningen om ett starkt straffrättsligt skydd vid människohandel och köp av sexuell handling av barn* (Ju 2014:22) Dir. 2015:6 (29 January 2015). Online at: <https://www.regeringen.se/sb/d/19837/a/253523>
See also: Pressrelease: *Lagföring i Sverige av sexköp utomlands ska utredas* (30 January 2015). Online at: <https://www.regeringen.se/sb/d/19725/a/253662>
- Convention for the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW): Sweden signed the CEDAW on 7 March 1980, and ratified it on 2 July 1980.
- Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings.
- Crime Victim Compensation and Support Authority (CVCSA).
- Directive (the purchase of a sexual service should remain criminalised): *Utvärdering av förbudet mot köp av sexuell tjänst*, Dir. 2008:44 (24 April 2008). Online at: <http://www.regeringen.se/contentassets/084e5a216d8c4c15a8a70d19d30b3fa6/utvardering-av-forbudet-mot-kop-av-sexuell-tjanst-dir.-200844>
- Eaves for Women, *Routes in, Routes out: Quantifying the Gendered Experience of Trafficking to the UK*. (London, United Kingdom: Eaves, 2008).
- European Commission, *Directive 2011/36/ EU of the European Parliament and of the Council of 5 April 2011 on preventing and combating trafficking in human beings and protecting its victims, and replacing Council Framework Decision 2002/629/JHA*, preamble (25), articles 16 (4) and 18.
- Ekberg, Gunilla S. *Nordic Baltic Campaign against Trafficking in Women – Final Report*. (Copenhagen, Denmark: Nordic Council of Ministers, 2004).
- Ekberg, Gunilla S., "The Swedish Law that Prohibits the Purchase of Sexual Services: Best Practices for Prevention of Prostitution and Trafficking in Human Beings" 10 (2004) *Violence Against Women* 1187 (Sage Publications).
- Ekberg, Gunilla S. and Wahlberg, Kajsa, "The Swedish Approach: A European Union Country Shows How to Effectively Fight Sex Trafficking" 2:2 (2011) *Solutions Journal*.
- Ekberg, Gunilla S. and Werkman, Karin. *A Snapshot Study on the Prevalence, Laws, Policies and Practices regarding Prostitution and Trafficking in Human*

Beings for the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation in Belgium. (Brussels, Belgium: SORBUS Research, 2016).

- EU Directive 2004/38/EC on the right of citizens of the European Union to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States, article 9.
- Eurostat, *Trafficking in Human Beings: Statistical Working Paper* (Luxemburg).
- Publications Office of the European Union, 2015).
- *Factsheet: Prostitution and trafficking in women* (Stockholm, Sweden: Ministry of Industry, Employment, and Communications, January 2004).
- *Förbud mot köp av sexuell tjänst. En utvärdering 1999-2008* (SOU 2010:49) (2 July 2010). Online at: <http://www.regeringen.se/sb/d/12634/a/149142>
See also: *Selected Extracts of the Swedish Government report SOU 2010:49 - The Ban against the Purchase of Sexual Services: An Evaluation 1999-2008* (Stockholm, Sweden: Swedish Institute, November 2010). Government decision (to appoint an anti-trafficking ambassador): *Protokoll vid regeringssammanträde "Inrättande av tjänsten som Sveriges ambassadör för arbetet mot människohandel"* (28 January 2016).
- Government Bill, *En skärpt sexualbrottslagstiftning*, Prop. 2012/13:111. Online at: <http://www.regeringen.se/sb/d/108/a/211292>
- Government Bill - *Skärpt straff för köp av sexuell tjänst*, Prop. 2010/11:77 (20 January 2011).
- Government Bill, *Kvinnofrid* (prop. 1997/98:55 - the Violence Against Women Act). Online at: <http://www.regeringen.se/contentassets/1733625e719c43b28f073fa9cdec90f2/kvinnofridprop.-19979855>
- 1 January 1999, the law that prohibits the purchase of sexual services came into force.
- Holm, Fanny, *Utbetalning av brottsskadeersättning till offer för människohandel: Redovisning av ett regeringsuppdrag* (Umeå, Sverige: BROM, 2010). Online at: <http://www.brottsoffermyndigheten.se/Filer/Böcker/Utbetalning%20av%20brottsskadeersättning%20till%20offer%20för%20människohandel.pdf>
- Holmström, Charlotta m.fl., *Prostitution i Norden: en forskningsrapport* (Köpenhamn, Danmark:

Nordiska ministerrådet, 2009). Online at: <http://norden.divaportal.org/smash/get/diva2:702704/FULLTEXT01.pdf>

• IF&HR, letter of 27 February 2017 which was circulated among the Partner organizations in the context of the Disrupt Demand project.

• Immigrant Council Ireland et al., *Stop Traffic! Tackling Demand for Sexual*

• *Services of Trafficked Women and Girls* (Dublin, Ireland: ICI, 2014).

• Jabbour, Ghada, et al., *Exploring the Demand for Prostitution: What Male Buyers Say about Their Motives, Practices, and Perceptions* (Beirut, Lebanon: Kafa Enough Violence and Exploitation, 2014).

• Kafa (Enough) Violence & Exploitation, *Exploring the Demand for Prostitution: What Male Buyers Say about Their Motives, Practices, and Perceptions* (Beirut, Lebanon: Kafa, 2014).

• *Könshandeln* (SOU 1995:15).

• Legislation against trafficking in human beings. *Ett utvidgat straffansvar för människohandel* (Prop. 2003/04:111).

• *Människohandel av barn: nationell kartläggning 2012-2015* (Stockholm: Länsstyrelsen, rapport 2015:30) (10 December 2015).

• Migration Authority (2017). "Asylsökande till Sverige under 2000-2016".

• Macleod, Jan et al., *Challenging Men's Demand for Prostitution in Scotland: A Research Report Based on Interviews with 110 Men who Bought Women in Prostitution* (Glasgow, Scotland: Women's Support Project, 2008).

• National Action Plan for Gender Equality (2002-2006). *Jämt och ständigt: Regeringens jämställdhetspolitik och handlingsplan för mandatperioden* (Skr.2002/03:140). Online at: <http://www.regeringen.se/sb/d/108/a/2069>

• *National Action Plan on Prostitution and Trafficking in Human Beings – Evaluation. Prostitution och människohandel: Slutredovisning av regeringens handlingsplan* (2011:18). (Stockholm, Sverige: Brottsförebyggande rådet, 2011). Online at: <http://www.bra.se/bra/publikationer/arkiv/publikationer/2011-11-30-prostitution-ochmanniskohandel-for-sexuella-andamal.html>

• *National Action Plan on Prostitution and Trafficking in Human Beings for Sexual Purposes. Government communication, Handlingsplan mot prostitution och handel med människor för sexuella ändamål* (Skr. 2007/08:167). Online at: <http://www.regeringen.se/49b70e/contentassets/149560f55fcd4c0c9a77e86da272be4d/handlingsplan-mot-prostitution-och-manniskohandel-for-sexuella-andamal-skr-200708167>

• *National Action Plan on Trafficking in Children. Regeringens skrivelse 2013/14:91: Åtgärder för att stärka barns rättigheter och uppväxtvillkor i Sverige* (20 February 2014) at 95. Online at: <http://www.regeringen.se/rattsdokument/skrivelse/2014/02/skr-20131491-/>

• National Board of Health and Welfare (on the situation of unaccompanied girls). *Analys av situationen i socialtjänsten våren 2017: Fokus på ensamkommande flickor, yngre barn, nätverksplaceringar samt suicidrisk – delrapport 3* (Stockholm, Sweden: Socialstyrelsen, 2017).

• National Institute for Population Health, *Sex in Sweden: On the Swedish Sexual Life* (NIPH, 2000). Online at: <https://www.folkhalsomyndigheten.se/publiceratmaterial/publikationsarkiv/s/Sex-in-Sweden---on-the-Swedish-sexual-life/>

• National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings, *Lägesrapport 18 - Människohandel för sexuella och andra ändamål* (Stockholm, Sweden 2017). *Forthcoming*.

• National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings, *Lägesrapport 19* (Stockholm, Sweden, 2017)

• National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings. Sixteenth annual report (for year 2014): *Människohandel för sexuella ooh andra ändamål: Lägesrapport 16* (Stockholm, Sweden: Polismyndighetens rapport 2015). Online at: <https://polisen.se/Aktuellt/Rapporter-och-publikationer/Rapporter/Publicerat--Nationellt/Dokument/Manniskohandel-for-sexuella-och-andra-andamal2/>

• National Rapporteur on Trafficking in Human Beings. Wahlberg, Kajsa, *Slutredovisning av regeringens uppdrag till Rikspolisstyrelsen att förstärka insatserna mot prostitution och människohandel för sexuella ändamål 2008-2010* (Stockholm, Sweden: Rikspolisstyrelsen, 2011).

• National Rapporteur Against Trafficking in Human Beings, *Lägesrapport 7 - Människohandel för sexuella ändamål* (Stockholm, Sweden 2005).

• *National strategy against men's violence against women (2017-2026)*. Government Communication: *Makt, mål, och myndighet: feministisk politik för en jämställd framtid* (Skr. 2016/17:10).

• Nordic Council of Ministers, *Project Against Trafficking in Women and Girls in the Barents Region: Final Report* (Copenhagen, Denmark: Nordic Council of Ministers, 2006).

• Prosecutor General 2011 report. *Slutredovisning av regeringsuppdraget till Åklagarmyndigheten att förstärka insatserna mot prostitution och människohandel för sexuella ändamål* (Ju2008/7403/PO). Online at: <http://www.aklagare.se/PageFiles/4616/ÅM%20att%20förstärka%20insatserna%20mot%20prostitution%20och%20människohandel%20för%20sexuella%20ändamål.pdf>

• *Prostitutionen i Sverige 2014: En omfattningskartläggning* (Stockholm, Sweden: Länsstyrelsen i Stockholms lan Rapport 2015:10). Online at: <http://www.lansstyrelsen.se/stockholm/SiteCollectionDocuments/Sv/publikationer/2015/prostitution-kartlaggning-2014.pdf>

• *Prostitutionen i Sverige. Bakgrund och åtgärder* (SOU 1981:71).

• *Regeringsbeslut, Uppdrag att genomföra en nationell kartläggning av barn som utsatts för eller misstänks att ha utsatts för människohandel eller människohandelsliknande brott* (S2015/04481/FST) (17 juni 2015).

• Rikspolisstyrelsen, *Polisens förmåga att utreda ärenden om människohandel-Inspektion av polismyndigheternas förmåga att utreda ärenden om människohandel för sexuella ändamål och köpav sexuell tjänst* (Tillsynsrapport 2013:7). Online at: https://polisen.se/Global/www%20och%20Intrapolis/Rapporterutredningar/01%20Polisen%20nationellt/Ovriga%20rapporter-utredningar/Inspektionertillsyns%20rapporter/2013/Tillsynsrapport_7_Manniskohandel_13.pdf

• *Sexuella övergrepp. Förslag till ny lydelse av brottsbalkens bestämmelser om sedlighetsbrott* (SOU 1976:9).

• Social Democrat/Green Party Government coalition: Statement of Government Policies. *Regeringsförklaringen* (3 oktober 2014). Online at: <http://www.regeringen.se/contentassets/436960c05f524109b8a020b879efd76b/regeringsforklaringen-3-oktober-2014>

• Socialdepartementet, *Uppdrag att utreda och föreslå en modell för att samla kunskap om prostitutionen över tid* [” (S2015/06285/JÄM) (1 October 2015). Online at: <http://www.regeringen.se/regeringsuppdrag/2015/10/uppdrag-att-utreda-och-foresla-enmodell-for-att-samla-kunskap-om-prostitutionen-over-tid/>

• Social Services Act (SFS 2001:453), chapter 7, article 11. Online at: http://www.riksdagen.se/sv/Dokument-Lagar/Lagar/Svenskforfattningssamling/Socialtjanstlag-2001453_sfs-2001-453/#K2

• Svedin, Carl-Göran et al., *Delrapport 1: Sälja och köpa sex i Sverige 2011. Förekomst, hälsa och attityder* (Stockholm, Sweden: Socialstyrelsen, 2012).

• Svedin, Carl-Göran et al., *Prostitution i Sverige. Huvudrapport: Kartläggning och utvärdering av prostitutionsgruppernas insatser samt erfarenheter och attityder i befolkningen* (Stockholm, Sweden: Socialstyrelsen, 2012). Online at: <http://www.divaportal.org/smash/get/diva2:506410/FULLTEXT01.pdf>

• *Swedish Foreign Service Action Plan for a feminist foreign policy (2015-2018)*. Online at: <http://www.government.se/4990fa/contentassets/bca76b4547ad46fb929ece47e7cfe26d/swedish-foreign-service-action-plan-for-feminist-foreign-policy-2015-2018-including-focus-areasfor-2017.pdf>

• *Statement of Foreign Policy to the Riksdag 15 February 2017*. Online at: <http://www.government.se/statements/2017/03/statement-of-government-policy-in-the-parliamentary-debate-on-foreign-affairs-2017/>

• Swedish Institute, *Selected Extracts of the Swedish Government report SOU 2010:49 – The Ban against the Purchase of Sexual Services: An Evaluation 1999-2008* (Stockholm, Sweden: Swedish Institute, November 2010) at 9. Online at: https://ec.europa.eu/anti-trafficking/sites/antitrafficking/files/the_ban_against_the_purchase_of_sexual_services_an_evaluation_1999-2008_1.pdf

• Swedish Penal Code, chapter 2, section 3(2).

• Swedish Penal Code, Chapter 4: About Crimes against Liberty and Peace, section 1(A), and *Lag om ändring i brottsbalken* (SFS 2010:371). Online at: <https://beta.lagrummet.se/rinfo/publ/sfs/2010:371>

• *Swedish Penal Code*, Chapter 6: On Sexual Crimes, section 12.

- *Swedish Penal Code*, Chapter 6: On Sexual Crimes, section 11.
- The Hague Ministerial Declaration on European Guidelines for Effective Measures to Prevent and Combat Trafficking in Women for the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation (The Hague, Netherlands, 24-26 April 1997). Online at: <http://www.legislationline.org/en/documents/action/popup/id/8747>
- Together Against Crime: A National Crime Prevention Program (2017). Government communication, *Tillsammans mot brott: Ett nationellt brottsförebyggande program*, (Skr. 2016/2017) at 12. Online at: <http://www.regeringen.se/49550c/contentassets/d0b212f61d0d49828e5e257f47e892ad/tillsammans-mot-brott---ett-nationellt-brottsforebyggande-program-skr.-201617126>
- United Nations Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women (1993).
- UNODC, *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons* (Vienna: UNODC, 2016).
- *United Nations Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime* (“The Palermo Protocol”).
- University of Uppsala course on trafficking in human beings for police: *Människohandel: Kurs för poliser*, online at: <http://www.uu.se/utbildning/utbildningar/selma/kursplan/?kpid=30029>
- Unizon, *Pornography and prostitution, a report on exploitation and demand* (Stockholm: Unizon, 2016).

Campaigns

- Campaign aimed at students: *Lilja 4-ever* (Memfis Film AB) (2002). Online at: <http://sfi.se/en-GB/svenskfilmdatabas/Item/?type=MOVIE&itemId=50446>
A manual was distributed for use alongside the film: Lundqvist, D., and Viklund K., *Lilja 4-ever på skolbio: Dokumentation av Svenska Filminstitutets insatser kring Lilja 4-ever på skolbio i Sverige 2003–2004* (Stockholm: Svenska Filminstitutet, 2005).
- *Changing attitudes towards the purchase of a sexual service*: Country Administration of Värmland, *Somliga tror* (2015). Online at: <http://www.lansstyrelsen.se/Varmland/Sv/manniska-och-samhalle/jamstallldhet/prostitutionmanniskohandel/Pages/somliga-tror.aspx>
- Corporate ethical guidelines against the purchase of a sexual service: The *Rätt riktning* website, online at: <http://www.rattriktning.se/home> [Swedish, English and French]
- Elimination of demand – *Prohibition against the purchase of a sexual service in other countries*: *Sexköpslagen 2.0* website. Online at: <https://www.facebook.com/Sexkopslagen2.0/?fref=ts> [Swedish]
- Fair Sex: RealStars website, online at: <http://realstars.eu/about/>
- Going in the right direction: *Rätt riktning*, online at: <http://sverigeskvinnolobby.se/blog/projekt/ratt-riktning-for-etiskariktlinjer-mot-sexkop>
- Pornography-free hotels: The *Porrfria Hotell* website, online at: <http://porrfritt.se>
- “Travel Courage – Report your suspicions about commercial sexual exploitation of children”: World Childhood Foundation, online at: <https://childhood.se> and The *Resekurage* campaign website, online at: <http://www.resekurage.se>
- “You Decide! – Take a stand against the purchase of a sexual service”: 124 The campaign website - “Du avgör” *Ta ställning mot sexköp!*. Online at: <http://nmtsverige.se/duavgor#ta-stallning>
See also: The campaign video clip, “Du avgör!”. Online at: <http://nmtsverige.se/sites/default/files/Lansstyrelsen%20-%20Du%20Avgor%20-%20Kort%20Version-HD.mp4>

immigrantcouncil.ie



Immigrant
Council of
Ireland

2 St Andrew Street, Dublin 2, Ireland
Information Service (01) 674 0200
Administration (01) 674 0202

 /ImmigrantCouncil
 @immigrationIRL